

313
67

THE STORY OF SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

BY

ARTHUR L. STEVENSON, M. A., B. D.

*A Member of the Virginia Conference
of the
Methodist Episcopal Church, South*

AND

*Field Secretary of
Children's Home Society of Virginia*

Published by
ARTHUR L. STEVENSON
SALEM, VA.

Printed by
THE STONE PRINTING AND MANUFACTURING CO.
ROANOKE, VA.

COPYRIGHT, 1931
ARTHUR L. STEVENSON

Theology Library
SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY
AT CLAREMONT
California



TO MY MOTHER

WHO, IN EARLY CHILDHOOD, TAUGHT ME
THAT MY LIFE SHOULD BE SPENT IN
SOME FIELD OF CHRISTIAN SERVICE AND
WHOSE INSTRUCTION ALONG THIS AND
OTHER LINES LAID THE FOUNDATIONS
THAT EVENTUALLY RESULTED IN THE
PRODUCTION OF THIS VOLUME, THIS BOOK
IS AFFECTIONATELY DEDICATED.

C O N T E N T S

	PAGES
PREFACE.....	v-vi

BOOK I. SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY IN GENERAL

CHAPTER I.	The Baptists.....	1- 15
CHAPTER II.	The Presbyterians.....	16- 22
CHAPTER III.	The Methodists.....	23- 33
CHAPTER IV.	The Present Methodist Hymnal.....	34- 44
CHAPTER V.	The Controversy Over the Present Methodist Hymnal.....	45- 59
CHAPTER VI.	Miscellaneous.....	60- 64

BOOK II. THE GOSPEL HYMN

CHAPTER VII.	Circulation of the Gospel Hymn.....	67- 72
CHAPTER VIII.	Singing Schools.....	73- 80
CHAPTER IX.	Is the Gospel Hymn Commercialized?.....	81- 83
CHAPTER X.	A Scathing Attack Upon the Gospel Hymn....	84- 90
CHAPTER XI.	A Psychological Explanation of the Power of the Gospel Hymn.....	91- 97

BOOK III. IN THE SOUTHERN SUNDAY SCHOOLS

CHAPTER XII.	Early Sunday School Hymns.....	101-112
CHAPTER XIII.	The Modern Sunday School.....	113-131

BOOK IV. RESULTS OF SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

CHAPTER XIV.	Upon the Individual, Family and Congregation..	135-144
CHAPTER XV.	A Disruptive Force.....	145-157
CHAPTER XVI.	A Unifying Force.....	158-164

BOOK V. PRESENT TRENDS

CHAPTER XVII.	Present Trends.....	167-180
CHAPTER XVIII.	Present Trends (Continued)—In Public Schools.	181-187

P R E F A C E

These pages attempt to give the story of Southern Hymnology from its beginning to the present. In doing so, as much original material as possible has been found and used, but for the sake of thoroughness there has been no hesitancy to use information already given by competent authorities, such as: L. F. Benson's *THE ENGLISH HYMN; Its Development and Use*, C. F. Price's *HYMNODY OF THE METHODIST HYMNAL* and Burrage's *BAPTIST DICTIONARY*. Acknowledgment of indebtedness to these and other sources is hereby made.

The unity of this treatise is a geographical one, and matter not pertaining in any way to hymns, hymn books, authors of hymns or tune writers of the Southern states has been excluded. Otherwise, the subject of this volume would have no significance.

No attempt has been made to present Southern Hymnology from the standpoint of music other than to divide music into two classes: (1) dignified, such as the old church hymns have; and (2) rapid and jazzy, such as the modern revival and gospel hymns have.

Effort has been put forth to secure accuracy in all statements. If any errors are made, I am ready to acknowledge them and to correct them in what may appear to be the best way. In this connection, however, it should be remembered that material of this kind cannot be secured all at once and that, therefore, some conditions described may have changed before this work appears in print. Two and a half years were required for gathering this material. Many matters, if a vital change seemed likely to have occurred, have been investigated a second time. Even though a change may have come about in any particular within the last two years and it has not come to my attention, my description of the situation as it existed two years ago serves a purpose as history.

I wish to acknowledge special gratitude to the following for their valuable services: to Dr. Howard W. Odum,

Head of the Department of Sociology and Director of the Institute for Research in Social Science at the University of North Carolina, for suggesting this subject and lines to pursue for gathering the information, for aid in revising the original outline and for procuring supplementary funds to aid in defraying the expenses incident to the traveling involved in gathering the material; to Dr. Garnett Ryland, Professor of Chemistry in the University of Richmond and Librarian of the Virginia Baptist Historical Collection at the University of Richmond, for aid in getting much of the information for Chapter I; to Mr. R. E. Magill, Executive Secretary of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, Richmond, for assistance in securing information concerning that denomination and for the privilege of using copyrighted material of his committee; to my wife, Mrs. Mary Blanche Stevenson, for reading and correcting the manuscript; to the following publishers for use of copyrighted material: Doubleday, Doran & Company, Charles Scribner's Sons, Houghton Mifflin Company, Henry Holt and Company; and to all others who have in any way been of any assistance in getting out this book.

It is my earnest desire that this may be of value in improving Southern Hymnology.

August 26, 1930.

ARTHUR L. STEVENSON,
Salem, Virginia.

BOOK I

**SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY
IN GENERAL**

CHAPTER I

THE BAPTISTS

The authors of hymns and hymnals of the Baptists of the South will be listed and discussed, as well as a number of incidents connected with the authors and hymns. The main sources of information are: *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE*, by L. E. Benson; *THE BAPTIST DICTIONARY*, by Burrage; and the large collection of old Baptist hymnals in the Library of the Virginia Baptist Historical Association at the University of Richmond, Richmond, Virginia.

This collection is very large. The earliest Baptist hymn book found there is: *HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, Collected from the Works of Several Authors; In Three Books; I On Baptism, II On the Lord's Supper, III On Various Occasions*. It was printed at Williamsburg, Virginia, sold by William Reid, and dated 1773.

The next oldest hymnal at Richmond is *HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, Selected from Several Approved Authors by Eleazer Clay; Recommended by the Baptist General Committee of Virginia to Be of Public Utility to the Community at Large and to the Church of Christ in Particular*. This book was printed by John Dixon at Richmond in 1793. Its author lived in Chesterfield County, Virginia (1744-1836), and was said to be worth \$100,000. He was the wealthiest Baptist minister in the United States in his day and a man of fine character and great usefulness. A first cousin of his was Rev. John Clay, also a Baptist minister, and father of Henry Clay. Rev. John Clay was a soldier in the French and Indian Wars and in the Revolutionary War.

Another old hymnal in this library is entitled, *COLLECTION OF SACRED BALLADS*, and the authors are Andrew Broadus and Richard Broadus. The title page is missing, but the preface is dated January 1, 1790, Caroline County, Virginia. This is the famous Andrew Broadus of the early Baptist period of Virginia. He was an influential person in the early Hymnology of this denomination.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

ANDREW BROADUS was born in Caroline County, Virginia, in 1770. In 1791 he was ordained a Baptist minister, just one year after bringing out the hymnal just mentioned, which was produced in his twentieth year. His first pastorate included a number of churches between Richmond and Frederickburg, Virginia. The fame of young Broadus as a preacher rapidly spread beyond his native state, and in 1811 he received an invitation to the pastorate of the First Baptist Church in Baltimore and also to the New Market Square Baptist Church in Philadelphia, and in 1832 from the First Baptist Church of New York. However, a constitutional timidity caused him not to accept a large pastorate, except in 1821 when he accepted the call to become assistant to Rev. John Courtney, pastor of the First Baptist Church of Richmond. After six months of an acceptable ministry there, he resigned and returned to his country congregation in Caroline County, where he remained until his death. This same church, Sparta, has been served for a century by Dr. Broadus, his son and his grandson.

Dr. Broadus wrote much for the religious press, and being especially interested in Hymnology, was the most powerful figure in this realm in his denomination during his life. Not only did he bring out a number of hymnals, which will be mentioned in their proper place, but a search of the early hymnals in the library at Richmond reveals that a large percentage of their hymns is from his pen.

In 1805 there was published at Richmond by John Courtney HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS. The following extract from the preface sheds light on the denominationalism of the day. "The opinion of another Christian Church is somewhat singular with regard to singing. The Conference, or Rules, of the Episcopal Methodist Church in these United States have entreated their members to purchase no hymn books but such as are signed with the names of their bishops; and by a form of discipline, it is also enjoined on them to sing no hymns or spiritual songs of their own composition. Hence, it appears necessary that this little book should be dedicated primarily to the Baptist Church."

LEWIS SKIDMORE brought out at Baltimore in 1825 THE CHOICE SELECTION OF THE LATEST SOCIAL AND CAMP

THE BAPTISTS

MEETING HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, *Chiefly Gathered from the Various Publications Now In Use and Intended As a Social Companion for the Pious.*

In 1828, at the request of the Dover Association (in Virginia), Dr. Andrew Broadus published THE DOVER SELECTION OF SPIRITUAL SONGS. One hymn in it is marked "Original." It begins, "Help Thy Servant, Gracious Lord." This volume was printed in Richmond.

In 1836 there came out in Richmond THE VIRGINIA SELECTION OF SONGS, HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS; *Selected and Arranged by Andrew Broadus.* Dr. Broadus wrote three of its hymns: the one mentioned above as appearing in the DOVER SELECTION; "Send Thy Blessing, Lord, We Pray;" and "The Wandering Sinner."

In 1840 there appeared THE VIRGINIA SELECTION OF PSALMS, HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, *New Edition, Enlarged and Improved, by Andrew Broadus.*

The Virginia Baptist Historical Collection at Richmond has a manuscript collection of hymns without the name of author or date of composition. It has 119 selections. Dr. Garnett Ryland, Librarian of the Virginia Baptist Historical Collection and Professor of Chemistry of the University of Richmond, a man well versed in Baptist History, is of the opinion that Dr. Broadus is also the author of these hymns.

Such are the hymns and hymnals of Andrew Broadus, the outstanding figure of the early Baptist Hymnology in Virginia.

Another Baptist author of hymns was GEORGE C. SEDGWICK, who was born in Calvert County, Maryland, and reared in the Church of England, but early became a Baptist. In 1815 he published A SELECTION OF HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, which the preface states was a supplement to those hymns then in use. The volume was printed at Fredericksburg, Virginia, by Green and Cad. At that time Mr. Sedgwick was pastor in Stafford County, Virginia. In the preface he states the following as his reasons for bringing out this book: "I have observed that the dear people of God, after having obtained a large selection, would themselves select and commit to paper those in common use among them, and bring them

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

to the house of worship where they would sometimes be sung, and there perhaps another would ask for a ballad, whose request would be cheerfully granted. But after a few copies were issued, the original would be so corrupted (either in doctrine or in language) that it would grate on the ear of the learned, and distress the hearts of many of the people of God to hear it sung. And perhaps soon after, the zealous brother would be saluted with a whisper to know where he got his Methodist song (instead of asking him to sing another, which might not be a Methodist one). Thus many who can sing have been discouraged, because their songs were corrupted, and they knew not where to renew them; and many songs have been disused, because they were judged by some to be unsound. To remedy this evil, I have made the following selection, hoping that after its reception among my brethren, I shall be delighted when I get to meeting to find the brethren in the congregation in the house of God united in praising the Lord of Hosts, and winning their hearts over to His divine service. . . .

"As this book is a supplement to those in use among us, I have selected a few hymns from each of them, as well as from authors more remote. Though I do not claim poetic talents, yet on different occasions I have thrown my thoughts into verse and I present them to my brethren and friends, distinguished in this book by the letters G. C. S."

This book contains one hymn by Dr. Broadus; and four have G. C. S. after them, indicating that Mr. Sedgwick was their author. All of the four are very ordinary.

Another Virginia Baptist preacher who contributed to the Hymnology of this period was JOHN LELAND who, though born in Massachusetts in 1754, came to Virginia in 1775, and subsequently preached in various parts of the State. He was quite a powerful evangelist. He wrote many hymns of which Burrage says the best is:

"The day is past and gone;
The evening shades appear;
Oh, may I ever keep in mind,
The night of death draws near!"

In the Century Magazine of September, 1885, reference is made to this hymn. An incident recorded in a lady's diary

THE BAPTISTS

kept during the siege of Vicksburg (June 5, 1863) is described. The house in which she lived was struck by a shell. The dense smoke caused the candles to be useless, and for some minutes the occupants could not see, after which information came that a side of the house was out. Soldiers rushed in and stated that the shell was an eighty pound parrott. The shell coming in through the front had burst on the pallet bed and torn it to tatters, and had also smashed the toilet service, as well as everything else in the room. The soldiers aided in boarding up the side to keep out prowlers, and the family retired as usual in the cellar. During the night a couple of shells fell in the yard and practically ploughed it. The house was large and prominent from the river, and the lady thought it was perhaps being taken for Confederate Headquarters and, therefore, especially selected to be shelled. Quite naturally, under these circumstances, upon going down to the cellar to retire she thought of a hymn taught her by her grandfather, which was Leland's hymn, the first verse of which was just quoted. Again and again during this troublesome period of the war this hymn brought her comfort at night as she was retiring.

In 1788 Mr. Leland was holding a revival meeting at John Lea's in Louisa, Virginia, when something unusual seemed to come down upon the people. The next day when a Mr. Bowles was preaching, Leland wrote a hymn having at first three stanzas to which a fourth was later added. This hymn became quite a favorite with the religious leaders of the day.

Another early writer of Southern Baptist hymns was RICHARD FURMAN, who was born in 1755 and who died in 1825. Though born in New York, he early moved to South Carolina and settled at the High Hills of Santee, where he interested himself very much in the cause of the colonies in the Revolutionary War. This caused him to have to leave South Carolina. Therefore, he went to North Carolina and Virginia. There Patrick Henry became one of his friends and attended his services. However, as soon as safety permitted, he returned to South Carolina, staying a little while at High Hills. In 1787 Mr. Furman was called to the pastorate of the First Baptist Church of Charleston where he remained for years. In 1814 the first Baptist General Convention in the

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

United States was held in Philadelphia, and Mr. Furman presided over it. He was also for a few years President of the South Carolina Baptist Convention. His interest in civic life was again manifested by service as a member of the Convention that framed the Constitution of South Carolina. He wrote several hymns. Andrew Broadus put one of them in his *VIRGINIA SELECTIONS*, and from there it was later transferred to the *Baptist Psalmody* (1850). The first verse of this is:

"Sovereign of all the worlds above,
Thy glory with unclouded rays,
Shines through the realms of light and love,
Inspiring angels with Thy praise."

JESSE MERCER was born in Halifax County, North Carolina, in 1769, but at the age of sixteen moved to Georgia, where he spent the remainder of his life. Here he served important pastorates, became editor of a religious paper, took great interest in missionary work, and was for eighteen successive years President of the Georgia Baptist Convention. Mr. Mercer did not use his means selfishly, but gave over \$40,000 to Mercer University. In addition, he wrote considerably and edited *THE CLUSTER OF SPIRITUAL SONGS, DIVINE HYMNS AND SOCIAL POEMS*, which, though first published in Augusta in pamphlet form, proved to be so popular that his denomination by 1817 had called for three editions. This book was widely used for many years in the Baptist churches of that section. Mr. Mercer wrote several of its hymns.

ROBERT T. DANIEL was born in Middlesex County, Virginia, in 1775, from which his parents later went to Chatham County, North Carolina. In 1802 Daniel joined the Holly Springs Baptist Church of Wake County, and in this church he was ordained the next year. He spent a number of years in home missionary work, because many sections near there were without religious privileges; and he was one of the first missionaries of the North Carolina Baptist Benevolent Society. In that capacity he made a visit to Raleigh in 1812 and organized the first Baptist church, of which he was twice pastor. However, he did not confine his activities to North Carolina, but extended them into Virginia, Tennessee

THE BAPTISTS

and Mississippi. Mr. Daniel wrote the Baptismal Hymn, "Lord, in Humble Sweet Submissiveness," which was first published in THE DOVER SELECTIONS, but was also included in WINCHELL'S WATTS production (with the last two stanzas omitted), and in the SERVICE OF SONG, 1871 (the fifth stanza omitted). DORSEY'S CHOICE also has two hymns by Daniel.

JOSEPH B. COOK was born in 1775 near Charleston, South Carolina, and joined the Welsh Neck Baptist Church in 1793. The next year he entered Brown University, graduating in four years. In 1799 Cook became pastor of Eutaw Baptist Church, of which his father was once pastor. He held a number of pastorates in South Carolina, and was also Vice President and Secretary of the South Carolina Baptist Convention. DORSEY'S CHOICE has ten hymns by Mr. Cook, the first lines of which are:

Bought with the Saviour's precious blood.
With reverence we would now appear.
Repent, repent the Baptist cries.
Jesus, we own Thy sovereign sway.
Filled with distress, the fruit of sin.
Hail, joyful morn, which ushered in.
Thou sacred Spirit, Heavenly Dove.
Up to Thy throne, O God of Love.
O help Thy servant, Lord.
Thy year has passed away.

ABRAM M. POINDEXTER, the son of a Baptist preacher, was born in Bertie County, North Carolina, in 1809. Licensed to preach in 1832, he studied a few months while with Rev. A. W. Clopton in Charlotte County Virginia, leaving in February 1833 to enter Columbian College, Washington, D. C. Ill health, however, forced the giving up of college work and the return to North Carolina, where he remained only a short time, leaving to become pastor of the Clarksville Church in Mecklenburg County, Virginia. After serving as Agent of Columbia College, Corresponding Secretary of the Southern Baptist Publication Society, Agent of Richmond College and Secretary of the Baptist Foreign Mission Board, Mr. Poindexter was pastor of the Baptist Church at Louisa, Virginia. He published several sermons, contributed many articles to the Religious Herald and wrote seven hymns, which are in the BAPTIST PSALMODY

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

edited by Basil Manly and Basil Manly, Jr. He also helped in the final revision of this book.

Born in 1790 in Warren County, Virginia, WILLIAM C. BUCK became in 1812 Baptist pastor in that county, leaving in 1820 to go to Union County, Kentucky, where he engaged in missionary work until 1836 when he became pastor of the First Baptist Church of Louisville. He also served as editor of the *BAPTIST BANNER* and the *WESTERN PIONEER*. Four years were devoted to the secretaryship of the Bible Board of the Southern Baptist Convention, and twelve years as pastor in Columbus, Mississippi, and Greensboro, Alabama. Other responsible positions were held in Mississippi and Texas. He died in Waco in 1872. Mr. Buck wrote two books, *THE PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION* and *THE SCIENCE OF LIFE*; and in 1842, in order to give to the Baptists of the South a better hymn book, he published the *BAPTIST HYMN BOOK*, which had 1,089 hymns, five of which he wrote. Benson states that¹ it was very popular and was used by many congregations in the Central, Southern and Western states. 10,000 copies were sold in two years. And the revised edition of 1844 was in print for many years. However, Benson adds that it was of little value in furthering the best interests of Baptist Hymnody.

In 1831 JOHN PURIFY produced *A SELECTION OF HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS*. Mr. Purify was a North Carolinian, and for some time was pastor of the Cross Roads Meeting House (Baptist) in Wake County, North Carolina. He was great, great grandfather of Dr. Hubert Poteat, who is professor of Latin in Wake Forest College, Wake Forest, North Carolina, and a son of Dr. William L. Poteat who was for years president of that institution, and is one of the outstanding religious and educational leaders of the South. Dr. Hubert Poteat is a student of hymnology of some note, as later references to him show.

J. M. D. COATES was born in Orange County, North Carolina, in 1815, but at the age of nineteen went to Tennessee and lived for a time at Maryville and McMinnville. At the latter place he joined the church and married. Soon he

1. *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE*, Page 36.

THE BAPTISTS

and his wife went to Alabama and Mississippi and taught school until her death in 1841, when he returned to McMinnville and was licensed to preach. In 1847 he became pastor of the Baptist Church at Marion and remained there the rest of his life. Mr. Coates wrote much for the religious press, and from 1874 to 1881 was editor and publisher of the *BAPTIST MESSENGER*. He also published several books, and compiled three hymn books: *THE COMPANION*, 1846; *THE BAPTIST COMPANION*, 1855; and *THE SACRED HARP*, 1867. He was author of twelve hymns that appeared in *THE SACRED HARP*.

EDWIN T. WINKLER, 1823-1883, was born in Savannah, Georgia. He served in the pastorate at Columbus, Georgia, Gillisonville, South Carolina, and Charleston, South Carolina, and Marion, Alabama, where he died. His editorial work was done as assistant editor of *THE CHRISTIAN INDEX* and as editor of *THE SOUTHERN BAPTIST*. Mr. Winkler was chaplain in the Civil War. He was also corresponding secretary of the Southern Baptist Publication Society and in 1855 at its request compiled *THE SACRED LUTE, A COLLECTION OF POPULAR HYMNS*, in which he tried to put the best spiritual songs used by the Baptists. He wrote seven of its hymns. In 1860 a new and enlarged edition was issued, but it had so many changes that it was practically a new book. Dr. Winkler wrote eight hymns of this edition.

RICHARD S. JAMES, though born in 1824, in Philadelphia, spent much of his life in the South, serving as President of Judson University and Buckner College in Arkansas, and for thirty-five years as missionary of the Southern Baptists to the Indians. He wrote several hymns. One Beginning,

How sadly flow the waters
From China's clouded hills,

was written in his senior year at Columbian College for the farewell services at the departure of Rev. J. L. Shuch, Rev. T. W. Tobey and Dr. James' oldest brother, Dr. J. Sexton James, as missionaries to China. Another hymn,

Hark, what melodious sounds are they!

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

was written on receiving news of the death of his brother and wife in the China seas, as grief was lightened by the thought that they were happy in their eternal home.

WILLIAM DORSEY, 1780-1853, was born in Halifax County, Virginia, but soon moved to North Carolina where he married. After serving for a while as pastor there, he went to South Carolina and served for twenty years as pastor of the Welsh Neck Church, leaving there to become pastor at Cheraw, but subsequently going to Alabama and settling on a plantation, where, however, he took time to preach to a few churches in Marengo County. Here he remained until his death. Mr. Dorsey compiled *DORSEY'S CHOICE*, 1820, which had a wide circulation in some Southern states. He wrote more than 100 of its hymns, some of which were transferred to other books.

Little is known of the life of STANTON S. BURDETTE, other than that he was pastor of New Hope Church, near Lancaster, South Carolina, for five or six years, after which he went to Mississippi; and that also he published in 1834 *THE BAPTIST HARMONY, Being A Selection of Choice Hymns and Spiritual Songs For Social Worship*. Burdette wrote three of its hymns.

In the University of North Carolina Library there is a little book called *NORTH CAROLINA SONNETS, OR A SELECTION OF CHOICE HYMNS For the Use of the Old School Baptists. Compiled By the Recommendation of the Kehukee Association By James Osborne of Baltimore*. It was printed in 1844. The preface states that the Association signified that the book should contain from 500 to 600 hymns and should sell at $\$62\frac{1}{2}$. The preface also states: "In regard to the execution of the work, so far as the printing and binding are concerned, it is questionable whether there is a hymn book now at the South or West, of the same number of hymns and songs and at the same price as this, that excels in point of quality and neatness." Its binding is leather. The paper is good and the book is now in first-class condition. In addition, the preface states: "There is one thing which must not in this preface be omitted and that is; it is a most desirable thing, that in public singing the silly practice which has so long prevailed among the Bap-

THE BAPTISTS

tists of the South of giving out but one line at a time be forever laid aside, since it so greatly interrupts the singing. And this wrong could and would be removed from the Old School Baptists, were the ministers to confine themselves to one hymn book only, and also inform their congregations of the same; and at the same time inform them that more than one line will be given out; and when those persons who are interested in singing in the house of God ascertain that so the matter is to be, they will take to meeting with them their own Standard Book, and thus be prepared to sing whatever number of lines may be given out at a time. Ought not this item be promptly attended to?

“The compiler would furthermore observe in this place: This is the first hymn book ever compiled and published in these United States by the special recommendation of an Old School Baptist Association.” Also, the Mayo and Pig River Associations and other Old School associations in North Carolina and in the western counties of Virginia hailed the publishing of this book with pleasure. There is the following postscript to the preface: “As the compiler intends to keep a supply of this hymn book on hand at his own residence in Second Street, a few doors from Market Space, Baltimore, country merchants will find it to their advantage to call and purchase them there.” It contains several classical hymns, and is a fair hymnal for that day.

In 1861 there appeared in Boston *THE PSALMIST*, which had a Supplement by Richard Fuller, pastor of The Seventh Street Baptist Church, Baltimore, and by J. B. Jeter, pastor of the Second Baptist Church, St. Louis. From the preface the following is learned concerning this book. The Board of the American Baptist Publication and Sunday School Society decided in 1841 to get out a hymn book in response to calls upon it. A committee was appointed, consisting of Rev. W. T. Brantley, of South Carolina, Rev. S. W. Lyand, of Ohio, Rev. J. B. Taylor, of Virginia, Rev. S. P. Hill, of Maryland, Rev. G. Ide and Rev. R. W. Griswold, of Pennsylvania, and W. R. Williams, of New York. Subsequently, ascertaining that a similar work had been undertaken by Gould, Kendall and Lincoln, publishers of Boston, and

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

desiring no duplication of hymn books, the Board unanimously voted to adopt and publish the work already begun. This was in 1843.

In the preface to the Supplement, signed by Richard Fuller and J. B. Jeter, statements are made commending *THE PSALMIST*, but noting a serious obstacle to its use in the South in that a number of the South's most popular hymns were omitted. Hence, they decided to bring out a supplement. From the index of the Supplement it seems that these hymns were not added in the form of an appendix but inserted here and there throughout, thereby requiring a new numbering of the hymns. Thus the first hymn listed in the index to the Supplement is number 15 and the second is number 83.

Among the Baptists of the South the name of Manly is inseparably associated with religious song. REV. B. M. MANLY, D. D.; LL. D., a son of Dr. Basil Manly, of South Carolina, was born in Edgefield, South Carolina, December 19, 1823. Receiving a preparatory schooling at Charleston, young Manly entered the University of Alabama, at Tuscaloosa, from which he graduated in 1843. Next he entered Newton Theological Seminary, later going to Princeton Seminary, where he graduated in 1847. Having been ordained at Tuscaloosa in 1848, his first pastorate was in three country churches in Sumter County, Alabama, and one in Xonbee County, Mississippi. These churches were widely separated and had heavy pastoral duties, which proved too much for the young man. At length, impaired in health, he gave up the active pastorate for a short period, but became in 1850 pastor of First Baptist Church, Richmond, Virginia, where in 1854 his health again failed, resulting in his resigning that pastorate and establishing the Richmond Female Institute, of which he became principal. Upon the organization of the Southern Baptist Theological Seminary at Greenville, South Carolina, in 1860, Dr. Manly became professor of Biblical Interpretation. During the Civil War the Seminary was suspended, and for several years he preached near Greenville. Upon the reopening of the Seminary he resumed his professorial duties and continued to devote himself to the interests of the Seminary

THE BAPTISTS

until 1871, when he became President of Georgetown College, Kentucky. Again in 1879 Dr. Manly became a professor in the Seminary, this time teaching Old Testament Interpretation and Biblical Introduction, the Seminary having been removed to Louisville, Kentucky, its present location.

Basil Manly, Jr., has written much. In 1857, with the aid of his father, he compiled the *BAPTIST PSALMODY*, published in Charleston the next year. This has had a deservedly wide circulation in the South. It has 1,295 hymns of which he wrote 9, Watts 370, Doddridge 71, the Wesleys 59, Newton 32, Montgomery 37 and Cowper 18.

Dr. Manly has written from twenty to thirty other hymns, some of which are found in many books. At the request of friends he wrote in 1860 for the first commencement of the Baptist Theological Seminary at Greenville a hymn which has been sung at every commencement of the Seminary since that time. This hymn is quoted in another connection. In 1859 there was published in Richmond, by T. J. Starke, the *BAPTIST CHORALS: A Tune and Hymn Book, Designed to Promote General Congregational Singing*. It contained 164 tunes adapted to about 400 hymns. The hymns were selected by Rev. B. Manly.

In the introduction Dr. Manly says: "The object of this volume is not to come in competition with hymn books now in circulation, but to render them more useful by supplying tunes adapted expressly to some of the choicest hymns; while for convenience's sake, the words are printed on the same page, so that embarrassment may be removed likely to hinder those who are slightly skilled in musical science.

"The simple design of this work is to promote, as far as possible, congregational singing in the use of the ordinary hymn books. Hence hymns have been selected, almost exclusively, which are to be found in both the *BAPTIST PSALMODY* and *THE PSALMIST*, the two books most extensively used in the Baptist churches in the United States." To aid in accomplishing this purpose, the hymns which are also found in the *PSALMODY* and in *THE PSALMIST*, have the numbers which they bear in these books in addition to their regular numbers for the *CHORALS*.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

In 1892 Dr. Manly brought out MANLY'S CHOICE. The following statements are found in its preface: "For some years it has been apparent that the rage for novelties in singing, especially in our Sunday Schools, has been driving out of use the old, precious, standard hymns. They are not memorized as of old. They are scarcely sung at all. They are not contained in the non-denominational song books, which in many churches have usurped the places of our old hymn books.

"We cannot afford to lose these old hymns. They are full of the Gospel; they breathe the deepest emotions of pious hearts in the noblest strains of poetry; they have been listed and approved by successive generations of those who love the Lord; they are the surviving fittest ones from thousands of inferior productions; they are hallowed by abundant usefulness and tenderest memories. But the young people to-day are unfamiliar with them and will seldom hear any of them, if the present tendency goes on untouched.

"Having compiled heretofore two hymn books, the BAPTIST PSALMODY and BAPTIST CHORALS, and having had some experience as an advisor in two others of our most popular books, my attention has been directed especially to the subject of hymnology all my ministerial life. I think I know what our people need, and what they desire. To meet that need, the present work is offered. It is cheap and of convenient size; it contains no trash and no unreal sentiment or unsound doctrine . . . ; not one is inserted which is not judged worthy of a special place among the choice hymns of the language . . .

"Some modern tunes which are familiar and excellent would gladly have been used; but they are held under the laws of copyright and could not be procured, except at heavy expense, if at all. And this would have conflicted with the design of publishing a cheap book, within the reach of all. . .

"Many churches have needlessly contented themselves with a very small number of tunes . . .

"Two great ends have been kept steadily in view. One is to promote congregational singing . . . The other is to do something toward the elevation and general culture of musical tastes among the Baptist people, whom I love . . ."

THE BAPTISTS

In the Virginia Baptist Historical Collection at the University of Richmond there is a book entitled **GLORIOUS PRAISE**. W. H. Doane and W. J. Kirkpatrick are the compilers. It was published by the Baptist Book Concern, Louisville. There is no date of publication but, since some of its copyrights are dated 1904, it was written before that time. It is a general song book of fair quality.

The Virginia Baptist Historical Collection has a total of eighty-two hymn books, only a few of which are duplicates.

The Southern Baptist Convention, through its Sunday School Board, has issued the following books:

Baptist Hymn and Praise Book.....	1904	124,493 copies sold
Kingdom Songs.....	1921	344,500 copies sold
The Chapel Book.....	1923	16,225 copies sold
The New Baptist Hymnal.....	1926	55,000 copies sold

THE BAPTIST HYMN AND PRAISE BOOK was gotten out under the general supervision of Dr. Lansing Burrows. In doing so effort was made to use the great and familiar hymns of the past as well as to include the best of the newer hymns. The opinion of a large number of pastors was secured regarding the selection of numbers, both as to words and to music. A committee of skilled members studied the results thus obtained and their decision was final. The book has 576 hymns, twenty-seven of which are distinct and widely used revival hymns. An unusual and highly commendable feature is the arrangement. The book is divided into nine parts; Part Seven, or Hymns of Christian Experience, which is the largest division, has nine sub-divisions. The divisions are not merely given in the table of contents but also throughout the book at the proper places. KINGDOM SONGS is a very widely circulated and a highly useful book for general purposes. It is found in almost any Baptist church. The new BAPTIST HYMNAL is more churchly than its predecessors but is winning its way slowly into general use. Necessarily, the CHAPEL BOOK is limited in its field of usefulness.

CHAPTER II

THE PRESBYTERIANS

Dr. Benson says ¹that Watts' HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS may be called the first hymnal of American Presbyterianism; and that the second was an independent, local venture with two title pages, *A VERSION OF THE Book of PSALMS, Selected From The Most Approved Versions . . . Approved by The Presbytery of Charleston*; and *A COLLECTION OF HYMNS FOR PUBLIC AND PRIVATE USE, Approved By The Presbytery of Charleston*; printed by J. McIver, 1786. This book was prepared by George Buist, of Charleston, with the advice of Dr. Hugh Blair. The hymns were from many sources, including the English Arian hymn book, but manifested a preference for Scotch paraphrases. It was used by the Presbyterian Churches of the city and of the neighborhood of Charleston until at least 1809. However, some edition, or revision, of Dr. Watts' productions continued in use until about 1835.

The ²third quarter of the nineteenth century the Presbyterian churches, not retaining the older hymnals, were largely supplied by Dr. Chas. S. Robinson, a Presbyterian pastor of Philadelphia, who published, between 1862 and 1892, at least fifteen books of all kinds. The first of his hymn books was *SONGS OF THE CHURCH, or HYMNS AND TUNES FOR CHRISTIAN WORSHIP*, 1862; the second was *SONGS FOR THE SANCTUARY*, 1865; and the third, *PSALMS AND HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS; A Manual of Worship for the Church of Christ*, 1875. The second attained in seven years a sale of nearly 200,000 copies and was used within that period by nearly 2,000 congregations; and the third became the official hymn book of the Southern branch of the Presbyterian Church. Dr. Robinson's hymns and methods were not original and were aimed at popularity and convenience to the users.

This church in 1866 brought out *PSALMS AND HYMNS* and

1. L. F. Benson, *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE*, Page 193.
2. *Ibid*: Page 478.

THE PRESBYTERIANS

responded quite guardedly to modern influences. Then followed the adoption of Robinson's book just mentioned, and later of R. P. Kerr's *HYMNS OF THE AGES*, that came out in New York in 1891. The General Assembly in 1898, under pressure from the Presbyteries, authorized *THE NEW PSALMS AND HYMNS*, which was published in 1901 by the Presbyterian Committee on Publication at Richmond, Virginia. This book had quite a number of the newer type of hymns and tunes, which, however, were carefully edited. It remained the official hymnal until 1927, when the present book, entitled *THE PRESBYTERIAN HYMNAL* was produced.

In response to the desires of Presbyteries and individuals, the General Assembly in May, 1925, appointed a committee of eight to get out a new book. Full instructions were given the committee which consisted of the following outstanding men: Dr. Walter L. Lingle, then President of the Training School of the General Assembly at Richmond, Virginia, and editor of the *SOUTHERN PRESBYTERIAN*; Dr. C. T. Caldwell of Waco, Texas; Mr. Claude T. Carr, of Mooresville, North Carolina, a leading Sunday School executive of the church; Dr. Samuel McP. Glasgow, pastor at Knoxville, Tennessee; James Lewis Howe, Lexington, Virginia, Mr. R. E. Magill, Executive Secretary of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, Richmond, Virginia; Dr. G. G. Sydnor, pastor at Charlestown, W. Va., and Dr. W. Talliaferro Thompson, professor in the Union Theological Seminary at Richmond, Virginia. The Assembly, however, directed that unused hymns and tunes in the book then in use be omitted and that hymns of merit of other church hymnals be included. For two years the Committee labored, searching hymn books of every denomination and of all kinds in the effort to obtain the best hymns and tunes. Special stress was laid upon the great hymns of the ages and upon using them in connection with the tunes with which they are generally associated. Yet the best of the newer hymns and the tastes and needs of the younger generation were also kept in mind. However, they found it impossible to secure at any price some of the newer hymns. All tunes were tried before being adopted, with the purpose of getting only tunes adaptable to average congregations, which purpose seems to have been very well realized.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

The Committee selected for consideration about 500 new hymns, but finally rejected all except about a half dozen. Among the Southern people who contributed either tunes or hymns are the following. Lowell Mason has thirty tunes. Rev. J. H. Taylor, pastor of Central Presbyterian Church, Washington, D. C., wrote Number 302, which is

Lead On, Thou God of Hosts,
Lead On, Thy Church,

the tune to which was written by a member of his church. Rev. G. G. Sydnor composed the music to Number 65,

O Little Child of Bethlehem,
The world had waited long.

Rev. S. M. Glasgow, pastor of the First Presbyterian Church, Knoxville, Tennessee, wrote Number 297, the first line of which is,

Men of the Church of the Living God.

This ends a survey of the official hymnals of the Presbyterian Church in the United States (Southern). But there are several additional hymnals put out by its publishing house that deserve consideration. In the spring of 1928 a report of the Presbyterian Committee on Publication revealed the following concerning its hymnals:

⁸ NAME OF HYMN	DATE OF PUBLICATION	EXTENT OF CIRCULATION
PSALMS and HYMNS.....	1891	111,000
LIFE and SERVICE HYMNS.....	1917	460,000
Premier HYMNS.....	1926	137,000
PRESBYTERIAN HYMNAL.....	1927	20,750
JUNIOR SONGS and HYMNS.....	1927	5,000
CHOCTAW HYMNS (for Choctaw Indians).....	1927	5,000

The PSALMS AND HYMNS and PRESBYTERIAN HYMNAL have already been considered. The JUNIOR SONGS AND HYMNS will be discussed in another chapter. The CHOCTAW HYMNS is for the missionary work of the church among those Indians and is in the Choctaw language. Thus, only LIFE AND SERVICE HYMNS and PREMIER HYMNS remain to be treated.

3. In addition to books here listed, the report named several hymnals out of print.

THE PRESBYTERIANS

The following taken from the FOREWORD of LIFE AND SERVICE HYMNS indicates the nature of this book: ⁴“With a happy balance things new and old are blended in LIFE AND SERVICE HYMNS, with the result that it is an ideal book for use in the Church, in the Sunday School, in Evangelistic Services, Young Peoples Meetings, and in the home.

“The real significance of the title will become increasingly apparent as the book is used, for it abounds in selections appealing for the dedication of Life to Our Master and Lord, and the life thus dedicated must respond to the insistent calls for Service ringing like bells throughout the book.

“A large section of the book is devoted to the classic old hymns of the Church, sacred in association, effective in appeal, and which should become the permanent possession of our young people through memorization.

“Each succeeding generation finds new terms and methods for expressing spiritual emotions and aspirations, and the Psalmist and Prophets but voiced an age-long desire when they exclaimed, ‘Sing unto the Lord a new song.’

“Modern song writers have, therefore, a warrant for their efforts to interpret the spiritual longings and experiences of their day; and when both words and melody appeal to head and heart and stimulate faith and good works, a real contribution has been made to Christian Hymnology.

“Martin Luther’s stately words and involved melodies served their purpose in Reformation days; the Rouse version of the Psalms expressed the faith of their time; the Wesley hymns voiced the deep emotions of the closing years of the eighteenth century, as Sankey and Bliss expressed the revival glow of the later years of the nineteenth century, and the present-day hymn writers are interpreting the twentieth century as faithfully as the earlier composers interpreted their age.

“We have drawn liberally upon the compositions of well-known modern hymn writers and have selected hymns that have proven their value by the test of use under widely

4. Quoted by permission of The Presbyterian Committee of Publication, Richmond, Va.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

varying conditions, and a number of compositions by able hymn writers appear for the first time."

The book is compiled by R. E. Magill, Executive Secretary of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, and Bentley D. Ackley is musical editor. It has 374 numbers. Mr. Ackley wrote the music of forty-one pieces, and C. H. Gabriel, P. P. Bliss, W. H. Doane and George C. Stebbins are the authors of the music of many other pieces.

Rev. S. M. Glasgow and J. W. Henderson, who was formerly associated with Mr. Glasgow at Knoxville, wrote the words and music, respectively, to Number 30, *FRIEND WITHOUT JESUS*, and Number 88, *I WOULD BE LIKE JESUS ALL THE WHILE*. Mr. Glasgow is also author of the words of Number 139, the subject of which is: *HOW LONG MUST WE WAIT?* This is also Number 105 in *PREMIER HYMNS*.⁵ It was suggested by the experience of a missionary in Africa. An African chief had heard of the work of missionaries among certain tribes, and being favorably impressed with it, came to a missionary seeking a Christian worker for his village. But it was impossible for the missionary to comply with his request. Indeed, it was difficult to keep the work going on its present scale, for the chapel had rotted out and three huts had been built and gone down from use and age. As these conditions were explained to the chief as reasons for inability to send a Christian worker to his territory, he was told, "You must wait." Whereupon the chief in his broken-heartedness exclaimed to the missionary, "How Long Must We Wait? O Teacher, ask the white man in your land, How Long Must We Wait?" The chief's question, "How Long Must We Wait?" suggested to Mr. Glasgow this hymn, the chorus of which repeats it several times. This hymn is in demand by publishers of hymn books and is being reprinted by many of them.

Miss Elizabeth McE. Shields⁶ wrote the music to Number 115, the subject of which is "Others," which is also in great demand by publishers of hymn books.

Mr. R. E. Magill and Mr. B. D. Ackley are also respectively editor and compiler and music editor of *PREMIER*

5. *LIFE AND SERVICE HYMNS*, Introduction to Hymn Number 139.
6. Of whom more is given in another chapter.

THE PRESBYTERIANS

HYMNS. From the FOREWORD of it the following is taken:
7“Experience and observation indicate that people delight in taking part in a praise service in which words and music combine in voicing their religious emotions and desires; and the music must be within the range of untrained voices if the people are to sing with spirit and profit.

“In the religious education of youth no part is of more vital importance than their training in worship. To this end the music in the services in which they participate should express their religious experience, and should voice their youthful and normal ambition for a life of action and service.

“In order that the level of church music may be lifted, our young people should become familiar with the best of the older hymns which are rich in associations and are still classics in the musical world. Selections for young people must sound the radiant and martial note, and it is, therefore, folly to ask them to sing the many doleful and mystical hymns which abound in the old books of the past. It has been the effort of the compiler of PREMIER HYMNS to assemble in a happy balance the ageless and stately hymns of the Church with the familiar gospel songs which express in understandable language the experience and aspirations of present-day Christians, and which have reverent, appealing and easily singable musical settings. Many choice selections appear for the first time.”

Then, it is stated that the book meets all the needs of a church that can have only one book, and that it is ideal for the Sunday School, prayer meetings, young peoples' gatherings, evangelistic services, and great religious gatherings.

A questionnaire was sent out to ascertain the sentiment regarding the kind of music the book should have, and Mr. Magill states that thousands thus made suggestions. It has 283 hymns. B. D. Ackley wrote the music of twenty-six numbers, C. H. Gabriel of twenty-one, P. P. Bliss of four, George C. Stebbins of eight, W. H. Doane of five, Rev. H. M. Glasgow of three and Miss Elizabeth McE. Shields and Mrs. Elda Fleet Baker each one.

7. Used by permission of Presbyterian Committee of Publication.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

IVORY PALACES, or Number One, in PREMIER HYMNS was written under rather interesting circumstances. Dr. J. Wilbur Chapman was preaching in the auditorium at the Montreat Assembly, Montreat, North Carolina, on the eighth verse of the Forty-Fifth Psalm, which pictures Christ as coming out of the ivory palaces of heaven to redeem mankind and as being clothed in garments perfumed with myrrh for beauty, aloes for bitterness and cassia for healing, the fragrance of which abided to reveal His nearness. As Dr. Chapman preached, his singer, Henry Barraclough, thought of a hymn. Having no paper, Mr. Barraclough wrote the words and music on his cuffs, and after service, upon returning to his room, put it upon paper. Though produced so quickly, not a syllable of the words or a bar of the music has been changed or has seemed to need changing.

CHAPTER III

¹THE METHODISTS

On October 14, 1735, John Wesley embarked as a missionary to the new colony of Georgia, being accompanied by his brother, Charles, and Benjamin Ingram, making a party of three out of the original thirteen Oxford "Methodists." Among the books in Wesley's kit were the following in the field of Hymnology: Tate and Brady's *NEW VERSION OF THE PSALMS*; Watts' *PSALMS AND HYMNS*; Hicks' edition of *DEVOTIONS IN THE ANCIENT WAY OF OFFICERS*, containing John Austin's hymns; the *DIVINE DIALOGUES with the Divine Hymns of Henry Moore*; and hymns of his father and brother Samuel. Their fellow voyagers were twenty-six German Moravian colonists, with their new bishop, David Nitschmann. The Moravians sang a great deal during the voyage, but especially during the strain of storm, when their singing was an expression of steady faith. On the third day of the trip John Wesley began studying German in order to converse with the Moravians, and soon was able to enter into their daily worship.

Thus began the Moravian influence upon the spiritual life of the Wesleys and thus was produced upon them an indelible impression of the spiritual possibilities of hymn singing of a fervid type. The realization of these possibilities caused John Wesley to study the Moravian Hymnody and to make translations from it. Having the supply of hymns thus listed, he was amply provided with material for producing hymns for his work in America. He at once, with his usual great care, entered upon the work of the selection, revision, translation and composition of hymns for this purpose. Therefore, he introduced hymn singing into the companies he formed at Savannah and Frederica and into the Sunday church services. In August, 1737, the Grand Jury of Savannah presented a list of grievances against

1. Most of the material on the early Methodist Hymnology is taken from *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS USE AND DEVELOPMENT*, by Louis F. Benson.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

John Wesley, the first being his alterations of the authorized metrical psalms, and the second his "introducing into the church and service at the altar compositions of psalms and hymns not inspected or authorized by any proper judicature."

These psalms and hymns at first were merely a manuscript collection selected and composed in the manner just stated. Wesley tested them by frequent readings and discussions with friends, by use in the sick room and in social devotions. Finding them satisfactory, he had Lewis Timothy, of Charleston, print them. The little book was entitled **COLLECTION OF PSALMS AND HYMNS**, had seventy-four pages and was without the name of the author. It had seventy hymns, one-half being from Watts, seven from John Austin, six adapted from George Herbert, two from Addison, five by Samuel Wesley, five by Samuel Wesley, Jr., and five by himself translated from the German. The book is divided into three parts: **PSALMS AND HYMNS FOR SUNDAY** (*hymns of general praise*); **FOR WEDNESDAY OR FRIDAY** (*suitable for fast days*); and **FOR SATURDAY** (*hymns especially addressed to God as the Creator of all things*).

Thus originated the first Methodist hymn book of America and of the South. Indeed Price ²says that it was also the first hymn book ever published for use in the Church of England. Also, he states ³that two copies of it are now known to exist and that Julian's **DICTIONARY OF HYMNOLOGY** is in error in stating that only one copy is known, that being in England, since there is also a copy in the Public Library of New York City.

⁴Price also holds that the hymn book that has had the largest influence upon Methodism everywhere was Mr. Wesley's famous collection of 1780. But he adds that the first hymnal introduced into America after the formal organization of the Methodist Episcopal Church at the Christmas Conference at Baltimore in 1784 was a reprint of Robert Spence's **POCKET HYMN BOOK**, compiled, edited and published by Robert Spence of York, England, about

2. **THE MUSIC AND HYMNODY OF THE METHODIST CHURCH**, Page 15.
3. *Ibid*: Page 15.
4. *Ibid*: Page 16.

THE METHODISTS

1784, and remarks that this was not surprising in view of the fact that Robert Spence and Bishop Coke were intimate friends. However, at the organization of American Methodism one of Wesley's hymnals seems to have been accepted as the official hymnal. One of John Wesley's provisions for the organization of the new church in America was preparation for liturgical worship on the order of the worship in England. He prepared a modification of THE BOOK OF COMMON PRAYER, printed at London in 1784 as THE SUNDAY SERVICE OF THE METHODISTS IN AMERICA, *with Other Occasional Services*. At the same time, having always a horror of the intrusion of doggerel into Methodist Song, he also printed for the same use A COLLECTION OF PSALMS AND HYMNS FOR THE LORD'S DAY. It had 118 numbers from the PSALMS AND HYMNS of 1741, a very popular hymnal in England. He sent a supply of these two books over by Dr. Coke from Bristol, September 10, 1784, advising "All travelling preachers to use the liturgy on the Lord's Day in all their congregations, reading the Litany on Wednesdays and Fridays, and praying extempore on all other days." Dr. Coke presented this letter to the Baltimore Conference, which agreed to do as Mr. Wesley had advised. After the Conference Dr. Coke had Wesley's letter printed at Philadelphia and also MINUTES OF SEVERAL CONVERSATIONS BETWEEN REV. THOS. COKE, L.L. D., THE REV. FRANCIS ASBURY AND OTHERS, AS THE MINUTES OF THE CONFERENCE AT A CONFERENCE BEGUN IN BALTIMORE . . . THE 27TH OF DECEMBER . . . 1784; COMPOSING A FORM OF DISCIPLINE FOR THE MINISTERS, PREACHERS AND OTHER MEMBERS OF THE METHODIST EPISCOPAL CHURCH IN AMERICA . . He then had the whole collection bound up into one volume as the CREDENTIALS, THE LITURGY, THE DISCIPLINE AND THE HYMN BOOK OF THE NEW CHURCH.

Thus the American Bishops appear to have done their best, Benson thinks, to carry out Mr. Wesley's wishes, for the preachers were directed to "sing no hymns of their own composing." But, whether through choice, as Price thinks, or through necessity, as Benson believes, Wesley's desires in this matter seem to have accomplished little. At least, forces were at work which Dr. Coke could not entirely

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

control. There was difficulty in keeping the church from singing hymns that did not have Wesley's approval. This was due to the fact that the Church in America was developing differently from the course it was taking in England. In primitive America the people and preachers were ignorant, the meetings were frequently held in the cabins and in the fields, and generally only the preacher had a hymn book. The tunes had to be very familiar or very easily caught, and the words, if unknown, given out a line or two at a time. Naturally a rude type of song became popular. Thus, Wesley's *THE SUNDAY SERVICE* rapidly disappeared and Robert Spence's *POCKET HYMN Book* gained wide acceptance. It went through a number of editions and revisions, reaching in 1790 the tenth and eleventh editions, and in 1793 even the eighteenth edition.

The *POCKET HYMN Book* had not been copyrighted and was soon being reprinted by outside parties. In 1800 Ezekiel Cooper became book steward, and perhaps it was his suggestion that the book be revised, reprinted and copyrighted. At any rate, in 1802 a revision appeared, which had 320 hymns.

Demand soon arose for more hymns, resulting in Daniel Hitt, assistant book steward, and Bishop Asbury laying before the Conference of 1808 the manuscript of a supplement, which was accepted and published in New York the same year. First it was separate from the *POCKET Book*, but later was bound up with it and became known as *THE DOUBLE HYMN Book*.

So far there had not been an American edition of Wesley's collection of 1780, which he intended as a common hymnal for Methodism. In 1814 a cheap reprint of it appeared in Baltimore.⁵ "To many American Methodists this brought their first knowledge, and to most their first sight, of what the Wesleyan Hymnody was in its fullness and purity; and in the minds of the curious must have raised many questions both as to omissions in their own books and its garbled texts."

The book agents, acting according to authority granted by the General Conference of 1820, published *A COLLECTION OF HYMNS FOR THE USE OF THE METHODIST EPISCOPAL*

5. Benson, Page 290; by permission of Doubleday, Doran & Company.

THE METHODISTS

CHURCH, *Principally from THE COLLECTION OF THE REV. JOHN WESLEY, M. A.... New York.* The new title was likely to create an impression that the Church was at last looking to Wesley rather than Spence as the base of its hymnody, but the preface made no such claim, stating that it was merely a revision of the DOUBLE HYMN BOOK. To aid in the use of this book and to serve for the first time as an official body of tunes, the Book Concern issued the Methodist Harmonist (New York, 1821), which was slightly revised in 1832, and a supplement was added by Nathan Bangs in 1836. Thus it was used until 1849.

Such were the official hymnals of the Methodist Church in America up to the time of the organization of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, which occurred in 1845, and was occasioned by the difference in attitude toward slavery of the Methodist people in the South and in the North. As Methodism was early quite firmly planted in the South, and as the South in those days progressed well educationally, culturally, and materially, as well as religiously, it seems quite likely that these official hymnals were largely used by the Methodist people within its bounds.

However, these hymnals were by no means the only ones used by the Methodists in the South. Unofficial ones were frequently produced and used. This was especially true during and after the Great Revival of 1800 which was not entirely, but largely, a Methodist and a Southern movement. It began in Logan County, Kentucky, under the preaching of Rev. James McCready, a Presbyterian. Its unique feature was the camp meeting, the first one of which was held ⁶near Gaspar River Church in 1800. Mr. McCready had widely advertised for the people to come prepared to camp on the ground, and immense crowds came and encamped in tents or covered wagons in the form of a hollow square, in the center of which were a stand for the preacher and rows of logs for seats. The camp meeting idea at once became popular and rapidly spread through Kentucky into the Cumberland Mountains and within the present boundaries of Tennessee and the Carolinas. Not more than five Presbyterian preachers in Kentucky took part in the revival, so that

6. L. F. Benson, THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE, Page 291.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

the coöperation of the Methodists was heartily welcomed. Soon they became dominant, which was natural, in view of their emotional enthusiasm and of their experience with revival methods. However, ⁷Dr. Benson thinks that the Methodist predominance came about largely as a result of their hymns and hearty hymn singing. They introduced their own stirring hymns, generally, though not correctly, entitled "Wesley's Hymns." Since hymn books were scarce, they were cut up and the leaves distributed so that all people might learn the hymns by heart. ⁸Benson thinks the leaves of the books cut up came from copies of the POCKET Book, but states that soon these hymns were unable to contain the overwrought feelings of preacher and people, so that spontaneous song resulted and became a distinctive characteristic of the meetings. ⁹"Rough and irregular couplets or stanzas were concocted out of Scripture phrases and everyday speech, with liberal interspersing of Hallelujahs and refrains. Such ejaculatory hymns were frequently started by an excited auditor during the preaching, and taken up by the throng until the meeting dissolved in singing-ecstasy, culminating in a general handshaking. Sometimes they were given forth by a preacher who had a sense of rhythm, under the excitement of his preaching and the agitation of his audience. Hymns were also composed more deliberately out of meeting and taught to the people, or lined out from the pulpit."

Many of these rough songs were not written down and, consequently, have perished, but some were put in writing and passed about. The first camp meeting song books came in the first decade of the nineteenth century and, no doubt, contained the most effective and most popular of these songs. With it a second stage of camp meeting hymnody developed, in which there were song writers who paid more attention to the rules of rhetoric and versification and whose work, therefore, had greater claim to permanence. This type of song, according to Dr. Benson's description, ¹⁰was very much like our modern revival hymn, except it was more crude, since it naturally reflected the language and phrase-

7. Ibid: Page 292.

8. Ibid: Page 292.

9. Ibid: Page 292; by permission of Doubleday, Doran & Company.

10. Ibid: Page 292.

THE METHODISTS

ology of the primitive life of the people of those sections at that time. The only requisite for a tune was that it be contagious and effective, this attitude being expressed in the rhyme, which ran:

¹¹Enlisted in the cause of sin,
Why should a good be evil?
Music, alas, too long has been
Pressed to obey the devil.

A number of song books resulted from these conditions, but Dr. Benson says, ¹²that probably the hymns used most generally in the Kentucky revival, and certainly those used just after it in Methodist camp meetings in Kentucky and Tennessee, appeared in the PILGRIM SONGSTER; or *A Choice Selection of Spiritual Songs; With Many Songs Never Before in Print*, by Thomas Hinde. It was published in 1810 and reached a third edition in 1828. The authorship of 120, or about half of its hymns, was not known to the compiler, and about a third were written by Granade and Caleb Jarvis Taylor, two members of the Western Conference.

Another favorite of the South coming out of this period was John J. Harrodds' SOCIAL AND CAMP MEETING SONGS FOR THE PIous, which appeared at Baltimore in 1817 and in 1822 reached a fourth edition.

A Methodist Hymnal that may be termed semi-official, since it had the endorsement of one conference but not of the church at large, is the following, which is listed in a book at William and Mary College giving the names and productions of Virginia authors: A GENERAL SELECTION OF THE NEWEST AND MOST FAMILED HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS IN USE; By Rev. S. A. Meade. Second Edition—Revised, Corrected and Enlarged; Published by Permission of the Virginia Conference by Jacob Haas, 1811, Lynchburg, Virginia. Since it reached a second edition, it evidently enjoyed considerable popularity.

By 1844 it was realized that the question of slavery, as already stated, had hopelessly divided the Methodist Church in the United States, and it, therefore, seemed wise for the Southern conferences to form a separate church. In May,

¹¹. Ibid: Page 294, quoted by permission of Doubleday, Doran & Company.

¹². Ibid: Page 295.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

1846, the first General Conference of the Southern branch convened at Petersburg, Virginia, and this Conference granted authority for the reorganization of the new church. The preparation of a new hymnal demanded its recognition. On May 3 William M. Wightman and Thomas O. Summers introduced a resolution requesting that ^{13a} a committee be appointed to prepare as soon as possible a new hymnal, which should have the name of the author of every hymn. The Committee was also to increase the number of common, long and short meters by selecting from the authorized Wesleyan Hymn Book and from other approved sources and by excluding particular meters unsuitable for ordinary congregational singing. It was, furthermore, to introduce into the new book valuable hymns from the supplement. It was given power to make such alterations in the method and arrangement of subjects as might seem advisable.

That same day the resolution was promptly tabled, but three days later it was referred to the Committee, which scarcely missed being instructed to report to the Conference within six days the hymns that should be excluded. Of course, such could not have been properly done in the midst of the excitement and pressure of such a General Conference. On May 9 the Conference voted for the Committee on Revision and Publication of the Hymn Book not to report to that Conference, but to proceed as soon as possible to prepare the hymnal and to have it published. On May 23 shortly before adjournment, the bishops appointed as a committee to do this work: Thomas O. Summers, William M. Wightman, Jefferson Hamilton, Whiteford Smith and August B. Longstreet. The hymnal resulting from their efforts remained in use until 1886.

Benson says ¹⁴ that this book appeared in Nashville in 1847 as *A COLLECTION OF HYMNS FOR PUBLIC, SOCIAL AND DOMESTIC WORSHIP*, and contained 1,047 hymns, the Wesleys being the authors of over 600 and Dr. Watts of 150. He then adds that in 1851 Dr. Thomas O. Summers published through the Book Agency the *SONGS OF ZION*:

13. C. F. Price, *THE MUSIC AND HYMNODY OF THE METHODIST CHURCH*,
Page 23.

14. L. F. Benson, *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE*, Page 299.

THE METHODISTS

A Supplement to the Hymn Book of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. It had 503 hymns which were mainly the ones he could not find room for in the authorized hymnal, but he also admitted a few doggerel hymns, hoping he might thereby win the people who persisted in introducing camp meeting books. After twenty-two years this book was slightly enlarged.

¹⁵ Efforts were put forth from time to time to change or discontinue the 1847 hymnal. The General Conference of 1858 referred a resolution and a memorial asking for a tune book to the Committee on Tune and Hymn Book, which, the Conference consenting, referred the matter to the book agent, book editor, and book committee with instructions to do what seemed advisable. It was quite natural that the church should desire the abridgment of such a large hymnal. This was attempted at the 1870 General Conference when the Committee on Books and Periodicals favored authorizing the general book agent to publish a hymn and tune book, and when the following committee was appointed to compile it: Dr. J. M. Bonwell, Dr. Thomas O. Summers . . and Dr. W. P. Harrison. This book was to be an abridgment of the official hymnal and was for use in the poorer churches. At the 1878 Conference the Committee was unfavorable to the publication of a smaller hymnal, since there was a possibility of an Ecumenical Methodist Hymn Book. However, in spite of the Committee's attitude the Conference passed a resolution authorizing the book editor, the book committee and one bishop to get out at pleasure a small hymn or song book suitable for revival, prayer and social meetings.

Benson states ¹⁶ that this book was published in 1881 and was entitled THE NEW HYMN BOOK. He also says that it was little more than selections from the larger book, with the addition of some spiritual songs. It was inadequate for all church occasions and yet too large for convenience. Desire arose for all useless material to be taken out and for hymns from the later hymnody to be put in. The Conference of 1886 tried to meet these demands by authorizing a hymnal

15. Op. Cit., Page 25.
16. Op. Cit., Page 303.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

of that type, which should have not more than 800 hymns. The bishops were authorized to appoint a committee of nine to be divided into three equal sections. The Committee was instructed to exclude no hymn without a two-thirds vote, to admit no hymn without a two-thirds vote, and, as far as it was judicious, to abridge the long hymns to not more than twenty-four lines. In addition, special attention was to be given to arrangement and classification. This hymnal came out in April, 1889, and was the book which the present Methodist Hymnal supplanted. It had 842 hymns, besides the supplement of seventy-six numbers for prayer meetings and Sunday Schools.

The present Methodist Hymnal is not considered here, since the next chapter is devoted to it.

In a personal letter, dated April 18, 1929, an official of the Methodist Publishing House at Nashville stated that its records showed that the House had issued since 1880 fourteen hymnals, which had reached a sale of 6,001,088 copies. In these are included the several editions of the joint Methodist Hymnal and the two Cokesbury books. The Cokesbury books appear to be the only additional hymnals that warrant special attention.

In 1923 Lamar and Barton, then publishing agents, decided to get out a book that would make available the old and popular hymns. In doing so, they asked 250 preachers, song leaders and Christian workers to submit hymns that the great mass of Christian people prefer. In each instance the old familiar hymns led, when the reports came in. The Cokesbury Hymnal contains 300 hymns, 289 of which were taken from those thus submitted. These came from a great variety of books, and it required considerable difficulty and expense to obtain the use of copyrights. The popularity of the book was almost phenomenal, and in about five years it obtained a sale of over a million. There is scarcely a Southern Methodist Church, large or small, that does not have this book, and in a high percentage of the small churches it is the only book now used in any of the services and in any of the meetings of the organizations. It is also used by a number of the Methodist colleges for their chapel services. In addition, it is not uncommon to find this book

THE METHODISTS

in Southern churches of other denominations. The purposes of the publishers were amazingly realized, and the book truly contains the most popular old hymns of every type.

In 1928 Lamar and Whitmore, now publishing agents, brought out another book of the same general type, which is THE NEW COKESBURY HYMNAL. The preface states that this book was prepared in the same manner as the former, so that also the hymns and tunes in it have been chosen by the people. Many of the best known and most popular hymns of the earlier volume are found in this one, but also it contains many new and old hymns that the former does not have. It has 285 hymns, seventy-seven of which are in the METHODIST HYMNAL. A unique and, no doubt, quite popular feature consists of the following Spirituals:

Standin' in the Need of Prayer.
Swing Low, Sweet Chariot.
Lord, I Want to be a Christian.
I Know The Lord's Laid His Hands On Me.
Where Were You?
Down by the River-Side.

The Index has a heading entitled CHILDREN with a sub-heading of BEGINNERS AND PRIMARIES, in which are listed thirty-seven pieces, several of which are found in the best Beginners and Primary song books. Near the end are three pages of SUGGESTIVE DIRECTIONS FOR PUBLIC WORSHIP, nearly one page of which is a good treatment of music and hymns. Following this are seven programs of worship prepared by leaders of Religious Education.

CHAPTER IV

I THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

Towards the close of the nineteenth century a strong feeling developed among the Methodists that they needed a new hymnal. The old hymnal had served well for about a quarter of a century and had generally endeared itself to its constituency, but it was felt that its period of usefulness was about ended. This sentiment was first officially expressed in memorials and resolutions presented to the General Conference of 1900 which brought in a report signed by Honorable Leslie M. Shaw, Chairman of the Committee on the Book Concern, a delegate to the Conference from the Upper Iowa Conference and then Governor of Iowa. This report authorized the preparation of a hymnal of about six hundred hymns to contain a percentage of the best modern hymns and to sell as cheaply as possible. The Committee also recommended that authority be granted the Board of Bishops to appoint a committee of nine to get out the hymnal. This committee was appointed and consisted of the following competent persons:

Dr. Samuel F. Upham, who, after serving as pastor in the Providence and New England Conferences, was in 1881 elected professor of practical Theology in Drew Theological Seminary. Dr. Upham was made chairman of the Commission, but died in 1904, before the work was completed.

Dr. W. A. Quayle was then pastor of St. James Church, Chicago, after which (1908) he was elected bishop. His reputation as an excellent writer and eloquent preacher was well known during the latter part of his life to those familiar with Methodist leaders.

Dr. Charles W. Smith was at that time editor of the Pittsburgh Christian Advocate. He also became bishop in 1908. Dr. Smith had served many pastorates and a presiding eldership in the Pittsburgh Conference before becoming editor in 1884.

1. C. F. Price's book, *THE MUSIC AND HYMNODY OF THE METHODIST CHURCH*, is quite thorough, and from it many of the facts are taken for this chapter.

THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

Dr. Charles McCauley Stuart was professor of Sacred Rhetoric in Garrett Biblical Institute at the time the Commission was selected. Prior to his service at Garrett, he was associate editor of the Michigan Christian Advocate.

Dr. Cambden M. Cobern served many years as pastor in the Northwest and was also for a period professor of English Bible and Philosophy of Religion in Alleghany College. In 1900 he was pastor of Trinity Church, Denver.

Bishop Richard Joseph Cook, who was the editor of the Methodist Advocate Journal, had spent many years in the pastorate and had held a number of educational positions. He was also book editor in 1904.

In 1900 Dr. Charles S. Nutter was presiding elder of the Saint Albans District of the Vermont Conference. Dr. Nutter is widely and favorably known throughout Methodist circles as the author of HYMN STUDIES, as co-author with Dr. W. F. Tillett of THE ANNOTATED HYMNAL and as one of the foremost hymnologists of America.

Caleb T. Winchester was in 1900 professor of English Literature in Wesleyan University, a position which he had held since 1873. Mr. Winchester was well known as an author, lecturer and an authority upon English Literature.

Matthew V. Simpson, the son of Bishop Simpson, stood well as a business man of Philadelphia.

In the first meeting of the Commission doubt arose regarding what the General Conference desired the new hymnal to be, the minority holding that only an abridgment of the existing hymnal was intended, while the majority insisted that a new hymnal be issued and that the old hymnal be revised. Revision was begun, most of the hymns were selected, the general plan of the book was agreed upon, and announcement was made on January 16, 1902, that the new book would go to the press in August and be issued in December. However, it was suddenly discovered that the General Conference of 1900 also authorized that effort be put forth to prepare A COMMON CATECHISM, A COMMON HYMN BOOK and A COMMON ORDER OF WORSHIP and that other branches of Methodism be asked to coöperate.

The General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, met in Dallas, Texas, in May, 1902. Both of

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

the fraternal delegates from the Methodist Episcopal Church alluded in their speeches to the proposed common hymnal. On May 22 Peter H. Whisner of the Baltimore Conference moved that a report be adopted which provided, among other things, that the bishops be authorized to coöperate with the bishops of the Methodist Episcopal Church in bringing out a new hymnal and that they appoint at an early date the proper committees.

The conflict of legislation in the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church resulted in the Board of Bishops nullifying the appointment of the original commission and reappointing the same members immediately, in addition to adding Bishop Daniel A. Goodsell and the Rev. H. G. Jackson. M. V. Simpson resigned and J. M. Black was put in his place. Bishop Goodsell before being elected to the episcopacy had had a career as pastor, editor of religious papers and Secretary of the Board of Education of his church. Rev. H. G. Jackson was a prominent pastor. Mr. J. M. Black's ability as an editor and composer of Gospel songs made his services valuable.

The members of the Commission from the South were no less competent. Their names and activities are given in the succeeding paragraphs.

Bishop E. E. Hoss, having served as pastor, President of Martha Washington College, President of Emory and Henry College, professor in Vanderbilt University and editor of the Nashville Advocate, became bishop in 1902. He died in 1918.

Dr. George B. Winton has had a versatile record as pastor in California, Tennessee and Kentucky, missionary in Mexico, professor of Latin in Santa Rosa, author of productions in Spanish and in English and editor of the Nashville Advocate and the Midland Methodist.

Bishop H. M. DuBose had been pastor of churches in California, Texas and Mississippi, editor of the Pacific Methodist Advocate and Secretary of the Epworth League Board and editor of its organ, the Epworth Era. Since the making of the hymnal he has been pastor of First Church, Atlanta and book editor and editor of the Methodist Quarterly Review. From the last position he was elected bishop in 1918.

THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

Dr. Wilbur Fiske Tillett has spent practically all his life as professor in the Vanderbilt School of Religion, and for about thirty years was dean of that school. He has been accurately described as the Hymnologist of his church, and he has written a number of books in this field and on theology in general.

Dr. Paul Whitehead had been a presiding elder in the Virginia Conference nearly all his life.

Bishop John M. Moore had been pastor of churches in Texas and Missouri, and from 1906 to 1912 was managing editor of the Nashville Advocate. From 1912 to 1918 he was General Secretary of the Board of Home Missions. Since then he has been bishop. He is also author of several books.

Edwin Mims, Ph. D., has spent about all of his life as professor of English Literature at Trinity College, now Duke University, Durham, North Carolina, and at Vanderbilt University. He has been a frequent contributor to various magazines, editor of the South Atlantic Quarterly, and is the author of *THE LIFE OF SIDNEY LANIER* and of *THE ADVANCING SOUTH*.

Henry Nelson Snyder, Lit. D., LL. D. had been professor in Vanderbilt University and in Wofford College, becoming president of the latter in 1902, which position he still holds.

Dr. F. S. Parker is a member of the Louisiana Conference and since 1908 has been General Secretary of the General Epworth League Board.

Dr. James Campbell was at the time of the meeting of the Commission presiding elder in the North Texas Conference.

Dr. Robert T. Kerlin had been successively professor in Missouri Valley College, Southwestern University, the State Normal School at Warrensburg, Missouri, and instructor of English at Yale University.

Surely, this group of men should have been as competent as any their two churches could have chosen. They held three meetings: one at Nashville, Tennessee, in the spring of 1903; the second at Plymouth, Massachusetts, in July 1903; and the last at Washington, D. C., January 14, 1904.

Dr. G. B. Winton, in an editorial in the Nashville Advo-

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

cate of July 23, 1903, wrote quite interestingly of the meeting at Plymouth. The editorial follows:

“Nearly all the time of the session was given to the examination and selection of hymns. The numbers which after careful scrutiny were placed upon the accepted list amounted, with those previously selected, to about 630. As a whole the collection is not to go beyond 800, many of the Commission favoring even a smaller number.

“The atmosphere of these meetings has been singularly charming. Bishops Goodsell and Hoss alternate in presiding and usually act as spokesmen for their brethren when any matter arises which must be dealt with from the denominational point of view. That there is any such dividing line is, however, in the practical work of the Commission constantly forgotten and overlooked. We supposed that somewhat of sectionalism would show itself, even in the selection of hymns, but it has not. Such divisions of opinion as arise usually follow other lines of cleavage. But a more brotherly set of men never gathered to work together. . . .

“After the affectionately fraternal spirit and the deep religious fervor which constantly marked these meetings, nothing was more alarming than the Commission’s spontaneous love of song. A hymn can be read much more quickly than it can be sung, so usually we had to forego, in the interest of expedition, the pleasure of singing. But only let someone say, ‘How does that tune sound?’ or ‘What music is appropriate to that?’ and instantly a voice leads off and the whole Commission breaks into lusty singing. The different parts are caught up, and a miniature concert is in progress which only stops at the stern requirement of the president. One of the pastors remarked after such an outburst, ‘I should like to have this Commission for my choir.’

“A committee is engaged in settling upon tunes, but the Commission reserves the right of final determination. This whole matter of selecting proper tunes will be gone through with a thoroughness which is something new in the formation of hymnals.”

Minor changes in phraseology were left at the last meeting with the hymn editors, Dr. Charles M. Stuart for the North, and Dr. Wilbur F. Tillett for the South. The

THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

tunes not chosen at the three meetings were left to the Committee on Tunes and the musical editors, the latter consisting of Professor Karl P. Harrington of Wesleyan University and Professor Peter C. Lutkin of Northwestern University. Professor Harrington had also been professor of Latin at the University of North Carolina, and was a well-known organist, musical editor, composer and lecturer. Professor Lutkin was professor of Music in the College of Liberal Arts and dean of the School of Music in Northwestern University. At nine years of age he was a choir boy in the Cathedral of St. Peter and St. Paul, Chicago, when twelve was assistant organist there and at fourteen organist. Going to Europe in 1881, he studied under the great masters and in 1891 became a member of the faculty of Northwestern University. In the summer of 1904 the musical editors met at Evanston, Illinois, to complete the tunes, but they could not do so. Therefore, they issued a pamphlet containing the words of several hymns and invited new music for them. They discussed the results by correspondence but withheld final decision for a meeting at Boston in the spring of 1905. Half of the tunes selected were new to Methodism, but only a few of them had not been published before. Several of the tunes and two tune writers are deserving special mention, because of their connection with the South.

Mrs. Emma Louise Ashford, though born in Delaware, in 1850, has spent nearly all her life in the South, having lived at Nashville for about fifty years, where her husband has served on the faculty of Vanderbilt University. She is known to a wide circle of church musicians, and has had an eminently successful career as organist, composer of sacred and secular cantatas, author of about fifty songs and a like number of piano pieces and as editor of several musical periodicals.

Lowell Mason, though also not a native of the South, spent sixteen years within its boundaries, having lived at Savannah, Georgia, from 1811 to 1826, when he removed to Boston. While at Savannah he was organist of the Independent Presbyterian Church of that city and composed the tune of the great missionary hymn, **FROM GREENLAND'S ICY MOUNTAINS**. Mason was widely known as an advocate

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

of the Pestalozzian system, as the founder of the Boston Academy of Music, as a writer of several hundred tunes, and as the editor of a large number of hymn books from which he accumulated a fortune. Twenty-nine of his tunes are set to fifty hymns in the Methodist Hymnal.² Price states that almost all American hymnals of standing musical rank have some of Lowell's melodies, but that in England such is not the case. He also calls attention to the fact that Lowell's tunes are not as popular with the Methodists as formerly, as seen in the fact that the former Methodist Episcopal Hymnal had sixty-eight and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, had nearly one hundred, whereas, as just stated, the present hymnal has only fifty, including duplicates.

The following tunes have a special connection with the South: EVELYN was named for a personal friend of Mrs. Ashford; PARKER and MOORE for Dr. F. S. Parker and Bishop John M. Moore; whereas NASHVILLE and WASHINGTON commemorate two of the three meeting places of the joint Commission that prepared the book. The last two names were given tunes not because of any preference for these places but were treated as was Plymouth, the other meeting place, which also has a tune named for it.

Only seven writers of hymns in the Methodist Hymnal were born and spent a large part of their lives in the South.

Sidney Lanier wrote INTO THE Woods My MASTER WENT, or Number 745. Of it Tillett and Nutter³ in their annotated hymnal say that it was first called A BALLAD OF TREES AND THE MASTER, was dated Baltimore, 1880, and published soon after in THE INDEPENDENT, New York. Sidney Lanier is so well known that a sketch of his life seems out of order.

Bishop E. E. Hoss, whose life was sketched earlier, wrote Number 231, the first line of which is:

O God, great Father, Lord and King.

At one of the meetings of the joint Commission that brought out the Methodist Hymnal, it was realized that

2. Page 188.

3. Page 381.

THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

hymns were needed that are suitable for the baptism of children. At a later meeting the Commission learned that Bishop Hoss had written a hymn for use at the baptism by himself of children at the White River Conference at Walnut Ridge, Arkansas, in November 1903. It was printed in the Nashville Christian Advocate soon afterwards. The Commission, of course, was glad to get the hymn and to include it as Number 234.

Dr. William Edwin Evans wrote, *COME, O THOU GRACE OF GOD*, or 661. Dr. Evans was born in Baltimore, July 11, 1851, was early converted and united with the Methodist Church, and entered Randolph-Macon College in Virginia in 1869. In 1872 he joined the Baltimore Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, and was at once transferred to the Virginia Conference. After being pastor of various charges, he united with the Episcopal Church in 1892 and was for a time pastor in Birmingham, Alabama.

Dr. Charles F. Deems wrote 436, which is *I SHALL NOT WANT; IN DESERTS WILD*. He was born in Baltimore in 1820 and in 1839 settled in North Carolina and became a minister of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. He was agent of the American Bible Society for North Carolina, 1840-1841; professor of Logic and Rhetoric in the University of North Carolina, 1842-1845; professor of Chemistry in Randolph-Macon College in Virginia, 1845-1846; President of Greensboro Female College 1846-1850, and pastor of several churches in North Carolina. In 1866 Dr. Deems moved to New York and founded a small independent congregation called The Church of the Strangers, of which he was pastor until his death in 1893. He wrote a valuable life of Christ, *THE LIGHT OF THE NATIONS*. With Miss Phoebe Cary, he edited *HYMNS FOR ALL CHRISTIANS*, 1869. In New York Dr. Deems was pastor of Commodore Vanderbilt and, with Bishop H. N. McTyeire, had much to do in influencing that man of wealth to give a million dollars to Vanderbilt University, then the Central University of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Dr. Deems also founded the American Institute of Christian Philosophy, and was for years its President, as well as editor of its organ, *CHRISTIAN THOUGHT*.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Dr. Samuel Keener Cox wrote 347, which appeared in the Richmond Christian Advocate, and was not otherwise used until selected for the Methodist Hymnal. The first sentence of the hymn is:

Lord, Thou hast promised grace for grace
To all who daily seek Thy face.

Dr. Cox was born in Baltimore in 1823 and died at Harrisonburg, Virginia, in 1909, being the son of Rev. Luther J. Cox, a Methodist local preacher and a first cousin of Bishop John C. Keener of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. In 1844 he joined the Maryland Conference of the Methodist Protestant Church, which his father helped to organize. Filling several pastorates in Washington and elsewhere, Dr. Cox in 1857 became professor of Mental and Moral Philosophy in Madison College, Uniontown, Pennsylvania, and remained for a number of years, subsequently engaging in educational work in Virginia and Alabama until 1866, when he united with the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, in which he labored as educator, pastor in Baltimore, Washington, D. C., and elsewhere, and as editor of the EPISCOPAL METHODIST, the BALTIMORE CHRISTIAN ADVOCATE and the BALTIMORE AND RICHMOND CHRISTIAN ADVOCATE.

Lewis Randolph Amiss, author of 655, the first line of which is:

Jehovah, God, who dwelt of old,

was born in Tennessee in 1856, and was the first theological student to room in Wesley Hall, the building of the Theological School of Vanderbilt University, which was the first school of theology of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. He graduated from Vanderbilt in 1878, and the same year joined the Tennessee Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, filling many important pastorates.

Hymn Number 665 was written in 1904, when the author was pastor of Arlington Methodist Episcopal Church, South, in Nashville, Tennessee, at the request of one of the members of the Commission who knew of the author's poetic talents. At first the poem was not acceptable to the Commission

THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

and it made suggestions for changes, which the author complied with, causing the poem finally to be perfectly satisfactory to include in the hymnal. Mr. Amiss died the latter part of 1904 before the hymnal came from the press.

James Waddell Alexander was born at Hopewell, Virginia, in 1804. Graduating from Princeton College, he entered the ministry of the Presbyterian Church, becoming pastor in Charlotte County, Virginia, Trenton, New Jersey, and New York City. In 1848 Mr. Alexander became a professor in Princeton Theological Seminary, resigning in three years to become pastor of the Fifth Avenue Presbyterian Church in New York. He translated Bernard of Cliveau's hymn, *O SACRED HEAD, NOW WOUNDED*, which is 151 in the Methodist Hymnal.

The following additional facts are given regarding the authorship of the hymns. The Wesleys wrote 139 of them, Charles being the author of 121, John of seventeen, and Samuel of one. There are fifty-four women authors who wrote eighty-seven of the hymns. ⁴“Noteworthy is it that some of the very best hymns are by women in private and humble walks of life, quite undistinguished. Here would come in, *I LOVE TO TELL THE STORY . . . ASLEEP IN JESUS, I NEED THEE EVERY HOUR, WORK FOR THE NIGHT IS COMING. . . .* The strong hymn, *JESUS, AND SHALL IT EVER BE?* was composed by Joseph Grigg when a boy only ten. At least, so it is said, but it hardly seems possible. *MY SOUL, BE ON THY GUARD* was written by a Presbyterian pastor who was so little on his guard that he lost his position as a Presbyterian pastor by bad conduct.”

Price⁵ interestingly notes that this hymnal has a number of superlatives, among which are the following:

1. It made its first appearance with an edition of 576,000 copies, which was the largest edition of any merchantable book ever put out in America.
2. It was the first official hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.

4. OUR HYMN WRITERS, by James Mudge, Nashville Advocate, September 27, 1912.

5. Op. Cit., Page 55.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

3. It is the official hymnal for more millions of members in America and probably in the world, since these two Methodist bodies are the largest branch of Protestantism in America and since Catholics are not in the habit of using congregational singing.

CHAPTER V

THE CONTROVERSY OVER THE PRESENT METHODIST HYMNAL

It is interesting and rather astonishing to note the great controversy that has raged in the South over the latest Methodist official hymnal, which as already stated, was issued in 1905 jointly by the Methodist Episcopal Church, which is the Methodist Church of the North, and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. As a presentation of this controversy will be a fair and quite accurate portrayal of the hymnological controversy in this, the second largest denomination in the South, this presentation will be made in considerable detail and fullness. The material used in doing so, as the foot notes will show, has been collected from the theological magazine and from the general organ of that denomination. A portrayal of this controversy in the form of extracts from the articles in these periodicals follows.

Bishop E. R. Hendrix, in an article on "The Evolution of the Methodist Hymnal," defends this hymnal thus:

1 "The new hymnal is commended cordially for three things:

1. It is rich in hymns of loyalty to Christ as God.
2. It is rich in Christian experience, more so possibly than any other hymnal.

3. It is rich in martial strains... 'Forward be Our Watchword,' 'Ten Thousand Times Ten Thousand,' 'Courage Brother, Do Not Stumble,' 'O, Where Are Kings and Empires Now?' 'Strong Son of God, Immortal.' 'The Church's One Foundation,' 'The Son of God Goes Forth to War'."

In 1907 a writer in the Nashville Advocate said: 2 "Unless the pastor is ignorant of the place and potency of song in the life of any people, or not sufficiently alive to the

1. Southern Methodist Quarterly Review, Vol. 55.
2. February 22, 1907.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

well-being of Zion to in any measure merit his station, surely he himself should greatly prefer this book to any other and be prompt on occasion to make corresponding statements. True, he may ascertain here and there—as, no doubt, some have, that the representative and combined best thought of Protestantism is ignored, and a few cheap, trashy, ephemeral, jingly ditties are in it. But can a true man and minister concur in the shallow, clamorous cry for a spurious song book, even though a narrow and famous chorister, and some others, rage and rant when not seconded in their choice? How good a thing is peace? Yes, quite worth the fighting for, and never achieved till after the din and danger of hard fought battles. Peace and quiet! How far-preferable these, unless the latter to the noisy, noisome effusions which often proceed from spiritual stagnation even as the pent-up, fetid pool affords in season much creaking and many a croak."

In less than three months Rev. Lyman Jackson wrote in the same paper against the hymnal thus: ³"I think it may be conceded that the reason why Methodism was so successful in the beginning of its history was that it presented the view of the Gospel for which it stood in the language of the people, when it addressed them in language wedded to music that the people sang without special training. It does not seem to have changed nor sought to have changed the standard of musical taste of its day, though it did adopt the popular form for the service of the church.

"It does not appear, however, that the old-time tunes of early Methodism were the choral tunes to which most of the standard lyrics are now set, but folk-tunes that the people knew, or such as were built on the same pattern of musical construction. The score or two of choral settings that have come down do not prove anything to the contrary.

"That this statement is true of more recent times and of the songs our fathers sang fifty years ago and less will be even more readily conceded . . .

"There are not in our new hymnal more than twenty modern hymns that our people generally sing, while there

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

are many more new choral settings and new hymns of the Gospel-song class that are copyrighted for this publication; and not one of them is by a composer who had become known as such to any considerable number of the leaders of music in the churches for which the compilation was made.

“Scores of hymn-tunes, new and old, in our new hymnal would never be sung were it not for the fact that they are set with well-known words. Many of them will never be used in many of our congregations simply because they are not suitable—not musical in the sense of expressing within the range of the musical attainments of our people the thoughts and emotions that they are supposed to translate into song.

“Not one of the hymns (or, if you prefer, songs), that have attained a conspicuous place of usefulness in the service of the Church during the last one hundred and fifty to two hundred years has a place in this collection that we are urged to use in all of our services. It may be urged that these catchy and melodious airs are ephemeral in their character. That is undoubtedly true. Nevertheless, their ephemeral existence may prove of greater value to the church than the more prolonged existence of the hymns that are held in place by the will of the Hymnal Commission. . .”

*“In 1908 A. M. Mann also wrote against the hymnal: “Many a pastor and congregation have in the ‘Methodist Hymnal’ a problem they don’t know what to do with. I am not writing as one who understands these things, who as a master of song and poetry offers a criticism from this point of view, but as one who does not understand these things and for that great body of our people who are in the same category with myself. A vast number of our people have little or no scientific knowledge of music; there are few leaders (not many of our pastors are able to lead music), and opportunities for practice and exercise are very limited in some places. Consequently, in many places where our Methodist hymnal has been introduced it lies unused in the pews. We find that something like a score of the old hymns have been retained, and then our average country congregation is at its row’s end.

*In the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*, March 27, 1908.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

"It has become proverbial that the hymnal is rarely ever used in our revival meetings. 'Oh,' says someone, 'what a crime!' But who committed it? One of our prominent and most loyal pastors said to me at our recent conference, 'since the introduction of the new hymnal we have little or no congregational singing worthy of the name in our churches.'

"My own congregation and choir here at Manatee, Florida, will compare favorably with the average congregation in our church. We (the pastor and choir) meet every week and practice the hymns for the following Sunday. After I have spent as many as three hours in selecting hymns for a single service, the choir has been under the necessity of adopting a tune or of requesting me to change the hymn altogether. Once or twice I have held them to the original selection; and when Sunday morning came, after a brave and honest effort to sing it, choir and congregation fell down, so to speak, and failed. Moreover, I have been here only two months, and we have already sung nearly everything in the book we know and much we don't know. The result of all this is that many of our congregations are substituting the YOUNG PEOPLE'S HYMNAL NUMBER I, Charlie Tillman's REVIVAL, NUMBER I, his SUNDAY SCHOOL AND REVIVAL, and so on.

"Now I know it will be accounted almost treasonable to write this; but should one be blamed for pointing to real facts?"

In a few weeks J. H. Edwards replied to this article thus: ⁴"Brother Mann is wide of the mark when he says that something like a score of the old hymns have been retained, when we find that more than four hundred of the hymns found in the old hymnal and approximately two hundred tunes have been retained in the new . . .

"I want to say that I think we have the grandest hymnal of the age, and that all one needs to do to be convinced of the fact is to carefully and prayerfully study it, learn it, learn its songs and sing them.

"As to the evils that afflict us at this point, they are too many to be mentioned in this article. But as a remedy, I

4. Ibid.

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

would suggest that as Methodists we buy and use the hymnal in our homes, encourage our children and young people to use it, and take it to church with them when they go. I believe it ought to be used in all our services, in the Sunday Schools and in the Epworth Leagues. If this were faithfully and persistently done, our children and young people would soon come to know and sing these songs."

In 1909 Dr. G. B. Winton, at that time editor of the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE* and now Professor in Vanderbilt University, in an editorial entitled, *THE HYMNAL AGAIN*, said in defense of it: ⁵"We insist that our new Methodist Hymnal is too good a book not to be diligently, studiously and intelligently used. Many of our pastors, some of them pastors of our leading churches, are not giving the book a fair chance. The prayer meeting and often the other services are denied the benefit of new, inspiring, helpful hymns; and the old songs, 'I Need Thee Every Hour,' 'Saviour More Than Life to Me,' 'Come Thou Fount of Every Blessing' . . . and others like them are pressed into service every week because they are familiar. Well, they ought to be familiar by this time; there is great danger that they will become commonplace. Many ministers do not use more than twenty-five hymns a year in all their services. In fact, some have done on less than fifty hymns in their entire ministerial life. Every pastor should have a member of his congregation who should mark the hymnal for a year that he may see the narrow circle of his hymn acquaintance and come to realize the monotony of his service in song. The people are not given an opportunity to learn the great hymns of Christendom and to broaden their experience by the use of new hymns. It is much easier to sing the old familiar tunes . . . But growth comes by knowledge, and the pastor is shepherd of the songs of his people as well as for the truth in other forms. The music may not be pleasing at first, but that may be due to a lack of musical taste which comes often only after training. *THE METHODIST HYMNAL* is regarded by all musical critics and by all persons versed in Hymnology as the best song book which the Methodist Church has ever issued. It will have no successor for twenty-five years.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Why not use it thoroughly and intelligently and religiously to-day?"

A strong defense of the latest METHODIST HYMNAL was made the last of that same year by ⁶Mr. John I. Chilton, who contended: "THE METHODIST HYMNAL is a great book from any point of view. The text is the gold of sacred poetry tried in the fire of time; the arrangement is admirable; the topography is clear-cut and accurate; but to my mind, above all except the meaning of the words themselves is the artistic merit and power of the music. Ours is a volume which contains the best of all the melodies which have cheered, comforted and inspired the hearts of Christians in all ages. In every land under the sun there swell the airs we sing in our hymnal, and 'Abide With Me' is as sweet in the twilight of far-off China as it is in America or England. When we sing the Gregorian numbers it is likely that we are using the same music which rose from the lips of the worshipers in the temple before the ark, where dwelt the presence of Jehovah. When we use Thomas Purcell and Handel, we sing tunes which were played upon the first pipe organs ever built. With the hymns of such composers as Lowell Mason, Rev. John B. Dykes, Joseph Barnby and Sir Arthur Sullivan, whose fame is forever secure as writers of sacred music, are combined the grandest and most exquisite themes of the masters, as lofty as Beethoven, Mozart, Mendelssohn and Von Weber, the men who are the high priests and princes in the world of melody.

"Our people should learn to sing all the tunes in the book. There is not an unmelodious one among them. The ones that are old and familiar are good, and will be used, but there are many others equally as simple and beautiful which are seldom heard in our churches."

In 1910 Rev. P. O. Lowry wrote an article on THE VALUE AND USE OF THE METHODIST HYMNAL, in which he said: ⁷"Our hymn book meets every need. However gifted may be the pastor, the people are entitled to a part in the worship. . . Because the tunes are hard is nothing against it. The same is true of mathematics. There can possibly be no develop-

6. Ibid: December 31, 1909.

7. NASHVILLE ADVOCATE, July 6, 1910.

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

ment in music, as in anything else, when the aim is simply to get something easy which when gotten is worthless. Contrast Mendelssohn's *Consolation* (Hymn 43) with some of our light modern songs, that were written just to go in a book to sell, sacred ragtime. The latter is the easiest, and, if left to the choice of some of our girl organists or country singing-school teachers, would be the choice. But just as effect follows cause, the light, flippant, fleeting song will produce a character described in like terms. But to produce reverence and aspiration, the music must be reverent and inspiring...

"Of no less importance than the music is the theology of our hymns. They sing of the being and perfection of God, of the gift of his love and of the coming of the comforter. They sound the bugle call of the Gospel, and point the penitent to the sinner's friend. They comfort us by the open grave and point to the house not made with hands, eternal in the heavens...

"Our hymn book also fills an important part in making worship uniform. Any pastor, North or South, any Superintendent of Sunday School or Womans' Missionary Society President or League President or prayer meeting leader can have before him the hymns used by Methodist mothers back at home in any Methodist congregation and the leader of any service."

Then Mr. Lowry enumerates and discusses three things which he considers necessary for the best use of the hymnal. They are: 1. "The pastor should know music and be a student of music." By this he does not mean that the pastor should know music as an expert, but that he should know the best of hymns and tunes, and, knowing them, he should select them for his service, and not let the choir or the organist do so. 2. "It is necessary to have a teachable and aggressive choir of good taste." 3. "The congregation likewise has its part in making effective our hymns... They should be learners of all that the church utilizes in her services of worship." Other suggestions for the best use of the hymnal are that the congregation, including the children, be supplied with them, that hymns be selected appropriately, and the hymnal be used "everywhere and at all times."

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

In 1911 ⁸I. G. McCann wrote an article with the title, *MUSIC IN THE COUNTRY CHURCH*, in which he defended the hymnal. He said: "I wish to call attention to the neglect of the Methodist Hymnal in the country charges. Numbers of our best country charges are being imposed upon by either careless, or, from the standpoint of music, ignorant pastors, who have substituted for the great hymn book of our church the cheap, florid and insipid revival tunes. . .

"Though some of our best songs are generally contained in these revival books, still there is no question but that they are usually ignored. The tunes are generally a cross between a jig and modern ragtime. A young lady told me recently that in the college which she attended they were not permitted to dance or play 'rags,' and that they were, therefore, led to use the revival tunes for waltz purposes. A splendid recommendation for such, isn't it? But this isn't the sole or chief objection. A little practice of these tunes makes tragically inaccurate the singing of a great hymn, and destroys one's taste for good music and wholesome sentiment. . .

"Methodism has provided a hymnal that should be the pride of every church member. Many of its songs are mellow with years and rich in associations. They are the work of devout scholars, and not simply of enthusiasts. Moreover, we rejoice in the liberal spirit of the joint commission which has given us such a non-sectarian hymnal. As a Presbyterian said to me: 'You couldn't help having a good hymnal, for you borrowed so many of our prettiest songs.' And this is true not only of the Presbyterian Church; for our Commission borrowed the best from all the sources without thought of sectional, credal or sectarian lines. . ."

The sharpest debate in the South over the present Methodist Hymnal occurred in 1913 and began with the article "What is Wrong With The Methodist Hymnal?" by John M. Moore, D. D., which appeared in the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*. He was then one of the best known and most influential Methodist preachers of the South. He had been pastor of the largest churches in Texas and Missouri. At that time he was General Secretary of the Board of Home

8. Ibid: April 7.

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

Missions of that denomination. That office had required him to travel extensively and he was before the eyes of his church. In 1918 he was elected bishop. Naturally, an article with the above title and of the character which it possessed and by such a man was calculated to create interest, if not controversy. The article follows:

“Recently a college lad was heard to speak slightly of Trigonometry and Mathematics in general, saying that it was hard, uninteresting, and, so far as he was concerned, without value. A college student several years ago, who is now Professor of Mathematics, was persuaded to read Milton’s *PARADISE LOST*. When asked upon returning the book what he thought of it, he said that it was quite interesting, but so far as he could see, it did not prove anything. The story is told of a newly rich couple who went to an art store to purchase some ornaments for their new palatial home, and were shown some small but exquisite paintings, which were unsatisfactory. Before leaving, however, they bought from the wily salesman some showy cromos with thrillingly realistic scenes in highly decorated frames. A certain first-class business man declared that he was thoroughly bored recently by a program of symphonies, e’tudes and rhapsodies played by a world-renowned pianist, but he just as thoroughly enjoyed the singing of the minstrels.

“What is wrong with Mathematics that college students do not enjoy it? What is wrong with Milton, Shakespeare, Tennyson, Browning that some people find no pleasure in them? What is wrong with the works of Raphael, Michelangelo, Rubens, Reynolds and Rembrandt that any tourist would return from them to realistic photographs? What is wrong with the superb compositions of Beethoven, Chopin, Mozart, Rubenstein and Wagner that they have no message in music to vast multitudes of well-meaning people? It is too late to discredit mathematics, the masters in literature, art and music by declaring one’s lack of appreciation for them; but in this day of broad culture and large opportunity one is liable to discredit one’s self by one’s failure to rightly value them. Ignorance is never inspiring, limitations are never

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

edifying, and inability to enjoy life's vast gifts can never be eulogized . . .

"Southern Methodism does not reflect any credit upon herself by her criticism nor neglect of THE METHODIST HYMNAL. It has been recognized as being in the class of the C. H. C. HYMNAL, LANDES DOMINII, IN EXCELSIS, THE HYMNAL (Presbyterian), and THE METHODIST HYMN BOOK of the Wesleyan Church. . . .

"How poorly our people use this great book! . . . Of the 19,600 congregations of Southern Methodism there is serious doubt that more than one-fifth use fifty tunes of the HYMN Book. Preachers from year to year use the same limited number of well-worn, familiar tunes and make little or no effort to educate the people in the great hymns of Christianity. Many preachers will say: 'The people do not know the hymns; the choir cannot sing them; the organist cannot play them.' Is anyone surprised? Who has ever tried to teach them?"

Then the Sunday Schools are blamed for not creating an appreciation of high type music and for using ragtime often. Then Bishop Moore continued:

"THE METHODIST HYMNAL should not be a sealed book. Of its 556 tunes, 193 were in the old HYMN AND TUNE Book. Why are these not familiar? It is true that the HYMN AND TUNE Book, with its 842 hymns had only 396 tunes; while the METHODIST HYMNAL with its 717 hymns has 556 tunes, the HYMNAL has 363 tunes that were not in the old book. . . .

"What is wrong with the METHODIST HYMNAL? The same that is wrong with Milton, Beethoven, and Raphael. It has cultural value. It is a medium of literary, musical and religious culture. . . . The great need is a set purpose on the part of ministers and people to master the book. . . .

"How can the HYMNAL be made popular? Teach it and use it. The preacher, and not the choir, should select the hymns to be used. Seldom, if at all, should a hymn be divorced from the tune to which it is set and used with an old tune. A hymn should be used continually until it becomes familiar. Two hymns learned each week would mean familiarity with the Hymnal very soon. The singing school should have as important a place in the church as the Bible

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

School. Organized Bible classes are no more needed than organized singing classes. A social club or a literary club could spend an entire season with the Hymnal and its literature as its chief study."

This article appeared in the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE* on July 4, and the August 1 issue had a reply to it by H. B. Smith that was also headed *WHAT IS WRONG WITH THE METHODIST HYMNAL?* in which it was contended that the arrangement of the tunes was the cause of the hymnal's unpopularity, since the tunes should be always with the hymns, which was not often the case.

On August 8 Bishop Moore's defense received a second attack, which was also entitled, *WHAT IS WRONG WITH THE METHODIST HYMNAL?* This was by Rev. J. F. Clarke. He said that there were three defects in the Hymnal:

"1. An over-proportion of antique, worthless and unpopular music. . . These tunes (new ones) came from the Methodist Episcopal Church for the most part; and while they may suit well the sluggish, thick-blooded temperament of our brethren of the North, they are wholly unsatisfactory to the quick, hot-blooded temperament of our Southern people, and hence will never become popular with our people.

"2. THE HYMNAL is too bulky for popular use. It is almost twice as large as necessary. . . .

"3. The price is too high. It is not more than it costs to publish it and to distribute it, perhaps. But if the present HYMNAL can't be sold for less, why not print it in a form and upon such material as the publishing house could sell for less? . . . The present publishing house is and has been a death blow to hymn-and-tune singing in the Methodist Church for seven years . . ."

The next steps in this controversy consisted of replies to Clarke's article by Bishop Moore and Dr. A. J. Lamar. Dr. Lamar was and is the senior agent of the Southern Methodist Publishing House, and in his reply asked for a remedy of the hymnal situation. Whereupon Clarke on September 26 made these suggestions¹⁰. "1. Withdraw from the compact with the Northern Church, or issue another book;" "2. The appointment of a commission of six, by the General Conference, of competent judges who

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

know the conditions of the church to which add the publishing agents, as they know conditions." However, the members of the commission that brought out the present hymnal should not be on the new commission. In discussing this point, Mr. Clarke reverts to his objection in a former article to the high price of the hymnal, saying, as he refers to Dr. Lamar's reply to it, "Dr. Lamar says, 'The agents are powerless.' He proves his statements by reminding us that the price is small considering the cost of production. Buying the right to use copyright hymns, paying the expenses of the many meetings of the Commission, the salaries of the editors and the actual cost of manufacturing the book ran the cost up to such a figure that the present price leaves but a very small margin of profit." Then Mr. Clarke says that the large size of the Commission caused its great cost, and re-enters his plea for a cheap book, this time advocating a twenty-five cent word book in paper binding and a thirty-five or forty cent book in cloth. "3. The size should be reduced, as thereby it would become more popular."

But another article in this dispute under the title, **WHAT IS WRONG WITH THE METHODIST HYMNAL?** is yet to come. This one is by Rev. D. H. Tuttle and runs: ¹⁰"The objection to its arrangement made by Brother Smith I have heard made by others, and is worthy of consideration by a committee on hymnal revision and improvement that ought to be appointed by our next General Conference. The fact, as Dr. Moore put it, and I think his estimate is near the truth, that not more than one-fifth of the 9,600 churches of Southern Methodism use above fifty tunes of the HYMNAL reveals an urgent and immediate demand that something be done that will put into the hands of our people a hymnal that will at least reverse the above order by placing the one-fifth on the side of the hymnal's popularity. On my account, I will name two external defects in our present hymnal. First it is not used in the educational or training departments of our church—the Sunday Schools and Epworth Leagues. Why not reduce the HYMNAL in size and price and use the same hymnal in both Sunday School and general worship? . . . Can we even hope to have a popular hymnal that is a stranger

¹⁰. Ibid: 1913.

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

to the childhood and youth of the church? Why not train up the children in the way they should go in the matter of church music as in other things? The Sunday School is the place to educate our people in the art of the best sacred songs, as against the easily-caught-by-ear ragtime music of cheap books... Secondly, our hymnal is being hurt in the house of its friends, our publishing house being particeps criminis and some of our connectional men accessories before and after the fact. Our kingdom in the matter of music is divided against itself. 'How is this,' you ask? My answer is that by having a common hymnal for all our Sunday Schools that field has been left an easy victim for all self-appointed makers of song books, whose main motive is, I fear, financial gain rather than the spiritual good of the Church. Our publishing agents open the columns of the Advocate and the Sunday School literature to advertise the song books of some of these. In the same issue of the Advocate that contains Dr. Moore's article we see one of the 'ads' in which the publisher states that his song book is being used in six hundred churches. Again, is it best for the publishing and connectional officers to get out so many different editions of song books in so rapid succession? 'Young Peoples' Hymnal Numbers 1, 2 and 3,' 'Revival Praises,' 'Minister of Song,' etc., and now 'Diadems' are being offered. Pardon me, but is all this for the glory of God or the profit of men?"

This ends this memorable dispute begun by Bishop Moore, but it did not end the attacks upon the **METHODIST HYMNAL**, though for a while none seems to have been made.

In 1919 O. C. Severs took up again the charge that the Hymnal was badly arranged. He wrote, "We have the greatest and most popular collection of songs put up in the most inconvenient and unpopular form. I have heard that a cow can look north with one eye and south with the other at the same time, but it has not been my lot to find a human being yet who can do it, not even our best Methodist choirs. And they will have to do that stunt if they read words and music at the same time from our present hymnal. They may even have to read on several pages at once. Such is the composition of the book all through, a sacrifice of utility

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

to art or economy. Consequently, most of our churches are using the smaller and cheaper song books put up with words and music together."

Rev. H. J. Land in 1928¹¹ entered a plea for a new hymnal based on these grounds: "Methodists have always been noted for congregational singing. The relation of singing to worship is peculiarly stressed in the Book of Discipline. The equipment of the pioneer preacher may have included little beside the Bible, hymn book and Discipline, but it always included these. Methodists have always obeyed the Psalmist's injunction. 'Let us come into His presence with singing,' and to them in no small degree is the Christian world indebted for the introduction of beautiful harmony and sweet melody into worship. . . .

"Sustaining this relation to sacred music as do the Methodists, is it not a little disconcerting and somewhat contradictory that the standard Hymnal of their church should be called a 'Joint Hymnal' and that twenty-two years of its use should have had for principal results the silencing of congregational singing?

"The standard Hymnal of our church is not standard when it omits 'Home, Sweet Home,' 'Fading, Still Fading,' 'Ninety and Nine,' 'Only Waiting,' 'Balm in Gilead,' 'Whiter Than Snow,' 'Near the Cross,' 'I Hear Thy Welcome Voice,' 'Footsteps of Jesus,' 'Revive Us Again,' 'Draw Me Nearer,' 'Sweet Bye and Bye,' 'Home of the Soul,' 'Crowning Day,' 'The Morning Flowers,' and 'Jesus, My Saviour, Brother, Friend.'

"All these and fully fifteen others equally dear to young and old are omitted from the standard Hymnal."

Next there is the charge against the inclusion of a number of new tunes on the grounds that no one wants a new tune as long as an old one can be used. There is also this protest: "Hymns and tunes by such authors as Harriet Beecher Stowe, Henry Smart, Oliver Wendell Holmes, Josiah G. Holland, K. P. Harrington, Peter Lutkin, J. P. Harding, etc., abound in the more prominent places, twenty-seven tunes being composed by one or the other of the editors, both of whom were Northern men in residence. Forty-three hymns

11. Ibid: July 27.

CONTROVERSY OVER METHODIST HYMNAL

or tunes are copyrighted by the Methodist Episcopal Publishing House or by Peter Lutkin, and only eighteen bear the copyright mark of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, the most of them very obscure. Fully one hundred of the hymns are of no value to the book, and scarcely more than one hundred are familiar to the most musically inclined congregation. The arrangement of the words and music separately tends to discourage learning new tunes, it being difficult to attempt to train a choir for this reason. If no reason but this existed, it is enough to demand a new hymnal.

"The standard hymns of the church are rapidly becoming impossible ditties, such as 'I Was Sinking Deep in Sin,' 'The Touch of His Hand,' 'High on the Tree Tops,' 'I Came to the Garden Alone,' and the number will increase if we do not get a new hymnal. No need of the church is greater. He who writes the songs of a people need care little for the maker of their laws.

"The Joint Hymnal. And yet if we should chance to procure some copies from the Methodist Episcopal Publishers we soon discover it is not a joint hymnal. The Psalter of these two books is utterly unlike. The proper use of the hymnal sometimes calls for the use of the Ritual. Here again they differ.

"The unifying purpose of the book is largely lost if a visitor from the other church sees nothing familiar in the two books and finds so much that is new and strange.

"Moreover, the possibility of interdenominational mutuality is materially diminished when omissions, substitutions, and innovations are manifestly sectarian in character and purpose...

"Another point worthy of consideration is that our hymnal suffers in comparison with the hymnals of other denominations, particularly the PILGRIM HYMNAL of the Congregational Church, the hymnal of the Southern Presbyterian Church, the United Brethren, etc."

Such is the controversy that has been carried on regarding the present Methodist Hymnal. It does seem as though nothing has been left unsaid on either side.

CHAPTER VI

MISCELLANEOUS

THE DISCIPLES OF CHRIST

The Disciples of Christ trace their origin, on the one hand, to the Kentucky Revival. Barton W. Stone, one of its Presbyterian leaders, organized in 1804 a body without a creed, called *Christians*. On the other hand, they trace their origin to Alexander Campbell, who organized non-sectarian congregations, then joined successively the Red-stone and the Mahoning Baptist Associations, and finally united in 1827 with the followers of Stone to form a church with no creed but the Scriptures.

1“Campbell impressed his personality upon the hymnody as upon everything else connected with the Disciples. He objected, not only to the doctrines of the current hymn books, but also to the fact that they were doctrinal. They are, he said, ‘in general a collection of everything preached in the range of the people who adopt them. They are our creed in meter; yet in common life men are not disposed to sing their opinions, but love songs, the praises of heroes, and the triumphs of wars. Christians are the same men sanctified; let the love of God, the praises of the character and achievements of the Captain of their salvation animate their hymns’.”

But Dr. Benson states ²that Campbell could not carry out this principle, which meant little more than discrimination in using hymns of other churches; and in May, 1828, he brought out a little book of 125 hymns which was both preceded and followed by short treatises on Psalmody and Prayer.

Stone and John T. Johnson had also produced a hymn book, which some people preferred to Campbell’s book. Therefore, Campbell suggested that the two books be

1. L. F. Benson, *THE ENGLISH HYMN; ITS DEVELOPMENT AND USE*, Page 370.
Quoted by permission of Doubleday, Doran & Company.

2. *Ibid*: Page 370.

MISCELLANEOUS

combined into one, which was done, resulting in the appearance of *PSALMS, HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS, Original and Selected; Compiled by A. Campbell, W. Scott, B. W. Stone and J. T. Johnson, Bethany, Virginia, 1834*. This book reached a seventh edition by 1841 and in 1851 was enlarged.

In 1864 Campbell lost control of the hymody of his people, and it passed into the hands of the American Christian Missionary Society, which made a new survey of hymn books in general and brought out a huge new book.

³THE LUTHERANS

In 1816 Paul Henkel, pastor of the Lutheran Church at New Market, Virginia, published a hymn book that was more churchly than any of its predecessors in his denomination. Its full title was, *CHURCH HYMN BOOK, Consisting of Newly Composed Hymns, with an Addition of Hymns and Psalms, from Other Authors, Carefully Adapted to the Use of Public Worship and Many Other Occasions*. It was published at New Market by Solomon Henkel, and had 437 hymns, followed by a complete metrical Psalter from Watts and others. The first part was *A HYMNAL COMPANION TO THE LITURGY*, and had hymns adapted to the Gospel and Epistle for the whole ecclesiastical year and for various occasions and church offices. Henkel wrote a large percentage of the hymns, which consisted merely of didactic prose broken into short phrases that served as lines of verse.

The Henkels and their followers broke away from the Synod of North Carolina and in 1820 founded the new Synod of Tennessee, which had a new and enlarged edition of Henkel's book prepared by his son, Ambrose. This book had 300 of Henkel's hymns, with eleven more by members of his family. Most of the rest are from Watts, Charles Wesley and the writers of the Evangelical Revival. A third edition, with minor changes, came out in 1850, and a fourth with additions in 1857. However, it probably was used little outside of the boundaries of the Synod and exerted little influence upon Lutheran Hymnody in general.

3. Ibid: 368.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

*THE MENNONITES

Some of the early settlers of the United States were Mennonites. Though still not numerous, they are divided into about a dozen branches, some of which speak only German. Singing in English, even by the parent body, began as late as 1859, when there appeared *A COLLECTION OF PSALMS, HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS; Suited to Various Occasions . . . of the Church; By a Committee of Mennonites. Mountain Valley, Virginia. Fourth Edition, with an Appendix of German Hymns.* The hymns, with the exception of those for feet washing, were from the hymn books of the day.

THE MORAVIANS

At an early date the Moravians settled at Salem, now Winston-Salem, North Carolina, and since then it has been the center of their life in the South. They have always emphasized church music. Being a conservative people of German extraction, they have been slow to break with their native language. It is not surprising, therefore, that there are in the library of the University of North Carolina seventeen small books, each containing a song for a Moravian festival at Winston-Salem, with in most instances only a part of each song in English for the children. However, a few have also verses in English for the congregation. The oldest of these books is dated 1732 and the latest 1867.

HYMNS OF THE SOCIAL GOSPEL

With the recent emphasis upon the social message of the Gospel, pastors, choir directors and other religious workers have often found the hymnals at their command lacking in hymns suitable for many subjects and occasions. For this reason recent hymnals paying considerable attention to the social phases of the Gospel, among which are the books of Augustine Smith and the *HYMNS OF THE SOCIAL AWAKENING*, are being used to a limited extent by Southern religious workers.

4. Ibid: Page 369.

MISCELLANEOUS

Dr. W. Russell Bowie, of Virginia, and for a number of years rector of St. Paul's Episcopal Church, Richmond, but for the last few years rector of Grace Episcopal Church, New York, has written several hymns of this type. In a personal letter he states: "The various hymns I have written in recent years were, for the most part, written at the request of various editors of hymn books for hymns on particular themes, as a rule hymns to emphasize the message of the Social Gospel of the Kingdom of God. That was true with the hymns, *O Holy City Seen of John* and *Lovely to the Outward Eye*, which were written first for the HYMNS OF THE KINGDOM, edited by Dr. Henry Sloane Coffin. Two others, *God of the Nations* and *Splendor of the Thoughts of God*, were written for HYMNS OF THE SOCIAL AWAKENING, edited by Mrs. Mabel Barrows Mussey."

The following, because of their connection with famous authors of well-known hymns, are deemed to be in order at the end of this chapter:

*LINES TO WILLIAM DARLINGTON A DEAF AND DUMB BOY

By
FRANCIS SCOTT KEY

The dumb shall speak and the deaf shall hear
In the brighter days to come,
When they've passed through the troubles and trials of life
To a higher and happier home.

They shall hear the trumpets fearful blast,
And the crash of the rending tomb,
And the sinner's cry of agony
As he wakes to his dreaded gloom.

And the conqueror's shout, and the ransomed's song
On their open ears shall fall,
And the tongue of the dumb in the chorus of praise
Shall be louder and higher than all.

Oh! Thou whose still voice can need no ear,
To the heart its message to bear,
Who cans't hear the muttered reply of the heart
As it glows in the fervor of prayer;

4. From the SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN, July 28, 1848.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Speak in Thy pity and power to these,
Who only Thee can hear,
And bend to the ease of their speaking hearts
Thine ever-listening ear.

5 AN INCIDENT CONCERNING HOME, SWEET HOME

“In reading a late number of the HOME JOURNAL, I saw a touching notice of John Howard Payne, the author of HOME, SWEET HOME, and it recalled an incident which may interest your readers. In the winter of 1833 or 1834 I was dining in London with an American lady, the wife of an eminent banker. During my visit, Mr Payne called and presented her with a copy of HOME, SWEET HOME set to music with two additional verses addressed to her. I enclose them for you to print, if you see fit, without mentioning my name. I doubt very much whether the lady to whom they were addressed kept a copy of them:

To us, in despite of the absence of years,
How sweet the remembrance of home still appears!
From allurements abroad, which but flatter the eye,
The unsatisfied heart turns, and says, with a sigh,
Home, home, sweet, sweet home!
There's no place like home!
There's no place like home!

Your exile is blest with all fate can bestow,
But mine has been checkered into many a woe.
Yet, though different our fortunes, our thoughts are the same,
And both, as we think of Columbia, exclaim,
Home, home, sweet, sweet home!
There's no place like home!
There's no place like home!

The author of this article contended that Mr. Payne's woes were to a great extent brought about by financial difficulties—indeed even by almost dire poverty. However, in the Southern Churchman about this same period there appeared a denial of the report that he was in poverty while residing in London, the author asserting that he knew that Mr. Payne had an income of \$2,000 a year.

BOOK II

THE GOSPEL HYMNS IN
THE SOUTH

CHAPTER VII

CIRCULATION OF THE GOSPEL HYMN

As one begins to investigate the extent of the circulation of the Gospel hymns and hymns of a kindred type, one is amazed at the enormous figures encountered. This survey, the results of which follow, makes no pretense to exhaustiveness. It is not complete. There were numerous clues, which if circumstances had permitted following out, would have revealed much more amazing results. No one knows, and perhaps can know, how many Gospel hymns circulate in the South or in the United States.

Three kinds of evidence are here offered which indicate the extent of this enterprise. One consists of the figures submitted by publishers regarding their sales. A second is letters from companies containing general statements about their sales. The third is a study of the advertisements of publishers. The second and third will be presented together, but the first separately.

One company putting out such books was kind enough to submit a report of its work. It began in 1909 and put on the market between then and November, 1928, a period of seventeen years, twenty-one books which reached the following circulation:

ORDER OF PUBLICATION	YEAR OF PUBLICATION	EXTENT OF CIRCULATION	IN ORDER OF EXTENT OF CIRCULATION
1	1909	374,436	10
2	1911	726,038	2
3	1913	680,943	4
4	1915	463,391	8
5	1916	115,000	17
6	1917	694,000	3
7	1918	812,489	1
8	1921 (male quartettes)	8,000	..
9	1921	322,615	12
10	1922	345,000	11
11	1922	307,000	13
12	1922	227,213	15
13	1922	87,000	18

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

ORDER OF PUBLICATION	YEAR OF PUBLICATION	EXTENT OF CIRCULATION	IN ORDER OF EXTENT OF CIRCULATION
14	1923	50,000	19
15	1924	596,675	5
16	1925 (male choir)	20,000	..
17	1925	589,825	6
18	1926	555,605	7
19	1927	445,343	9
20	1928	210,000	16
21	1928	269,300	14
TOTAL		7,699,873	

These figures reveal that one of the books enjoyed a circulation that went beyond three-fourths of a million, that a second fell only a little below it, and that each of five more exceeded a half million.

Another publisher submitted a report of his business in hymn books, nearly all of which came primarily within the classification of Gospel hymn books. This company issued its first hymnal in 1874 and its last in 1923, and published, during that period of forty-nine years, fifty-nine hymnals of all kinds, and these have reached a circulation of 2,086,440. This house estimates that about twenty-five per cent of its sales have been in Southern states. This gives a circulation of 521,610 copies in the South. Eight of these hymnals are still on the market. The succeeding table lists only the books of this company, whose sales have amounted to 10,000 or more copies in Southern territory:

DATE OF PUBLICATION	EXTENT OF CIRCULATION	IN ORDER OF EXTENT OF CIRCULATION IN THE SOUTH
1906	180,000—60,000	
1874	178,000—60,000	{ 1
1896	104,000—25,000	2
1897	92,050—23,000	3
1876	60,000—21,000	4
1879	60,000—20,000	5
1882	65,550—15,000	
1898	57,000—15,000	{ 6
1912	47,500—15,000	
1896	45,000—15,000	

CIRCULATION OF THE GOSPEL HYMN

DATE OF PUBLICATION	EXTENT OF CIRCULATION	IN ORDER OF EXTENT OF CIRCULATION IN THE SOUTH
1898	70,375—14,000	
1887	52,500—14,000	7
1890	62,000—12,000	
1898	62,000—12,000	8
1915	37,600—12,000	
1908	55,000—10,000	
1895	51,000—10,000	9
1881	30,600—10,000	

A third company gave the list of its books, omitting the dates of publication, but stating that its sales in the South have been small. A fourth publisher also omitted the year of publication but reported the circulation of his books for 1927, and estimated that five percent. of them are sold in Southern states. Their figures are:

COMPANY NUMBER III		COMPANY NUMBER IV	
TOTAL OUTPUT	SALES IN THE SOUTH	1927 OUTPUT	SALES IN THE SOUTH
372,263	SMALL	50,000	570
63,190	"	12,500	2,500
58,206	"	5,000	625
405,645	"	4,000	250
7,205	"	200
20,098	"
13,092	"
23,073	"

Next will be considered the circulation of Gospel hymns in the South as indicated by information contained in letters from the publishers and their advertisements. The Ruebush-Kieffer Company, of Dayton, Virginia, in a letter stated that its first book, which was published in 1816, ran through nineteen editions. It also put out the TEMPLE STAR in 1877 which had a sale of over a million, while a third nearly reached the million mark, and a fourth mounted to about 500,000. This company in the Memorial number (August, 1908) advertised in its magazine, MUSICAL MILLION, fifteen books, and in doing so gave the following information about six of them:

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

IN ORDER OF EXTENT OF SALES	TOTAL SALES 1908	
1	1,500,000	
2	150,000	
3	35,000	During first four months after publication.
4	33,798	During the two previous seasons.
5	30,000	Then issued. Another edition then in the press.
6	25,000	Since April 15 of that year. Another edition in the press; and the advertisement also states, "We mean to sell 50,000 copies this season."

Another publisher thinks a conservative estimate of the sales of all his books in Southern states is about a half million copies. Still another one considered its business in the South amounts to 10,000 copies of all its books each year. A circular of this company, dated October, 1928, advertised twenty different books which it then offered for sale. Re-organization prevented one firm from giving much information. However, it stated that reports say that one of its books obtained a sale of over two million copies. It also gave the following figures concerning books it is now selling: in 1927 one book made a record of seventeen hundred sales, a second of sixteen hundred, a third of nine hundred, and since March, 1928, a fourth of five hundred. This company thinks that probably twenty-five percent of its books go to the South. Its recent circular advertises six books that are primarily of the nature of revival books. Circulars of other companies, all of which have a considerable patronage in the South, advertise for their respective companies: twenty-three books, sixteen books, twelve books and ten books. The answers of several of these companies to a letter that asked for a report of their sales also reveals the enormous proportions to which the traffic in Gospel and kindred books has grown. Extracts from some of these letters follow:

One company said: "This firm is now nearly sixty years old and has sold millions of song books. You do not seem to comprehend the clerical work it would take to answer your questions, which we cannot undertake."

1. This figure does not conflict with a former figure for this book since this one refers to a much earlier date.

CIRCULATION OF THE GOSPEL HYMN

To like effect is this paragraph from the letter of another firm: "I am sure you do not realize that _____ Brothers have been publishing music, and our Mr. _____ has been writing hymns for more than forty years, and we believe has written more Gospel hymns and sacred music than any other writer living or dead. His songs have been published in every language and tongue known and his books sold in every country on the globe, having been translated into many different languages. In fact, his songs have been sung around the world."

A widow, now in charge of a Southern company, which her husband directed during his life, wrote: "During my husband's lifetime he edited fifty different books. . . . I took up the work, and after twenty years at his side the work was not as hard as one would imagine, with plenty of manuscript waiting for plate making. I brought out the book I am sending you as a memorial, then continued. . . . from number four, which number he brought out the year he passed away, to number twelve, the new song book for 1928."

In a second letter she also wrote: "During Mr. _____ lifetime we often sold as many as a hundred thousand copies of a book the year it came out, but competition was less keen then, and we employed more help. Now I sell from twenty to thirty thousand books a year. I mean of one kind. As the book gets old, it sells in less numbers. We ship them into almost every state in the union, and into Mexico and Canada."

In making this study of Gospel and Revival Hymns, books seen in the Southern states were examined that were published by forty companies located in the South, in New York, Philadelphia, Chicago and, perhaps, Boston. A letter was sent to all of them, as well as to the twelve publishers of other kinds of hymn books that go into the South, requesting, among other things, the names, dates of publication and extent of circulation of all their books. Eighteen answered, some giving exactly the information desired, and all giving valuable facts. Second and third requests were sent all the others, except three or four whose letters had been returned because the firms had been discontinued.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

The facts given so far in this chapter came from these eighteen replies and from circulars these companies sent. Hence, as already stated, this survey is by no means complete and, probably, cannot be complete, since it must enter the domain of a person's private business, and such an intrusion many people resent, as did a few of these publishers. However, sufficient facts and figures are here set forth to prove that the making and selling of Gospel and kindred hymns constitute a huge enterprise.

CHAPTER VIII

SINGING SCHOOLS

Not by any means least in developing this huge enterprise is the singing school which used to be prevalent in the South, and which still has not entirely gone out of existence. Only a few weeks ago a singing-school teacher sent out the following advertisement on the back of a postal card:

“I have been in the Sacred Song work for about forty years. Have heard and seen many things that were ridiculous musically.

“If you would have better singing in your Church and Sunday School, I would advise you to have at least one term of Singing School taught in your community each year. Consider well the qualifications of the teacher you employ. He should have the spiritual interest of Sacred Songs at heart, as well as to know music theory and how to teach it.

“My price for teaching Singing Schools is \$5.00 a day, Normal Schools \$7.50 a day, with any number of pupils in the class. The school to furnish board free to teachers.

“You should at least have one ten-day term held in your community. Write for engagements.”

On the address side of the card is the announcement that he is associate publisher to a firm putting out hymn books, followed by a list of special prices on books.

To-day in some sections in Western North Carolina Sunday Schools and churches have one-day singing schools, which frequently meet on the fifth Sunday. Great preparation is made for these meets and much practicing is done in getting ready for them. They are notable events in the lives of rural people. Perhaps no better account can be given of singing schools and their relation to the spread of the Gospel and revival hymns than that found in the biographical essay by Weldon T. Myers, entitled “ALDINE S. KIEFFER, the VALLEY POET, and HIS WORK.” “This essay was awarded in June, 1908, the LINDON KENT MEMORIAL

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

PRIZE offered by the School of ENGLISH LITERATURE of the UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA for the best biographical and critical sketch of some hitherto unexploited Virginia author. Contestants for the prize were limited to University students.... The author is a native of Rockingham County, Virginia." Extracts from it follow:

"In the quiet little town of Dayton, Rockingham County, Virginia, there is a business enterprise of wider patronage and influence than one would expect to find in a country place of a thousand inhabitants. I refer to the publishing house of the Ruebush-Kieffer Company, which from a small beginning of forty years ago has grown to rank as the leading publishers in the South. Their books are distributed in every state in the Union, and also in Canada. In the South, of course, their name is best known, and their influence most decided. Of popular music, music I mean, used and appreciated particularly by the common people and the rural classes, the Ruebush-Kieffer Company have been the liveliest promoters. They were among the first advocates of the popular musical notation called shaped or character notes, and they have continued to the present day to be the missionary center of that system, which never gained headway in the cities or among the more highly educated classes, but which has made steady, even rapid, progress among the country people and holds its own to-day more firmly than ever.

"In April, 1859, Aldine S. Kieffer, then nineteen years of age, and Ephraim Ruebush, later his brother-in-law, formed a co-partnership for the teaching of singing schools. During that and the following year, 1860, they taught many classes in Pittsylvania, Campbell and Halifax Counties of this State. The books they used came from the printing press of Kieffer's grandfather, Joseph Funk, of Mountain Valley, who at that time was the only publisher of character notes in the South, and who also edited and published what was perhaps the first attempt at musical journalism in the South, the *Southern MUSICAL ADVOCATE*. Aldine Kieffer, the young musician, was a poet as well; his name had already appeared in the *MUSICAL ADVOCATE*.... All these affairs were suddenly interrupted in 1861, when the Civil War broke out. The

SINGING SCHOOLS

publication of the *MUSICAL ADVOCATE* was suspended; Kieffer left his music class to become one of the first volunteers in April, 1860. . . .

“When the war was over, Ruebush and Kieffer came together again in business partnership and took up the broken threads of their fortunes. In 1870 they began the publication of a music journal, which they ambitiously named the *MUSICAL MILLION*, the successor, and as Kieffer called it, the foster-child of the old Southern *MUSICAL ADVOCATE*. The new journal came out once a month; it was not of large size nor otherwise pretentious, save in its name. But it stood for purity of literature, dedicated itself to the cause of character notes. . . . ; its editor was. . . . Kieffer. . . .

“But the *MUSICAL MILLION* did not consume all of Kieffer’s time or talent. Most of his forthcoming poetry was published in music books issued from the press of Ruebush and Kieffer. The *MILLION* lent its kindly aid in the way of advertising. . . . The books, commanding a wide sale, brought new prosperity to the publishing house and an equal measure of celebrity to the name of the poet. . . .

“Young men, fond of music, and inspired by the energetic voice of the *MILLION*, perhaps also by personal contact with Ruebush and Kieffer, went forth in great numbers to teach music in rural communities, carrying with them as the Gospel of their mission the music and poetry issued from the thriving house at Dayton. Their faces were turned chiefly southward into an unoccupied and, therefore, inviting field for their art. If we glance into any copy of the *MILLION* during the 70’s, 80’s or 90’s, we find printed letters from these cheery adventurers. It is pleasant to read these letters, whose tone without exception has the ring of joyful prosperity. What concerns us most. . . . is this: far and wide the music books containing Kieffer’s poetry were getting into the hands of the people; the people were getting his songs on their lips and in their hearts.

“Who that ever attended one can forget the old country singing school? It was held during the summer months in the school house on the hill, continuing for ten days or so with meetings at night and also perhaps in the afternoon.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Old and young rallied around the singing master, obeyed the motions of his baton and sounded the chord at his bidding. They first learned a few primary principles concerning the upward and downward scale, the lines and spaces and bars, and caught the simple secret of the character notes. Then they sang; and the pieces they learned to sing with unconstrained voices and happy hearts out of the new books that the teacher brought must in the words of our own poet, as

Voices of loved ones, songs of the past,
Still linger around them while life shall last.

“Such a singing class as this, using Kieffer’s books and learning his songs, pictures to our minds what actually occurred hundreds, yes, thousands of times and places in Virginia and the farther South. And this means of disseminating the productions of Kieffer was his third literary opportunity, the third factor in the making of his reputation of musician and poet.

“Would it now be possible to figure, with instructive approximation, how many people in this country have come to know Kieffer’s songs? He was editor of fifteen or so music books, to which he contributed such a number and such a quality of poems as imparted his own genius to the whole work and made his name in it the most prominent. Of the most popular, that is, the TEMPLE STAR, over 500,000 copies have been sold. Taking this factor as an indication, we may reasonably believe that no less than three millions of people in America during the last thirty years have become acquainted with some portion of his work. This estimate, uncertain and unsatisfactory as it may be, receives happy illumination from the recent statements of a prominent musician of Rockingham County.... He says that while holding singing classes for the last nine years in eleven states, East, West and South, he has been at but one place where Kieffer’s song, ‘Twilight is Falling,’ was not known.”

This concrete example of a leader of singing schools and of publishers of Gospel hymns shows how they were related to the dissemination of this type of music and hymn and that they serve as great agencies in this capacity. This edition of the MUSICAL MILLION carried advertisements of

SINGING SCHOOLS

twenty-four singing schools. They are presented in full, as they reveal what territory was served by these schools and also indicate something of their nature.

LIST OF SINGING SCHOOLS ADVERTISED IN "THE MUSICAL MILLION," AUGUST, 1908

"Ebenezer Church, Marion County, Mississippi, September 1st to 10th, 1908. S. T. Hood, Secretary and Treasurer, Columbiana, Mississippi. Route Number 1. H. P. Blackwell, Principal."

"Concord Church, near Pickens, S. C., August 24th to September 5th. McD. Baker, Principal; John Baker, Secretary and Treasurer."

"Liberty, South Carolina, August 10th, 12 days. McD. Weans, Principal; P. C. Cartee, Secretary, Liberty, South Carolina."

"July 20, August 1, 1908, Rockbluff Church, Daniel, Mississippi. J. D. Purvis, Manager; Julius S. Rushing, Principal, Dayton, Virginia."

"Hickory, North Carolina, August 17th. R. Propst, Manager; W. H. Ruebush, Principal."

"Decatur, Mississippi, August 3 to 15, 1908. Miss Malissey Massey, Manager; Julius S. Rushing, of Dayton, Virginia, Principal."

"Hazel Church, three miles north of Lake, Mississippi, August 17 to 29, 1908. Mr. J. A. Pace, Manager; Julius S. Rushing, of Dayton, Virginia, Principal."

"Mt. Hermon Church, Dredell County, North Carolina, July 15 to 25, 1908. Will M. Price, Statesville, North Carolina, R. F. D. 6, Manager; J. B. Biggerstaff, Bostic, North Carolina, Principal."

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

“Midway, three miles east of Waynesboro, Mississippi, August 4 to 14, 1908. H. P. Blackwell, of Maybell, Mississippi, Principal; Walter Robertson, Manager.”

“Mountain View Church, Spartanburg County, South Carolina, August 3 to 19, 1908. G. W. Bishop and E. K. Wall, Managers; J. B. Biggerstaff, Bostic, North Carolina, Principal.”

“Southuss, Mississippi, July 13th to 23d, ten days. H. P. Blackwell, of Maybell, Mississippi, Principal; E. D. Evans, Secretary and Manager, Carson, Mississippi.”

“Atmore, Alabama, August 17th to 29th, twelve days. H. P. Blackwell, Principal; Miss Anna Jordan and Ishum Jordan, Managers, Atmore, Alabama. The R.-K. Company’s books will be used.”

“Conehatta, Mississippi, August 31 to September 12, 1908. L. B. Horton, Manager; Julius S. Rushing, Dayton, Virginia, Principal.”

“County Line Church, Rankin County, Mississippi, July 20 to August 1, 1908. George S. Ware, of Edda, Mississippi, Principal, John Ponder, of Joe, Mississippi, Manager.”

“Langford, Rankin County, Mississippi, August 3d to 15th. George S. Ware, of Edda, Mississippi, Principal; J. N. Siles, Langford, Mississippi, Manager.”

“Return Church, near Seneca, South Carolina, August 3 to 22, 1908. McD. Baker, Pickens, South Carolina, Principal; Miss Lelia Blair, Seneca, South Carolina, Secretary and Treasurer.”

“Forest Hill, West Virginia, August 10 to 22, 1908. For circulars, address T. M. Hutchison, Forest Hill West Virginia, Secretary.”

SINGING SCHOOLS

“Lowell, West Virginia, August 24 to September 5, 1908. For circulars address, H. F. Kesler, Secretary. Lowell, West Virginia.”

“Mt. Vernon Springs Baptist Church, Chatham County, North Carolina, July 30 to August 10, 1908. N. W. Dixon, Mt. Vernon Springs, North Carolina, Secretary-Treasurer.”

“Parrish Memorial Baptist Church, Johnston County, North Carolina, July 30th to August 10th. J. F. Watson, Pine Level, Secretary-Treasurer.”

“Pine Level Baptist Church, Johnston County, North Carolina, August 11 to 21, 1908. Floyd Price, Pine Level, Secretary-Treasurer.”

“Blakeney Creek Church, six miles north of Collins, Mississippi, August 3, 1908, continues two weeks. Alonza Knight, Secretary-Treasurer; J. L. Warren, B. A. McQueen, Hiram Sellers, Managers. Tuition in advance.”

“Pleasant Valley Church, five miles north of Lawrence, Mississippi, August 17, 1908, continues two weeks. W. T. McCraney, R. S. Atkinson, C. W. Hammond, W. A. Wyatt, Managers, Decatur, Mississippi.”

“Pine Grove Church, near McNeil, Mississippi, August 31, 1908, continues two weeks. Rev. N. F. Clark, J. W. Burks, J. M. Stewart, B. B. Moody, Albert Smith, Monroe Stewart, and George Walker, McNeil, Mississippi, Managers.”

These singing-school masters generally featured a new book each year. They produced many of these books, just as Keiffer did. They also wrote quite a percent. of each book. In most instances the masters were also agents of publishing houses. In both cases, they annually introduced

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

and sold new books in numerous communities. Indeed, generally they considered themselves obligated to have a new book each year, and the backward country people looked forward to the day when they would hear and learn new songs at the singing school. Later, when the singing school had closed and on special occasions when they would have company, as well as on Sunday nights, singing the new songs in their homes constituted a frequent method of entertainment and a usual means of inspiration.

CHAPTER IX

IS THE GOSPEL HYMN COMMERCIALIZED?

Naturally, one thinks of the commercial aspect of the huge enterprise of the manufacture and distribution of Gospel hymn books. The manufacture, distribution and sale of so many books require a vast army of people. This work affords an opportunity to many people to make a living. Also large sums of money are spent by the people purchasing books, money that otherwise would be spent in other things.

Since so many people are engaged in this enterprise one wonders what their motives are, whether selfish or unselfish. There are those who assert that their motives are pure, whereas there are those who contend to the contrary.

The former point to the power of Gospel hymns to change human life, to their adaptability to the average person, due to their simplicity in language, narrow breadth of thought, repetition of the same idea and being set to the music of the masses. They also hold that new hymns and new hymnals are needed very frequently, just as novelty aids in maintaining interest in other lines. Hence, the leading publishers of Gospel hymns bring out a new book almost every year, and in these books are many new hymns. The following appeal of a publishing company to its friends shows how this company tries to meet the annual desire for a new book:

“It is only through our friends and customers that our work continues to grow, and we just want to gratefully thank you for the loyal support you have given us in helping to keep before the people the beautiful and unparalleled songs written by....

“Why not supply your class this fall with this new book before the fall money is spent?”

On the other hand, there are those who point to the

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

following to uphold their position that the motives of the producers and vendors of Gospel hymns are selfish:

1. All these songs and all these hymnals are copyrighted. The leading denominational publishing houses have found the prices charged for the privilege of using these copyrighted hymns enormous, and even at times prohibitive. One publisher asked \$350 for the use of the words of a single copyrighted hymn. Of course, the amount was not paid and the hymn was not included in the book for which it was desired. A company getting out a hymnal recently felt it should use certain hymns, copyrights of which were owned by certain other publishers. The latter consented to sell the copyright privileges of these hymns, but only upon the condition that the company purchase such privileges on about thirty other hymns and also include them in the book. As the former hymns were considered absolutely necessary for the new book, the latter were also included, though they were not desired and were regarded as unsuitable for the book in which they were put.

2. It is known that some publishers of Gospel hymns have accumulated considerable sums of money. That the publishers find their business profitable is indicated by the fact that Moody and Sankey made large sums out of their hymn books. ¹When Moody was trying to raise money to establish his schools at Northfield, Massachusetts, the use of the royalty on their hymn books was considered for such a purpose. Mr. ²Sankey by means of money realized from the sale of his Gospel hymns gave to his native city of New Castle, Pennsylvania, a Y. M. C. A. building that cost \$40,000 and, in addition, money to buy a beautiful lot on which to erect a new building for the church of his boyhood.

3. Others point to the persistent and extensive advertising of such hymns as evidence that they are commercialized. In many instances, each year publishers send leaflets describing their new books to pastors, Sunday School superintendents and choir leaders. Many companies even send to such people a free copy of each new book. One company, in a leaflet containing a new song found in its

1. "My Life and the Story of Gospel Hymns," by Sankey, Page 103.
2. Ibid: Page 173.

THE GOSPEL HYMN COMMERCIALIZED?

latest book, offers to send free two copies of this song to any one who will sing it publicly as a solo, five copies to be sung publicly as a quartet or any number needed as a chorus to be sung publicly. Evidently, this company feels that this hymn will, when thus used, prove sufficiently popular to sell the book in which it is found.

Another company advertises one book thus: "In.... are compiled the choicest copyrights of four successful music houses, besides the pick of the best copyrights of all other houses; AN UNEQUALED COLLECTION of the choicest songs ever written. Included in the book are sixteen entirely new compositions." The same company has the following advertisement of another book: "Songs that have reaped the greatest results for the most experienced evangelists and singers in the evangelistic field. Songs that received the greatest number of votes in the recent contest. Eleven new songs that present the old, old message in a new way that is effective, appealing and forceful, together with favorite old standard hymns.... Nothing better in its line to be had. HAS NO PEER IN PRICE AND CONTENTS."

Such is a summary of the evidence regarding the question of the commercialization of the Gospel hymns. Each one must consider the evidence and determine his attitude towards the problem.

CHAPTER X

A SCATHING ATTACK UPON THE GOSPEL HYMN

A scathing attack upon the Gospel hymn has been made by Dr. H. M. Poteat, Professor of Latin of Wake Forest College, Wake Forest, North Carolina. Dr. Poteat has had considerable experience with church music, having been for a number of years organist and choir master of the Wake Forest Baptist Church, having been during the session of 1909-1910, while a student at Columbia University, bass soloist in the Chapel of the Intercession of Trinity Parish, New York, and later having been soloist and assistant organist of the Columbia University Choir. All during his life he has been much interested in the ministry of sacred music and in how to improve it. This has led him to make extensive and quite thorough studies in the realm of Hymnology.

In 1921 a little book of 129 pages written by him appeared. It was entitled *PRACTICAL HYMNOLOGY* and consisted of three chapters, the second one of which has the caption, "The Cheap Hymn." It is this chapter which constitutes the most scathing attack upon the revival and jazz hymn that has yet appeared. It occupies forty-nine pages of the book and from beginning to end is a continuous assault upon what he terms "The Cheap Hymn." Nor is it only upon the printed page that Dr. Poteat has stood up boldly and uncompromisingly for his convictions, for this chapter has been delivered as a lecture at the Virginia Beach Baptist Encampment; the Union Theological Seminary of Richmond, Virginia; the Bristol Baptist Assembly; the Tabernacle Church in Atlanta; the National Federation of Music Clubs meeting in Missouri; the Virginia Federation of Music Clubs in Danville, Virginia; the Harrisonburg Teachers' College, Harrisonburg, Virginia; and various other points. Indeed, it has been given widely from Atlanta to

ATTACK UPON THE GOSPEL HYMN

Kansas City. ¹There is also a number of tentative invitations in Virginia for the lecture as a result of its delivery before the Virginia Music Clubs Convention. Dr. Poteat's work in hymnology, then, has been quite significant and influential; and his courage, frankness and unselfishness should be admired by all. He has refused any profit from all this work and has been willing to take only expenses for all these lectures. Also, his book, **PRACTICAL HYMNOLOGY**, has been a loss to him of over a thousand dollars.

Believing that there has been a rapid advance in the popularity of cheap hymns in the last few years, Dr. Poteat attempts to explain this on the following grounds:

²"In the first place, they are extensively and very shrewdly advertised. And this advertising is not done through newspapers, to any large degree. At many denominational gatherings (I speak particularly of Baptists here) cheap books are used,—are 'furnished' by the publisher. How generous! For example, a certain book was 'furnished' for a recent meeting of The North Carolina State Baptist Convention. A few days after the Convention had closed, a communication appeared in the Baptist State paper from the pastor of the church in which the Convention had met, to the effect that he had forgotten to announce that the books furnished were for sale. . . . Two or three years ago I was invited to conduct the music at an important denominational gathering in another state. Some weeks before the time set for the meeting I received a letter, written with evident embarrassment, opining that, inasmuch as Brother Blank had kindly agreed to furnish hymn books, I would probably like to be excused!

"Now the simple truth of the matter is that all this generous 'furnishing' is done for the sole purpose of advertising the book; and no man can disprove the effectiveness of the method. Of course, no publisher with the slightest regard for the proprieties and sanctities of worship would think for a moment of advertising in such a manner; but the dear 'hymn' book publishers, not being famous for the

1. This information was gathered June 19, 1928.

2. **PRACTICAL HYMNOLOGY**, Pages 58-62, quoted by permission, as are all the extracts of this book.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

possession of this quality, are simply running true to type in piously 'furnishing' with a view to remuneratively selling.

"Not only are cheap books advertised at denominational gatherings, but nearly every evangelistic singer, so far as my observation goes, uses them, and many sell them. Dear reader, have you ever listened to a quack doctor expatiating upon the excellencies of his nostrum? If so, you have invariably heard him conclude something like this: 'Now, friends, you can find out all about what ails you, and how to cure it, in my little book here; price, only fifty cents. Were you ever among those present at an exhibition of mind-reading? If so, you were exposed to some such peroration as this: 'Now, friends, you can find out all about my wonderful powers, and how you may develop similar gifts, by a perusal of my little book here; price, only fifty cents.' Neither the quack doctor nor the mind reader could be induced upon any consideration to enter the house of God with his books; but the professional singer hails the opportunity, and he is quite willing to degrade and prostitute the sanctuary and defile the worship of God by howling his wares from the very Holy of Holies. . . .

"In some sections of the South 'singing conventions' are quite popular. The people come together from all parts of the surrounding country, bring the babies and abundant baskets of dinner, and spend the day (or, sometimes, several days) whooping and squalling and bellowing songs out of sundry cheap books. Various 'singing teachers' are on hand, each extolling the glittering merits of the book for which he is agent, and vieing with his fellows in oily piety and those acrobatic and vulgar antics that are deemed necessary to the successful leadership of choir and congregational singing. . . .

"Perhaps the chief reason, however, for the popularity of the cheap 'hymn' is to be found in the fondness for secular music of the same type, which seems to be so characteristic of our time. Blues, jazz, waltzes, ragtime, slushy sentimentality have become the musical expression of so many people outside the church, that the same sort of thing, with a poor, thin veneer of religion, is demanded in

ATTACK UPON THE GOSPEL HYMN

the church. Cheap secular songs have secured such a strangle hold upon the feelings and affections of church members that they cannot stand to be deprived of their favorite musical and sentimental (not to say intellectual) nutriment even in the place of prayer and praise. . . . New books must be published every little while to meet this demand; for, somehow, cheap songs, secular and sacred, wear out rather quickly, like cheap clothes, and others must always be on tap in a sufficient quantity (quality appears to be of no importance) to guarantee the perpetuity of the prosperity of the perpetrators, and happiness for the users."

Dr. Poteat is convinced that the cheap hymn is highly commercialized and frankly says so, as these statements show. ³"If some courageous person were to urge these publishers of sacred rags to start a campaign for the elevation of public taste in the matter of songs for the worship of God, he would be lucky to escape with a whole skin. Elevate public taste, indeed! It is vastly easier and more profitable to pander to it; for if it were elevated, there would soon be no market for cheap hymn books. . . .

⁴"I know, of course, that I shall be severely criticized for calling in question the disinterested piety and religious enthusiasm of these gentry. That is neither here nor there, however, for the facts are on my side. Let us consider them.

"Worship embraces preaching, prayer, and song, and no man can say which is the most important. Sermons and prayers are not turned out wholesale by publishing houses, copyrighted, and hawked up and down the land by howling, prancing evangelistic singers. Why should hymns be thus handled? When a volume of sermons is published, the author, or compiler, does not inform a listening and awestruck world that he has the best volume of sermons ever issued, nor does he have any occasion to refer to the 'large sums' asked for 'popular favorites.' A preacher who would write sermons for money would be justly despised by everybody. We have in our great hymnals hymns which express devoutly and beautifully every feeling of worship that can possibly arise in the breasts of Christians, songs that grew out of

3. Ibid: 63.
4. Ibid: Pages 64-69.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

genuine Christian experience, and not out of the desire for a more impressive bank account. And yet cheap 'hymn' writers continue to turn out songs. Now, if the author of a poem or tune were really desirous of seeing his production a blessing, he would not be so anxious to get under the wing of the great god copyright, nor would he ask large sums for the use of his precious ditty in a forthcoming book. And if publishers were as interested in evangelizing the world through hymns, they would not be so eager to buy copyrights of popular songs to boost their bank accounts by issuing new collections every year or two.

"The small minority of the tawdry fraternity who are not writing for money, but who really think they are producing genuine hymns, deserve no censure; rather they are in sore need of pity and enlightenment."

Dr. Poteat strikingly protests against the method of constructing the cheap hymns, which is to get a chorus and make that the center of the hymn, repeating that over and over, so that there is a paucity of ideas and expressions. In this connection, he says: "A gifted and popular moving picture actor talking with one of his friends with regard to feminine costume among the islanders, remarked, 'They are wearing them higher in Hawaii.' Forthwith one of the inmates of Tin Pan Alley. . . . turned out a song upon that edifying theme, the chorus of which insisted again and again, almost at the point of weariness and indecency, that they were wearing them higher in Hawaii. The rest of the song did not matter. Love Lifted Me, Brighten the Corner, and There is Power in the Blood are fine examples of sacred songs composed in this fashion. The chorus is the main feature. . . . Any observant person will notice at once when he hears a song of this type in the house of God, that the congregation mumbles the verses and bellows the chorus. . . . You are expected to say, 'Tum-te-tum-te-tum,' etc., until you arrive at the chorus, when you are expected to get under a full head of steam immediately, and roar, 'Bright-un the cor-nur where you are' etc, etc. . . .

5 "Not only do most of them possess a chorus as a main feature, but that chorus is subjected to those adornments

5. Ibid: Page 72.

ATTACK UPON THE GOSPEL HYMN

and labors of love that should always distinguish the most precious things of life. It contains gymnastic contortions for the basso, death-defying gyrations for the tenor, peripatetic circumambulations for the alto...., frantic and perilous exertions for all three simultaneously while the soprano bravely pegs away at the tune. Truly, it is marvelous and inspiring to hear!"

Dr. Poteat further in this chapter advances and answers the reasons usually given for the purchase and use of cheap 'hymns.' *"Firstly, the books cost less money than real hymnals.* How often we have all heard that piece of shallow sophistry! To be sure they cost less at the outset. But by the time the church or Sunday School has bought new books two or three times in the space of four or five years, it has spent much more than would have been required for the purchase of a good hymn book that would last indefinitely.

"Secondly, the people tire of the old hymns. Yes, they frequently do. And when that happens, you may be sure that one or more of three reasons is responsible. Either a very few hymns have been sung over and over, or they have been senselessly dragged to death by a lazy choir and a still lazier congregation, or some enemy of the true worship of God has been sowing tares. The remedy is, of course, the learning of more good hymns, a little more energy and spirit in choir and congregation, and a cold shoulder to the enemy.

"These songs are not so difficult to sing as the standard hymns. That statement made so often in defense of trash is wholly false, as can be proven by anybody who knows enough music to sit down at the piano and play over both types. *Onward Christian Soldiers* is much easier to play and sing than *The Fight is On*. The lovely harmony of *O Jesus Thou Art Standing* is infinitely simpler than the cumbersome waltz measures of *Let Jesus Come into Your Heart*. Examples could be multiplied indefinitely. The cheap song with its jingling, jigging verses and its cantankerous chorus requires considerably more musical (not to say acrobatic) ability for its rendition than does a devotional, worshipful hymn.

"We are told, too, that the sentiments expressed in the standard hymns, 'used and defended by high-falutin folk,'

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

are over the heads of the great masses of people, who must, therefore, have songs of a lower literary grade. I do not believe that wretched slander, and I challenge any jigster on earth to prove it. There is not a man or woman, boy or girl, in any of our churches unable to comprehend the meaning of My Faith Looks Up to Thee, or Joy to the World, or Homeland, or Stand Up, Stand Up For Jesus, or Day is Dying in the West, or The King of Love My Shepherd is. . . .

"A fourth argument employed with particular frequency and zest by advocates of cheap 'hymns' is that they stir up the *pep*. They do. But the *pep* thus engendered is a poor, specious counterfeit of that deep religious enthusiasm aroused by the hearty singing of a real hymn. . . . Singers and publishers have diligently spread abroad the miserably false idea that there is no enthusiasm or *pep* in the great hymns; that congregations cannot be aroused to spiritual activity by the *old songs*. . . . So assiduously has this wretched, poisonous heresy been disseminated that thousands of people actually believe it. . . . If tenderness, devoutness, contrition, prayerfulness, are to be sought through the services of song, nobody in his right mind would or could propose a piece of sorry ragtime as the agent of his stimulation."

Such are some of Dr. Poteat's convictions which he has vigorously, frankly and sacrificially expressed.

CHAPTER XI

A PSYCHOLOGICAL EXPLANATION OF THE POWER OF THE GOSPEL HYMN

The psychological explanation of the power of revival hymns here given involves two procedures: I. A consideration of the nature of suggestion; and II. A consideration of the relation of suggestion and other psychological phenomena to the power of revival hymns.

I. What is suggestion? A gleaning of the writings of various psychologists reveals five answers to this question.

1. William James defines it as the element in a human life which makes it susceptible to influence or change. He says that it is, ¹“That mental susceptibility which we all possess to some degree of yielding assent to outward suggestion, of affirming what we strongly conceive, and of acting in accord with what we are made to expect.”

2. Some authors make little distinction between suggestion and imitation. Ross does this, since he ²holds that suggestion is the cause and imitation the effect, the two being only different aspects of the same phenomenon.

3. Baldwin ³ thinks that suggestion occurs when an idea or image abruptly enters consciousness from without and forms a part of the current of thought, in turn tending to beget its characteristic muscular and volitional results.

4. Others regard suggestion as the uncritical acceptance of a proposition. This is the case with William McDougal who says: ⁴“I have defined suggestion as the imparting of a proposition in such a manner that it is accepted with conviction, independently of any logical grounds for such conviction.” This is also Allport’s essential idea, as is seen

1. “Principles of Psychology,” Vol. II, Page 598. Quoted by permission of Henry Holt & Company.

2. “Social Psychology,” Page 13.

3. Laws of Influence, Page 78.

4. “Outlines of Abnormal Psychology,” Page 117, quoted by permission of Charles Scribner’s Sons.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

in his use of the expression "in an immediate manner" in the following statement: ⁵"Suggestion is a process involving elementary behavior mechanisms in response to a social stimuli; the nature of the process being that the one who gives the stimulus controls the behavior and consciousness of the recipient in an immediate manner, relatively uninfluenced by thought."

5. A fifth idea of suggestion may be said to be the unconscious or subconscious process of arriving at conclusions and attitudes. Gault expresses this idea thus: ⁶"Suggestion . . . is conceived as an indirect awakening of a determining tendency, not in full consciousness—on the part of the one who receives the suggestion—of what is going on. It is in consequence of this subterranean route by which the suggestion operates upon the subject that he, in reacting upon it, has more the sense of acting on his own initiative than by responding to external influence."

A careful consideration of these definitions does not show them to be conflicting or very different. On the contrary, two common elements are recognized in all of them, which are: (1) the capacity of man to be easily influenced and to accept propositions independent of logical grounds; and (2) the capacity of man to be influenced more or less unconsciously or subconsciously. Accepting this general conception of suggestion, next an attempt will be made to analyze some elements of revivals and of revival singing in their relation to suggestion and other psychological phenomena involved in revival singing.

II. 1. First to be considered here is the power of suggestion of the personality of the evangelistic singer. Two factors in suggestion are prestige and submissiveness. Dr. McDougal writes, ⁷"The suggestibility of any subject is a function of several factors, and varies with these factors: some of these factors are resident in the subject; others lie in environment. Of the non-resident factors the chief is the prestige of the source from which the suggestion comes. This

5. "Social Psychology," Pages 251 and 252, quoted by permission of Houghton Mifflin Company.

6. "Social Psychology," quoted by permission of Henry Holt & Company.

7. Op. Cit., Pages 117 and 118. Quoted by permission of Charles Scribner's Sons.

EXPLANATION OF POWER OF GOSPEL HYMN

may attach itself to an individual or a group of individuals by reason of reputation for power or knowledge or achievement. It may be due to an outward aspect of power or dignity, to that subtle combination of physical and mental qualities that we call personal magnetism; or the external trappings of dignity and power, wealth, titles, fine clothes, robes of office, crowns and scepters.” Allport also expresses this view in his chapter on suggestion.

The evangelistic singer of a revival meets many of these conditions. To the vast majority before whom he usually sings he is a person of superior social position. His dress is generally neat and of a dignified and impressive type. He is ordinarily better educated than most of his hearers, and he almost always sings with a considerable note of authority. He represents a venerable institution, the Church. He also represents the Most High, the Almighty, the Creator of heaven and earth and the present ruler of every life. He sings concerning the most sacred, august and mysterious forces—about right and wrong, God, death and eternity. Little wonder, then, that most people who believe in religion and revivals listen to him uncritically and are readily influenced.

2. The facial expression of the singer has much to do in causing the members of his audience to be suggestible. The faces of most evangelistic singers manifest the emotions that attend the ideas they are presenting. Through the principle of sympathetic induction the hearers unconsciously catch their expression, and feel the accompanying emotions, resulting in them accepting almost unconsciously the ideas and attitudes the singer is presenting. Allport, quoting Paolo Mantezza, in the succeeding passage, strikingly directs attention to the power of facial expression. ⁸“Say to a dog, to a child who does not yet know how to speak, or to a foreigner . . . the word brigand, at the same time smiling benevolently or making affectionate gestures; these three beings, very different in their natures . . . will reply to you with affection. Say to them, on the contrary, the word dearest with an expression of hatred or a threatening gesture,

8. Op. Cit., Page 200, quoted by permission of Houghton Mifflin Company.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

you will see them shrink with terror, attempt to escape, or utter complaints."

In addition, a member of a crowd is affected in like manner by the facial expression of the other members of the crowd, so that the momentum of emotion and thought kindled by hymns is likely to gain great headway as a revival meeting progresses from night to night.

3. The distinct rhythm, rapid music and frequent repetition of the same idea, which are outstanding characteristics of the revival hymn, produce monotony and fatigue, and these in turn induce suggestibility. Indeed, the resulting condition again and again has been closely akin to hypnosis, if it has not been hypnosis. These things mean that the revival hymn, especially during prolonged revivals that are largely attended, has a very fertile field for influencing human life.

4. The element of expectancy looms large in the revival situation. Revivals are great annual occasions eagerly awaited. Many adults return to the family hearthside only during the revival season. Each year in the revival in the home church they receive great spiritual blessings. Some preacher and some singer of distinction and of emotional power are usually secured. They are advertised several weeks in advance. Frequently all the churches in the community unite for the meeting, and a tent or warehouse is engaged in which to hold it. This novelty aids in arousing the interest of the people. A community survey is made, and several weeks in advance the church leaders know how many "sinners" are in their midst. For about two weeks in advance prayer meetings are held in the homes, and in these meetings prayer is offered for the success of the revival and for the conversion of certain people.

In these ways the expectancy of the church people of the community is kindled and increased. Thus, even many of the unstable members, backsliders and sometimes notoriously wicked ones begin to hope and to expect to be converted during the revival. The revival begins, the people attend and participate earnestly and hopefully and willingly comply with the conditions they believe necessary for its success. The ones most interested are first converted,

EXPLANATION OF POWER OF GOSPEL HYMN

or reclaimed, or have a great emotional religious experience, such as they desired and hoped for. This, in turn, interests many who at first were opposed or indifferent, and they begin to expect a blessing, and many of them eventually get it.

Naturally under such conditions the appeals of the hymns sung have great effect in producing the desired results—much greater effect than they would have under ordinary circumstances.

5. The influence of the hymn in a revival is increased, because a revival crowd, like other crowds, is very sensitive to numbers. Ross says⁹ that an individual in a crowd is increasingly fascinated by the mass of individuals and that his consciousness constantly contracts until he is almost automatic and hypnotized. The following statement of Dr. McDougal is of like effect: ¹⁰“When a common emotion pervades the crowd, each member becomes more or less distinctly aware of the fact; and this gives him a sense of sharing in a mighty and irresistible power which renders him reckless of consequences and encourages him to give himself up to the prevailing emotion without restraint. Thus, in the case of an audience swept by an emotion of admiration for a brilliant singer, the thunder of applause, which shows each individual that his emotion is shared by all the rest, intensifies his own emotions, not only by way of sympathetic induction, but also because it frees him from that restraint of emotion which is habitual with most of us in the presence of any critical or adversely disposed spectators, and which the mere thought of such spectators tends to maintain and strengthen. Again, the oratory of a demagogue, if addressed to a large crowd, will raise angry emotion to a pitch of intensity far higher than any it will attain if he is heard by a few persons only; and this is not only due to accumulation of emotion by sympathetic induction, but also to the fact that as the symptoms of the emotions can be manifested on all sides, each man becomes aware that it pervades the crowd, that the crowd as a whole is swayed by the same

9. “Social Psychology,” Page 49.

10. “The Group Mind,” Page 380. Quoted by permission of Charles Scribner’s Sons.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

emotions and the same impulse as he himself feels, that none remains to criticize the violence of his expressions. To which it must be added that the consciousness of the harmony of one's feelings with those of a mass of one's fellows, and the consequent sense of freedom from all restraint, are highly pleasurable to most men; they find a pleasure in letting themselves go, in being swept away in the torrent of emotion."

Again, Dr. McDougal writes: ¹¹"This character of crowds seems to be due to two peculiarities of the collective mental state. In the first place, the individual, in becoming one of the a crowd, loses in some degree his self-consciousness, his awareness of himself as a distinct personality, and with it goes something of his specifically personal relations: he becomes to a certain extent depersonalized. In the second place, and intimately connected with this last change, is a diminution of the sense of responsibility; the individual feels himself enveloped and overshadowed and carried away by forces which he is powerless to control; he, therefore, does not feel called upon to maintain the attitude of self-criticism and self-restraint which, under ordinary circumstances, are habitual to him."

Therefore in revivals, where such conditions prevail, people easily yield to the influences brought to bear upon them, not least of which consists of the singing of hymns.

6. Another fact of crowd psychology that increases the power of hymns during revivals is that feeling runs through a crowd more rapidly and easily than ideas. This naturally follows as a result of the decrease of will power and capacity for logical thought. The person in the crowd is largely a victim of the emotions of the moment—of his own emotions and of the emotions of the crowd. No longer recognizing the usual inhibitions, he does as he feels. Fear of eternal destruction, love of God and of humanity, and the desire to make an immediate surrender to God are emotions that are forcibly kindled by the singing of revival hymns, and the influence of such singing plus the influence of the crowd, sermon and other factors, cause multitudes to yield to these emotions during revivals, with the result that Christian careers are begun that are permanently successful.

11. Ibid: Page 57. Quoted by permission of Charles Scribner's Sons.

EXPLANATION OF POWER OF GOSPEL HYMN

7. Appeals based upon fear arouse emotions quickly and violently. This is a great factor in the explanation of the revivals of an earlier period. Most revival hymns forcibly direct attention to the danger of eternal destruction. Concerning the power of fear, Dr. McDougal writes: ¹² "There is one kind of object in the presence of which no man remains indifferent and which evokes in almost all men the same emotion; namely, impending danger; hence the sudden appearance of imminent danger may instantaneously convert any concourse of people into a crowd and produce the characteristic and terrible phenomena of panic. In man the instinct of fear is intensely excited; he experiences that horrible emotion in full force and is irresistibly impelled to save himself The terrible driving power of this impulse, excited to its highest pitch under favoring conditions, suppresses all other impulses and tendencies, all habits of self-restraint."

In bringing to a close this survey of suggestion and crowd psychology in its relation to the power of the revival hymn, these final statements are made. No one can say that God works only in these ways in bringing about remarkable conversions and in producing far-reaching revivals. The belief in the existence of God, which no one has been able to disprove, recognizes the possibility of supernatural intervention. However, when God works only by means of psychological laws, He is still working and exerting His power.

12. "The Group Mind," Page 35. Quoted by permission of Charles Scribner's Sons.

BOOK III

IN THE SOUTHERN
SUNDAY SCHOOLS

CHAPTER XII

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

A number of Sunday School hymnals have been found with dates of publication beginning about 1860 and ending about 1880. In the Raleigh Christian Advocate, a Methodist paper, of May 27, 1863, there was the advertisement of *A COLLECTION OF SABBATH SCHOOL HYMNS Compiled by a Sunday School Teacher for Sunday School Use. H. D. Turner and W. L. Pomeroy, publishers. Rev. W. J. W. Crowder and John G. Williams, taking orders.*

The same paper on December the second of that year had this article under the caption, *SABBATH SCHOOL SINGING*: "The Sabbath School is designed to aid in leading the children to the Savior, to thoroughly build them up in the great cardinal doctrines of Christianity, and, by interesting them so much in the peculiar duties of the Sabbath, to lead them to love the day and its privileges. For the attainment of the first object, we must rely upon the precept and example of the teachers; for the second, we require properly arranged Scripture." Then the author says that singing is also necessary to a Sunday School in that it tends to cultivate a Christian temper. He thinks the church hymnal should not be used in the Sunday School. Hymns of devotion, hymns praising the Sunday School and hymns of Christian experience should be used. There should be appropriate tunes, and they are not found in the church tunes. The article also states that there had just been published at the Methodist Book Depository in Macon, Georgia, a little hymn book called *THE SUNDAY SCHOOL BELL*, which contained sixty or more hymns selected from the first and second *SABBATH SCHOOL BELL*. This little book sold for about \$2.00 per dozen. He adds that there was also a similar work published in Raleigh.

There are in the University of North Carolina Library two copies of a little hymnal called *THE SABBATH SCHOOL WREATH*. It was published by the Sunday School and Pub-

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

lication Board of the North Carolina Baptist State Convention in 1863 at Raleigh, and compiled by a Sabbath School teacher for the benefit of the children in the Confederate States. The book is about six inches long and four inches wide and has 111 hymns. These are copies of the second edition, since the following statement is found in the preface: "The favorable manner in which our collection of Sabbath School hymns was received has led to the publication of another edition, containing many additional favorite hymns.

"The compiler has endeavored to select such hymns as are in general use and adapted to all Sabbath occasions. Many of the hymns will be found set to music in the **THE SABBATH SCHOOL BELL**." A fourth edition of this book came out in 1866 and is also in the University of North Carolina Library.

The Library of the University of North Carolina also contains two copies of a hymn book called **THE SOUTHERN ZION'S SONGSTER**. The title page states that these hymns were "designed for Sabbath Schools, Prayer and Social meetings, and camps." The book has 125 hymns and is five inches long and two and one-half inches wide. It was compiled by the editor of the North Carolina Christian Advocate and published by the North Carolina Advocate Publishing Company at Raleigh in 1864. The preface states: "The only apology we offer for sending forth this small collection of hymns . . . is that they are needed and much needed at this juncture. We could have made it much larger, and far more suitable to the wants of the public, but it was important to have something to answer to any present wants at the lowest price." Its hymns are mostly classical. Watts wrote eighteen of them, Wesley eleven, Newton and Stennet three each, and Doddridge one. However, it also has the following hymns, some of which will be quoted later:

What's The News?

Where, O Where Are The Hebrew Children?

I Want To Be An Angel

THE VOICE OF PRAISE For the Sunday School, Prayer Meeting and Family Circle by Rev. E. T. Baird and Karl Reder was published in Richmond. The fly leaf is out of

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

the book and the date is gone. The copyrights of some of the hymns date back to 1830. It probably came out about 1870.

THE GOLDEN LIGHT is a little paper back hymnal found in the Library of the University of North Carolina. It was compiled by George A. Minor, and was published at Richmond in 1879 by J. Ryland. Minor wrote the music for seven of the hymns.

A study of these books indicates that most of their numbers are included in the following classification: (1) Songs of praise of the Sunday School; (2) songs of invitation to the Sunday School; (3) nature songs; (4) songs of Christian experience; (5) other—worldly songs. Illustrations of each type follow:

1. *Songs of praise of the Sunday School*, Number One in THE SABBATH SCHOOL WREATH is this type:

The Sabbath School's a place of prayer.
I love to meet my teacher there;
They teach here that everyone
May find in heaven a happy home.

Chorus

I love to go, I love to go,
I love to go to Sabbath School.

In God's own book we're taught to read,
How Christ for sinners groaned and bled;
That precious blood a ransom gave
For sinful man his soul to save.

Chorus

I love to go, I love to go,
I love to go to Sabbath School.

In Sabbath School we sing and pray,
And learn to love the Sabbath day,
That when on earth our Sabbaths end,
A glorious rest in heaven we'll spend.

Chorus

I love to go, I love to go,
I love to go to Sabbath School.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

And when our days on earth are o'er,
We'll meet in heaven to part no more;
Our teachers kind we shall greet,
And, oh! what joy 'twill be to meet,

Chorus

In heaven above, in heaven above,
In heaven above to part no more.

Number five in THE GOLDEN LIGHT also praises the Sunday School. A verse of it follows:

Lord bless our School to-day,
Bless us to-day.
We come to worship Thee;
Show us the way.
Here from the world we turn,
With longing hearts that burn,
Thy blessed truths to learn.
Bless us to-day.

2. *A high per cent of the hymns in these books consists of invitations to come to the Sunday School.* This hymn found in THE WREATH is one of them.

Will you come to our Sunday School?
I really wish you would;
O come and join our Bible class,
And learn how to be good.
We learn to sing, we learn to pray,
In our sweet Sunday School;
And here we learn of Jesus, too,
Who gave the Golden Rule.

Chorus

Will you, will you, will you, will you,
Join our Sunday School?

We know when Jesus was on earth
He loved each little child
And taught us how we could become
So loving, good and mild.
He gave the Golden Rule, and then
He said that he should know
If we loved him, for if we did,
We should love all below.

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

Chorus

Will you, will you, will you, will you,
Join our Sunday School?

To do to others as I would
That they should do to me,
Will make me honest, kind and good,
As children ought to be;
I know I should not steal, nor use
The smallest thing I see
Which I should never like to lose,
If it belongeth to me.

Chorus

Will you, will you, will you, will you,
Join our Sunday School?

And this plain rule forbids me quite
To strike an angry blow,
Because I should not think it right
If others served me so.
But any kindness they may need
I'll do, whate'er it be;
As I am very glad indeed
When they are kind to me.

Chorus

Will you, will you, will you, will you,
Join our Sunday School?

3. *These early Sunday School books have a few nature Songs.* MORN AMID THE MOUNTAINS is one¹.

Morn amid the mountains—
Lovely solitude!
Gushing streams and fountains
Murmur “God is good.”
Murmur, murmur, murmur, “God is good.”

Now, the glad sun, breaking,
Pours a golden flood;
Deepest vales awaking,
Echo, “God is good.”
Echo, echo, echo, “God is good.”

1. In both THE WREATH and THE GOLDEN LIGHT.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Hymns of praise are ringing
Through the leafy wood;
Songsters sweetly singing,
Warble, "God is good."
Warble, warble, warble, "God is good."

Wake, and join the chorus,
Child, with soul endued;
God, whose smile is o'er us,
Evermore is good,
Ever, ever, evermore is good.

4. *Many of these early hymns describe the facts of Christian experience and contain exhortations to Christian living. "What's The News?" found in THE WREATH and THE SOUTHERN ZION'S SONGSTER may be thus characterized.*

Where'er we meet, you always say,
What's the news? What's the news?
Pray, what's the order of the day?
What's the news? What's the news?
O! I have got good news to tell!
My Savior hath done all things well
And triumphed over death and hell,
That's the news! That's the news!

The lamb was slain on calvary,
That's the news! That's the news!
To set a world of sinners free,
That's the news! That's the news!
'Twas there His precious blood was shed,
'Twas there He bowed His sacred head,
But now He's risen from the dead.
That's the news! That's the news!

His work's reviving all around,
That's the news! That's the news!
And many have redemption found—
That's the news! That's the news!
And since their souls have caught the flame,
They shout hosanna to His name,
And all around they spread His fame
That's the news! That's the news!

The Lord has pardoned all my sin—
That's the news! That's the news!
I find the witness now within—
That's the news! That's the news!

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

And since He took my sins away,
And taught me how to pray,
I'm happy now from day to day—
That's the news! That's the news!

And Christ the Lord can save you now—
That's the news! That's the news!
Your simple heart He can renew—
That's the news! That's the news!
What's the news? What's the news?
This moment, if for sin you grieve,
This moment, if you do believe,
A full acquittal you'll receive,
That's the news! That's the news!

And now, if any one should say,
What's the news? What's the news?
O tell them you've begun to pray—
That's the news! That's the news!
That you have joined the conquering band
And now with you at God's command,
You're marching to the better land.
That's the news! That's the news!

The next song found in THE WREATH may also be said to be one of Christian experience.

Here we throng to praise the Lord.
Listen now! Listen now!
Here we throng to praise the Lord
With our infant lays.
He who once lay in a manger,
Now enthroned, our blest Redeemer,
With a father's love has said
He'd accept our praise.

"Let young children come to me,"
Jesus said, Jesus said:
"Let young children come to me,
And forbid them not
For of such," the Savior told them
"Is composed my heavenly kingdom."
What a rapturous thought it is,
Christ forgets us not!

Let us love, and now adore;
Love Him now, love Him now;
Let us love, and now adore.
In our youthful strength

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Let us never grieve our Savior,
Who hath died to win us favor;
Ah! should melt our hearts—
Children's hearts can melt.

But we'll have a joyous song,
Joyous song, joyous song;
But we'll have a joyous song
For our jubilee.
Jesus lives and reigns forever;
This will make us joyous ever;
Savior, hear this praise to Thee,
Who remembers me.

The following hymns the author states were literally household words with his little children for years. The article containing this statement and these hymns appeared in THE SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN of March 19, 1868. The hymns are very different in the theological views expressed. The views of the former, which is quoted in full, would apparently meet with the approval of modern religious educators, whereas the latter, only one verse of which is given, would not do so.

HYMN I

Lord, look upon a little child,
By nature sinful, rude and wild;
Oh, let Thy grace descend on me,
And make me all I ought to be.

Make me thy child, a child of God,
Washed in the Savior's precious blood;
And make my whole heart from sin set free,
A little vessel full of Thee.

A star of early dawn, and bright,
Twinkling within Thy heavenly light;
A beam of grace to all around,
A little spot of hallowed ground.

Dear Savior! Take me to Thy breast,
And bless me that I may be blest;
Both when I wake, and when I sleep,
Thy little lamb in safety keep.

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

HYMN II

Jesus, tender shepherd! Hear me,
Bless Thy little lamb to-night,
Through the darkness be thou near me,
Watch my sleep till morning light.

5. Of course, being written in a day when the chief function of religion was considered to be that of snatching people as brands from the fire of eternal destruction, *many of these early hymns were other-worldly*. Such is "I Want To Be An Angel," which is found in several of the books of this period.

I want to be an angel,
And with the angels stand,
A crown upon my forehead,
A harp within my hand.
There right before my Savior,
So glorious and so bright,
I'd make the sweetest music
And praise him day and night.

I never would be weary,
Nor ever shed a tear,
Nor ever know a sorrow,
Nor ever feel a fear;
But blessed, pure, holy,
I'd dwell in Jesus' sight,
And with ten thousand thousands
Praise Him both day and night.

I know I'm weak and sinful,
But Jesus will forgive,
For many little children
Have gone to heaven to live.
Dear Savior, when I languish,
And lay me down to die,
Oh, send a shining angel,
And bear me to the sky.

Oh, there I'll be an angel,
And with the angels stand,
A crown upon my forehead,
A harp within my hand;
And there, before my Savior,
So glorious and so bright,
I'll join the heavenly music
And praise Him day and night.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

The following, found in Minor's book, is also quite other-worldly.

Is thy young heart, O happy child,
Now filled with youthful pleasure?
Look up from these, and ne'er forget
To place in heaven thy treasure!

It won't be long ere childhood's days
Have passed forever.
Then look beyond, and see thy home,
Beyond the rolling river.

A similar song in the same book is:

There are bright little ones,
Both at home and in the street,
Whose souls are most precious and sweet.

There are fair little ones
In the Sabbath School,
For whom I am laboring.

If Jesus should summon
The children away
In the midst of their mirth and glee,

Will any of them
At the beautiful gate
Be waiting and watching for me,

Be waiting and watching for me,
Any of them at the beautiful gate
Be waiting and watching for me?

However, it is not to be inferred that this classification covers all the hymns of these books, but merely that it is a good general classification. All of them have a few classical hymns. In this respect Minor's book is typical, which has the following standard hymns:

Rock of Ages Cleft for Me.
Blest Be the Tie that Binds.
All Hail the Power of Jesus' Name.
Just As I Am Without One Plea.
I Think When I Read that Sweet Story of Old.
Alas! and Did My Savior Bleed!
Come, Thou Fount of Every Blessing!

EARLY SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNS

Jesus, I Love Thy Charming Name.
Nearer, My God, to Thee.
Asleep in Jesus! Blessed Sleep.
When I Can Read My Title Clear.
Sweet Hour of Prayer.

During the last decade of the nineteenth century, just prior to the dawn of the modern era of Sunday School work and Religious Education, the editor of **THE CHRISTIAN OBSERVER**, the leading paper of the Southern Presbyterian Church, put forth a successful and interesting effort to have the children of his constituency memorize hymns, along with the catechisms. He obtained the following results¹:

	1891	1892	1893
² Learning Hymns.....	459	211	225
Westminster Catechism.....	1,319	461	661
Child's Catechism.....	154	384	225

In 1894 the memorizing of hymns was dropped, and Psalms and chapters of the Bible took their place. It is interesting to note that the Sunday Schools reporting the largest number of children learning hymns were: York, South Carolina; a Mission School near Smyrna, Tennessee; Benair School and First Church, Nashville, Tennessee. During this period the editor encouraged the children to write him about their experiences in memorizing hymns, and he published in **THE OBSERVER** a number of these letters. One of them appeared under the heading, **³A VERY YOUNG HYMN LEARNER**. It was,

“Dear Mr. ⁴Converse—You will please place my name on your honor roll. I am a little Presbyterian, two years old, and I have learned perfectly the first two verses of I Am So Glad That Our Father In Heaven. . . . Your little friend,

.....
Fairfield, Texas.”

1. **CHRISTIAN OBSERVER**, January 31, 1894.

2. These figures refer to the number of children getting on the honor roll for such attainments.

3. January 31, 1894.

4. Editor.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Another appeared under the title, ⁵A MODEST LIST OF HYMNS, and read:

“Dear Mr. Converse—I am a girl ten years old. I have learned eighteen hymns and recited them perfectly to mamma. They are as follows:

One There is Above All Others.
While Shepherds Watched Their Flocks.
Ah, How Shall Fallen Man!
Let Every Mortal Ear Attend.
Behold a Stranger at the Door.
With Tearful Eyes I Look Around.
Come Humble Sinner.
How Firm a Foundation.
I Heard the Voice of Jesus Say.
I Lay My Sins on Jesus.
Must Jesus Bear the Cross Alone?
Indulgent Father, By Whose Care.
Safely Through Another Week.
Around the Throne in Heaven.
I Want to be with Jesus.
From Greenland’s Icy Mountains.
Jerusalem, My Happy Home.
Softly Fades the Twilight Ray.

Please put my name on the honor roll. I have a little sister four years old. She also knows parts of two hymns....

Your friend,

.....
Bunker Hill, Mo.”

5. January 17, 1894.

CHAPTER XIII

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

The modern Sunday School has three types of hymns in general use.

1. THERE ARE HYMNS OF THE JAZZ TYPE. Many of these are the usual revival hymns. Others, though not having an evangelistic appeal, are also jazzy. Those who advocate these hymns do so on the assumption that youth will have nothing slow and dull, and that the more noise the singing of a hymn makes the greater is its appeal to children and young people. In schools using these books, the same book is generally used for all classes. Most of the small schools and many of the large ones use such books. Robert H. Coleman, of Dallas, has put out several of the higher type of such books that have met the desires of the Baptist Schools along this line, while the Methodist Publishing House at Nashville has turned out several books that have filled a like place among the Methodists, chief of which is the first Cokesbury Hymnal.

2. In the modern Sunday School one also finds a type of hymn and hymnal that is based upon present day RELIGIOUS AND EDUCATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY and that is adapted to the modern departmental Sunday School.

The first attempt in the South to get out such a book seems to have been made by Mrs. Crosby Adams. Miss Minnie E. Kennedy, after years of experience with children's work in the Sunday School in her official capacity with the General Sunday School Board of the Southern Methodist Church, realized the great need for books and songs of this type. She wanted someone to write such books and hymns. Knowing the ability and experience of Mrs. Crosby Adams, she quite naturally suggested to her such an undertaking. A sketch of the life of Mrs. Adams causes one to realize that Miss Kennedy had good reasons for selecting her. She was born and spent the first twenty-one years of her life at Niagara Falls. Studying at first under local music teachers,

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

she soon came under the direction of C. S. P. Cary, a noted teacher of Rochester.¹ "At twenty-one she accepted a position as teacher in Ingham University, Le Roy, New York, and there also continued her studies under Professor Claude Crittendon, a pupil of Kiel, Kullak and Liszt. After four years' experience as a teacher in this school, she married Mr. Crosby Adams, and their first home was in Buffalo, New York, where both Mr. and Mrs. Adams became prominently identified with the musical interests of the city. Later they moved to Kansas City, where Mrs. Adams' talents won recognition and secured for her a large student and artistic following. She was also organist of one of the largest churches of the city."

In 1892 Mr. and Mrs. Adams moved to Chicago, and Mrs. Adams at once entered upon an active musical life in the city. Her success there was most pronounced. For the last seventeen years she has lived in North Carolina, and now in a cozy rustic cottage upon a mountain side within the Montreat Assembly Reservation Mr. and Mrs. Adams reside, and annually to their home come music teachers and lovers in search of the benefits of the instruction of both of them, for Mr. Adams is also a noted musician. Perhaps, the greatest tribute to the ability of Mrs. Adams as a musician came several years ago when the members of the North Carolina Women's Committee for the Sesqui-Centennial Exposition at Philadelphia chose her as the outstanding woman in North Carolina in music for the last fifty years. This Committee also selected the leading woman in North Carolina in the respective realms of literature, civics and art.

*"Mrs. Adams has made a speciality of children's work She has chosen for her special branch of musical composition that of preparing music for little children, which, while at once instructive and well constructed, is also interesting to them. Through her long experience as a teacher and through her observance of child nature she discovered the fact that the study of music in its foundation as to the material presented to the child was often not only uninteresting but trivial and not suited to its needs.

1. Pamphlet, "A BRIEF SKETCH OF THE WORK OF MRS. CROSBY ADAMS."
*Ibid.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

"Mrs. Adams' theory was to enter into the child's work and to adopt words and melodies which, without being childish, were childlike and quite within his easy grasp." She says, ²"I am largely concerned in inducing children to approach music from the angle of serious study and yet to express themselves in an artistic way. One thing I have emphasized all my life is that the child has good gray matter. The study of music should be approached in a dignified way. While I have written very simple things, I have never written anything essentially childish. I feel you can't give trivial, inconsequential music to a child and expect a worth-while reaction."

Her productions in the fields of vocal and instrumental music number about seventy-five, all of which have been published by Clayton F. Summy Company, of Chicago. The three that are in the realm of modern Sunday School hymnals are: *WORSHIP SONGS FOR BEGINNERS*, *WORSHIP SONGS FOR PRIMARIES*, *WORSHIP SONGS FOR YOUTH*,

The work of Miss Elizabeth McE. Shields conforms more definitely to the desires and needs of the leaders of the modern Religious Education movement. As a teacher in the public schools and Sunday Schools of Memphis, Tennessee, Miss Shields began to give attention to the problems of religious education. For the last eighteen years she has been connected in various capacities with the production of the Sunday School literature of the Southern Presbyterian Church, with headquarters at Richmond, Virginia. During this period she has paid special attention to work with beginners, and has collected a number of hymns and songs for that group which have appeared from time to time in Sunday School periodicals, and which last year were published by the Presbyterian Committee on Publication at Richmond as *WORSHIP AND CONDUCT SONGS FOR BEGINNERS AND PRIMARIES*. ³The Foreword, which follows almost in full, gives a splendid idea of the general purpose and nature of this book.

"The songs in this book have been written with individual children and groups of children in mind. While

2. *THE MUSICAL OBSERVER*, January, 1924.

3. Used by permission of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, Richmond, Virginia.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

especially prepared for the Church School and home it may find a place also in the day school, kindergarten and first three grades. We at first thought it possible to make a clear-cut division into two sections, 'Songs for Beginners' and 'Songs for Primaries,' but this was not practicable because there is much overlapping. Then, too, no two people would absolutely agree in selecting songs under this classification.

"With a few exceptions, all the songs in the book may be used with Primaries. We do not so much fear that the Primaries will be introduced to songs that are too simple as that Beginners will be introduced to songs that are beyond their understanding.

"As a guide to untrained teachers, we suggest that the first fifty-six songs are songs from which teachers of Beginners may choose, adding Nos. 65, 74, 75, 81, 85 and 110.

"Primary teachers may choose from the whole book, possibly in some cases omitting....

"In writing and selecting the songs the following tests have been kept in mind:

1. The words should be good, having literary as well as religious value.
2. The words and ideas should express the thoughts of little children. (Do not use symbolic language.)
3. The music should be good.
4. The music should suit the words.
5. The harmony should be simple.
6. The music should be within the range of the children's voices.
7. The music should be truly rhythmic.

"There are a few songs that include in their range an occasional note or two lower than our accepted range, but it will be observed that these notes are merely touched. The melody for the most part is within the range of little children's voices. We have tried to remember that beginners sing best the notes f, g, a, b, c, d, and e on the staff, preferably omitting the lower f.

"Primaries sing best the notes on the staff.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

“A NIGHT TIME SONG, number fifty-five, is too low for very little children to sing. It is included for the use of mothers as a bedtime song or as a lullaby to be sung by a teacher while the children are resting. This applies especially to the Beginners’ Department in a Vacation Church School.

“Realizing that no one book in this field will satisfy every teacher, we have included blank pages so that worthwhile songs from other sources may be pasted into the book, thus obviating the necessity, in some cases, of an additional loose leaf book.

“This collection of songs goes out as an attempted help in the selection of material, but very often the use of a song and the method of teaching it are as important as the selection.

“The song should be related definitely to the plans for the day. Often there comes a time when the song or a verse of it may be sung by the teacher without any further use of it at that time. This brings to mind the fact that often one verse only of a song should be sung to the children or by the children. For example, the Primaries are interested in a missionary project, studying the customs and interests of children in different countries. They should use the particular verse of **THE WORLD IS A WONDERFUL HOME** which suits the country they are studying.

“If the teacher of Beginners or Primaries has led her group into conversation about night-time, one verse only of God’s **WORLD** should be sung.

“It is very important that prayer songs be recognized as prayers. Often instead of saying the words of a formal prayer we may sing them. Examples of this type of song are found in Nos. 1, 9, 14, 16, 21, 22, 25, 26, 78, 104, 105.

“Several selections of quiet music are included. The children may be taught to listen quietly if they are taught to listen for something definite in the music.

“Many of the worship songs may be used for quiet music. Nos. 1, 3, 10, 21, 55, 56, 59-62, 64-66 are especially suitable for such use.

“The way in which this quiet music is played should be given first consideration. In fact, the best pianist available should be chosen to play for Beginners or Primaries. Some

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

of us feel this so strongly that our advice is 'Sing without the piano rather than have a poor pianist.' The tempo, the mood, the indescribable something which we call sympathy are so vital to the proper interpretation of music that it is a mistake to feel that anyone who can play notes correctly is efficient enough to play for little children.

"Teachers are urged to read the discussions of music in the worth-while Beginner and Primary Leadership Training textbooks published by the various Church School boards.

"As soon as our teachers realize that real teaching is done through the use of music the standards for selecting songs will be raised and the methods of using them will be improved."

This little book has 113 numbers, besides a section of merely instrumental pieces. The topical index groups the songs about the following subjects: Listening and Talking to God, God's Care, Praise Songs, God's World, The Church, God's Day, God's Book, Giving, Songs About Jesus, Special, Thanksgiving, Myself and Others, Near-by and Far-Away Friends, My Work, Obedience, Birthdays, Lullabies, Story Songs, Our Country, Play Songs, Instrumental Music, Benediction. Miss Shields wrote the words of thirty-five pieces and the music of twenty-seven, in addition to the melody of three others.

Mrs. Elda Fleet Baker wrote the music of ten of the songs. Mrs. Baker is a native of Canada and a graduate of the Toronto Conservatory of Music. She has taught voice and piano, and has been the organist of several churches. Her husband, Rev. Wesley Baker, graduated from the Union Theological Seminary of Richmond, since which he has been pastor of the Presbyterian Church at Abingdon, Virginia, and superintendent of Leadership Training of the Southern Presbyterian Church, holding the latter position for ten years. For a number of years Mrs. Baker has been superintendent of the Beginners' Department of the Ginter Park Presbyterian Church of Richmond. This work caused her to realize that there was a need for songs within the range of the experience and understanding of such children. The songs they were using had words that were too difficult and too symbolic for beginners. As Miss Shields is also a member of the Ginter Park Church, quite naturally the two became

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

co-workers in the great task of producing more satisfactory music for the smaller children of the Sunday School, *THE BEGINNERS' SONGS* book being one of the results. Mrs. Baker has also written music for Sunday School songs that have appeared in those publications of the Sunday School Board of the Methodist Episcopal Church now being edited by Miss Ethel Smither, formerly of Richmond, and for a number of years Elementary Superintendent of the Sunday Schools of the Virginia Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Many of her musical compositions have also appeared in the *BEGINNERS' TEACHERS' QUARTERLY* (Southern Presbyterian), which Miss Shields edits. One Sunday seeing in the bulletin of her church the little poem, *THE WORLD'S BIBLE*, she thought it worthy of being sung, and wrote music for it for the 1928 Commencement of the Presbyterian General Assembly Training School at Richmond. She has since sung it many times. As it would seem that this little poem should be included in some Sunday School hymnal, it follows:

THE WORLD'S BIBLE

"Christ has no hands but our hands
To do His work to-day;
He has no feet but our feet
To lead men in His way;
He has no tongue but our tongues
To tell men how He died,
He has no help but our help
To bring them to His side.
We are the only Bible
The careless world will read,
We are the sinner's gospel,
We are the scoffer's creed;
We are the Lord's last message,
Given in deed and word,
What if the type is crooked?
What if the print is blurred?
What if our hands are busy
With other work than His?
What if our feet are walking
Where sin's allurement is?
What if our tongues are speaking
Of things His lips would spurn?
How can we hope to help Him
And hasten His Return?"

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Mr. Claude T. Carr, Director of the Sunday School work of the North Carolina Synod of the Presbyterian Church, wrote the music for seven pieces in *WORK AND CONDUCT SONGS FOR BEGINNERS AND PRIMARIES*. Mr. Carr was a public school teacher and superintendent of the junior department of a Sunday School before entering upon his present work.

Miss Nancy Byrd Turner, a native of Virginia, but at present a member of the editorial staff of the *YOUTHS' COMPANION*, wrote the words of four pieces. Mrs. Crosby Adams composed the music of three, and Miss Ethel Smither wrote the words of two, both of which are nature songs. Miss Smither also is author of the melody of one of these.

Mrs. Martha L. Shillito is author of the music of five and of the words of one. Mrs. Shillito is a primary Sunday School teacher in a Presbyterian Church of Birmingham, Alabama, and occasionally writes songs for use with the children with whom she works.

In 1927 the Presbyterian Committee of Publication brought out *Junior Hymns and Songs*, which Miss Shields edited and composed. The "preface is quoted to show the general nature of the book:

"In this collection of songs for Junior boys and girls we have constantly kept a number of things in mind. We have sincerely tried to select only those songs which meet the following tests:

1. Are the words good; have they literary value?
2. Have the words spiritual value?
3. Can Junior boys and girls mean the words?
4. Is the music good?
5. Do the words suit the music?
6. Will Junior boys and girls like this song?

"These tests have been rather severe on some of the jingly songs which some boys and girls like, for we only put the last test to the song after it had met the other five.

"The tests were equally severe on some of the songs and hymns which mean a great deal to adults. The omission of

4. Used by permission of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, Richmond, Virginia.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

these hymns does not mean that the compiler does not value them. It only means that while Juniors store up a great deal for the future they do this along the line of their experiences in the present and many of our old church hymns will have a richer significance if introduced later.

"In all honesty, we are compelled to admit that some of the songs which, from our standpoint, have passed all the tests except the last, will not at first pass this test if the boys and girls have been fed in the past on a cheap type of music.

"We recognize also that the method of introducing a song often has as much to do with the enjoyment of those who sing it as has the song itself. Therefore, we have included some which depend at least in a degree on this introduction.

"In addition to a recognition of the restrictions listed above, we recognize the need for an inexpensive Junior hymnal. We have many wealthy schools who can purchase a variety of expensive books, but we have also many schools that cannot afford this and the request is often voiced, 'Give us one book that will contain enough songs for use in various Church School sessions—Sunday, week-day and vacation sessions and Junior societies.'"

This book also has 113 songs, besides a section of instrumental selections. Of the 113, Miss Shields wrote the words of nine and the music of four, Mr. C. T. Carr the words of two and the music of twelve, Mrs. Elda Fleet Baker the music of twelve, Miss Nancy Byrd Turner the words of eight, Mrs. Shillito the words of one and the music of another, and Rev. S. K. Emurian, a native Armenian, but then pastor of a church at Suffolk, Virginia, also the music of one and the words of another.

The topical index is suggestive of the type of songs it contains, and has the following headings of the songs: Birth of Jesus, Conduct Songs, Evening, Giving, God's Care, God in Nature, Heaven, Life and Death of Jesus, New Year, Praise, Prayer, Resurrection, Sabbath, Thanksgiving, and World Friendliness.

A comparison of these two books with each other and with the late Presbyterian Hymnal is interesting and enlightening. The songs in the Beginners and Primary book are, on the whole, much shorter than those in the Junior

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

book, fifty-eight of them having only one verse; twenty-six, two verses; twelve, three verses; one, five verses; leaving only seventeen to have four verses. In the Junior book only twenty-eight have one verse; eighteen have two verses; twenty-four have three verses; leaving fifty-six out of the total of 113 to have four or more verses. Thus, whereas fifteen per cent of the Beginners' and Primary hymns have four or more verses, over forty-nine per cent of the Junior hymns are that long or longer. This reveals that Miss Shields has paid much attention to the differences in ability due to the age differences of children. It is quite fitting that more than half of the Beginners and Primary Songs have one verse, since a large percentage of these children cannot read and nearly all of them who can read have not advanced sufficiently in school to read quickly the words out of a song book. This means that they must, to a great degree, memorize songs, and, therefore, the songs should be short. Also at that early age the ability to sustain interest for a long period has not developed. Recognition by Miss Shields of the advance in years and mental development of the Juniors over the Beginners and Primaries is seen in the high percentage of longer songs in the Junior book. Yet their limited development is recognized, since half of the Juniors' hymns have three verses or less, whereas nearly all of the hymns in a church hymnal have more than three verses.

Such differences are further revealed in the following facts: Only twenty selections in the Beginners and Primary Songs appear in the Junior book and only three of them in the Presbyterian Hymnal. They are:

Holy, Holy, Holy, Lord God of Hosts.
Jesus Loves Me.

Praise God From Whom All Blessings Flow.

Fifty-nine or fifty-two percent. of the pieces in JUNIOR HYMNS AND SONGS are in the Presbyterian Hymnal. These include the following nineteen standard hymns:

1. All Hail the Power of Jesus' Name.
2. Christ the Lord is Risen To-day.
3. Day is Dying in the West.
4. From Greenland's Icy Mountains.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

5. Hark, the Herald Angels Sing.
6. Holy, Holy, Holy!
7. I Love to Tell the Story.
8. It Came Upon the Midnight Clear.
9. Jesus Shall Reign Where'er the Sun.
10. Lead on, O King Eternal.
11. My Country, 'Tis of Thee.
12. O Little Town of Bethlehem.
13. O Zion Haste.
14. Safely Through Another Week.
15. Savior, Like a Shepherd.
16. Sharing.
17. Silent Night, Holy Night.
18. True Hearted, Whole Hearted.
19. While Shepherds Watched Their Flocks.

The Methodist Church, in the main, has used a different method for getting suitable hymns for its Sunday School work. Its Sunday School Board has made a study of existing hymn books and has selected approved lists of books for various departments if they meet certain standards. The reasons for doing so and the lists of books follow:

APPROVED SONG BOOKS FOR METHODIST SUNDAY SCHOOLS

"Worship is a very important factor in the work of religious education. One of the essential elements in the worship program and in training in worship is the music to be used. The kind of music selected will determine its value in the worship program. Not all song books are wholly good or wholly bad. The Programs of Work which are being used by the Sunday Schools of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, lay special emphasis upon the place and importance of worship, and require that only approved song books shall be used if the school is desirous of receiving credit for this item. It is necessary, therefore, that a list of books be prepared from which the musical selections for use in the Sunday School session may be made.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

"A special committee of the General Sunday School Board has been making an investigation of the available song books which contain the minimum of good music at a price within the reach of the average church or school. Any person or school has the right to use any book which it may choose, without regard to whether it has been approved by the committee, but for purposes of definite guidance it has been necessary to provide an approved book list, from which list it will be necessary to select certain books if credit is to be granted on the Program of Work. The purpose of this approved list is, therefore, to give guidance to pastors, superintendents, and others whose responsibility it is to purchase song books, so that they may have the judgment of the General Board Committee in making their selection.

"SOME TESTS APPLIED BY THE COMMITTEE

"In passing upon the merits of song books for Methodist Sunday Schools, the committee has undertaken to apply tests such as the following: (1) Are the words worthy? That is, is the poetry good and are the words worth remembering? What is the meaning of the hymn? What is its purpose? (2) Are the tunes worth while? Are they within the reach of the voices without straining? Are the tunes genuinely good music? Do they create an atmosphere of reverence, or are they frivolous, light and, perhaps, Jazzy? (3) Are the words and tunes properly adapted one to the other? (4) Are the tunes and words suited to the spiritual needs of the group by which they are to be used? (5) Are the mechanical points of the books such as to merit the respect of the users? Is the binding attractive? Is the printing good? (6) Were the songs written for the avowed purposes of the Sunday School? Do they lend themselves to purposes of training pupils to worship? Do they aid in establishing an atmosphere of fellowship? (7) Are the Scripture readings suited to the group? Are they well arranged? (8) Are the songs so classified that the leader may easily select appropriate songs for given themes? (9) Are the prices reasonable?

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

"FOR SUNDAY SCHOOLS OF THE A AND B TYPE

1. Beginner Department (*children four and five years*).

SONGS FOR LITTLE PEOPLE.* Pilgrim Press.

SONGS FOR THE LITTLE CHILD. Abingdon Press.

WORSHIP SONGS FOR BEGINNERS. Summy & Company.

2. Primary Department (*children six, seven and eight years*).

WORSHIP SONGS FOR PRIMARIES. Summy & Company.

SONGS FOR LITTLE PEOPLE.* Pilgrim Press.

MELODIES. Leyda Publishing Company.

CAROLS. Leyda Publishing Company.

3. Junior Department (*children nine, ten and eleven years*).

HYMNAL FOR AMERICAN YOUTH.* Century Publishing Company.

JUNIOR HYMNS AND CAROLS. Leyda Publishing Company

JUNIOR SONGS AND PROGRAMS. Lamar & Whitmore.

WORSHIP AND SONG (Revised).* Pilgrim Press.

THE METHODIST HYMNAL.* Lamar & Whitmore.

NOTE—All books marked thus* are to be used by the group indicated only in a limited manner; the songs which are especially recommended and approved are listed separately and may be secured from the Department of Elementary Work.

4. Intermediate, Senior and Young People's Departments (*twelve to twenty-four years*).

HYMNAL FOR AMERICAN YOUTH. Century Publishing Company.

WORSHIP AND SONG (Revised). Pilgrim Press.

THE SCHOOL HYMNAL. A. S. Barnes & Company.

THE METHODIST HYMNAL.* Lamar & Whitmore.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

5. *Adult Department (twenty-four and up).*

THE METHODIST HYMNAL. Lamar & Whitmore.

HYMNAL FOR AMERICAN YOUTH. Century Publishing Company.

THE METHODIST SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNAL. Methodist Book Concern.

COKESBURY HYMNAL. Lamar & Whitmore.

WORSHIP IN SONG. Lamar & Whitmore.

GLORIA. A. S. Barnes Publishing Company.

“FOR THE SMALL SCHOOL AND SCHOOLS WHICH COMBINE THREE OR MORE AGE GROUPS FOR THE WORSHIP SERVICE

1. If groups are separated in accord with any of the departments in the preceding list, then any of the books so approved may be used for these groups in the small school. For the Beginner-Primary it is required that their teachers shall be supplied with a sufficient number of copies of SONGS FOR LITTLE PEOPLE, MELODIES, or CAROLS and the children shall be taught suitable songs from one of these books.

2. For all other age groups meeting together the following are approved:

THE METHODIST HYMNAL. Lamar & Whitmore.

HYMNAL FOR AMERICAN YOUTH. Century Publishing Company.

WORSHIP AND SONG (Revised). Pilgrim Press.

COKESBURY HYMNAL. Lamar & Whitmore.

THE METHODIST SUNDAY SCHOOL HYMNAL. Methodist Book Concern.

GLORIA. A. S. Barnes Publishing Company.”

*Dr. John W. Shackford, General Secretary of the Sunday School Board of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, hopes to have made a more extensive and thorough study of worth-while hymn and song books, in order to offer even more expert guidance to his constituency in the matter of the selection of hymns and books. His idea is for each hymn to

*He no longer holds this position, but is pastor in North Carolina.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

be studied by several good psychologists of religion and also by several outstanding theologians, the former to determine at what period in the life of the pupil a hymn should be used and the latter to classify its subject matter. Such a study, when published and distributed, would at once make available the whole field of suitable song material for the respective departments of the Sunday School.

The children's section of the new COKESBURY HYMNAL has a few splendid songs for children. They are:

Opening Prayer.

Friends. (By Miss Elizabeth McE. Shields.)

Jesus Loves Me.

Luther's Cradle Hymn.

Winter Hymn.

The World Children for Jesus.

God Bless the Children.

The Star-Spangled Banner.

America.

God of Our Fathers, Whose Almighty Hand.

America the Beautiful.

Mrs. Katherine B. Rondthaler, wife of Dr. Howard Rondthaler, President of Salem College, Winston-Salem, North Carolina, has done a notable piece of work with the small children of her Sunday School. She has put the following hymns, which she selected from various books, on a chart upon which the children look and read the hymns as they sing, those who can read well, of course, somewhat guiding the others.

MRS. RONDTHALER'S LIST

Onward Christian Soldiers.

Savior Teach Me Day By Day.

Now the Day is Over.

I Love to Tell the Story.

Savior Like a Shepherd Lead Us.

Over the Ocean Wave.

From Greenland's Icy Mountains.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Yield Not to Temptation.
Jesus, Tender Shepherd Lead Us.
Jesus, Gentle Savior.
I Am a Little Child.
Blessed Savior, Thee I Love.
When He Cometh to Make Up His Jewels.
He Leadeth Me.
Send Out the Sunlight of Love.
Jesus Wants Me for a Sunbeam.
Jesus Loves Me.
A Little Light to Shine at Night.
My Country, 'Tis of Thee.

In her letter she adds, "We also sing a Good-By Song and a Birthday Song and the following from all sorts of little hymn books for children, the best I could find out of them all:

Can a Little Child Like Me?
The Sweet Story of Old.
Jesus Bids Us Shine.
Father We Thank Thee.
A Rain Song.
What Good News the Angels Bring!
O Little Town of Bethlehem.
Christ the Lord is Born To-day.
Glory to God in the Highest.

These are not on the chart, but they can sing them by memory."

3. THERE ARE SOUTHERN SUNDAY SCHOOLS THAT USE ONLY THEIR OFFICIAL DENOMINATIONAL HYMNALS. The leaders of such schools do not like jazz music, and they believe that the only way to train a generation away from it is to familiarize the youth of to-day with classical and dignified hymns and music. Indications, however, are that these schools are much smaller both in number and size than those of either of the other two groups.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

In 1925 Mr. M. W. Brabham, then Superintendent of the Department of Sunday School Administration of the General Sunday School Board of the Southern Methodist Church, submitted to the Department of Religious Education of George Peabody College, Nashville, Tennessee, his M. A. Thesis which was entitled, "A Study of the Sunday School." The part of this thesis devoted to the hymnology situation in the Sunday Schools of his church contains a wide survey of the song books then used by those schools as well as helpful comments on the situation. The information was obtained from the official reports that came to him as a result of the annual checking of the Sunday Schools under his general direction, and from a questionnaire submitted to a number of Sunday Schools by Lamar and Barton, publishing agents at that time for the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. In these ways, 2,209 Southern Methodist Sunday Schools were studied, and with the following results regarding hymn and song books:

⁵BRABHAM'S SURVEY OF BOOKS USED IN 2,209 SOUTHERN METHODIST SUNDAY SCHOOLS

BOOKS USED	NUMBER OF SCHOOLS USING IT
Cokesbury Hymnal.....	737
Victory Songs.....	237
Worship in Song.....	179
Methodist Hymnal.....	141
Carols.....	86
Hymns of Praise.....	76
Revival Praises.....	69
Little Hymn Book.....	64
Songs for the Sunday School.....	53
Songs for Service.....	50
Awakening Hymns.....	47
W. W. Revival Songs.....	43
Diadems.....	41
Songs of Hope.....	37
His Praise.....	34
Gospel Songs (Rhodeheaver).....	31
His Voice of Love.....	29

5. "A Study of the Sunday School," by M. W. Brabham, Page 105.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

BOOKS USED	NUMBER OF SCHOOLS USING IT
Hymnal for American Youth.....	23
Highway Hymnal.....	22
Eternal Praise.....	20
Revival Songs.....	16
Joy to the World.....	15
Worship Songs for Primary.....	14
Junior Songs and Progress.....	14
Crowns.....	9
Revival Selections.....	8
Primary and Junior Hymnal.....	8
Melodies.....	8
Hymns of Glory.....	7
Other books were used by only seven schools or less.	

Commenting on these results, Mr. Brabham wrote,⁶ "The song book most generally used, according to both lists, is the **COKESBURY HYMNAL**. Practically one third of the 2,209 schools reported are using this particular book for the whole school or for groups above nine years of age. The book not on the approved list having the highest score is **VICTORY SONGS**, this ranking next to the **COKESBURY HYMNAL** and slightly ahead of **WORSHIP IN SONG**, which is an approved book.

"The variety of song book titles in use is significant. . . . One hundred and eleven titles are to be found. Of these . . . eleven are to be found on the approved list, leaving an even hundred titles in use which are not considered up to the standard of what a song book should be."

Mr. Brabham, in his annual report for the years 1924-1925 to Dr. John W. Shackford, said the following concerning the hymn book situation:⁷ "The department has been the medium through which much correspondence concerning song books for the Sunday School has passed. This is natural, in view of the fact that one of the two points in our standards refers to the use of approved books. When it is observed that the type of books so commonly used is that of a very undesirable quality, regardless of the size and location of the school, it may be readily seen that the situation is a deplorable one. There is hope in the fact that such a large

6. Ibid: Pages 145-146.

7. Ibid: Pages 175-176.

THE MODERN SUNDAY SCHOOL

percentage of schools have within the past two years adopted a book widely advertised by our publishers. This leads me to express the conviction that our people will buy a book put before them in the right manner. The particular book referred to is far beyond the average song book generally used, and it marks a decided advance over some other books. This does not mean, however, that we have solved the problem, for even the book in mind at this point was not prepared for Sunday School purposes and with the possible exception of the adult groups, it fails to meet our needs. . . . The Superintendent of Sunday School Administration is doing all he possibly can through the programs of work, in training courses for administrative leaders, in addresses and through the printed page to assist in this phase of the work."

BOOK IV

RESULTS OF SOUTHERN
HYMNOLOGY

CHAPTER XIV

RESULTS UPON THE INDIVIDUAL, FAMILY AND CONGREGATION

1. UPON THE INDIVIDUAL. James Mudge says:
¹ "It pays to explore the hymn country. There are riches and beauties in it almost inexhaustible. To take only the productions of Frederick W. Faber and Frances Ridley Havergal, he who has an eye to see and a heart to feel will discover in them the deepest, sweetest things of the Christian life so attractively portrayed and musically presented as to have a doubled and trebled charm. . . . A hymn is a wing by which the soul soars above earthly cares and toils into a purer air and a clearer sunshine. And when the hymn is married to such melody as is its fitting meter, we have two wings with which to speed our flight towards the heavens. Naught can better scatter the devils of melancholy and gloom, of doubt and fear. Praise predominates in the hymns that are dearest to the Christian, praise and prayer. Both these sentiments are greatly intensified by being wedded to music. When they have passed through some poet's passionate soul, and he has fixed them in a form of expression where beauty is united to strength, then these sentences, at once concentrated and ornamented, melt the deep needs of great numbers. Our feelings are not only poured forth through them, but greatly stimulated by them, and so we gain double benefit."

A former pastor in the Virginia Conference of the Methodist Church in writing not long ago the memoir of a friend told how his friend, just before death, had his daughter sing some of his favorite hymns, including "Blessed Assurance, Jesus is Mine," after which he added, "Jesus is mine." The writer states that the widow after the death said she knew where to find her husband. One can readily imagine the comfort to her bleeding heart as she read these lines,

1. James Mudge in the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*, April 6, 1903.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

forming the close of her husband's memoir in her church paper,

"O how sweet it will be in that beautiful land,
So free from all sorrow and pain,
With songs on our lips and with harp in hand
To meet one another again."

The following extract from the SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN² tells of an instance in which hymns have helped people to endure their trouble cheerfully. The article is headed SCENES UPON A BATTLEFIELD.

"A brave and good captain told one of us this story as we were moving him to the hospital. He was shot through both thighs with a rifle bullet—a wound from which he could never recover. While lying on the field he suffered intense agony from thirst. He supported his head upon his hand, and the rain from heaven was falling around him. In a little while a pool of water formed under his elbow, and he thought if he could only get to that pool he might quench his thirst. He tried to get into a position to suck up a mouthful of muddy water but he was unable to reach within a foot of it. Said he, 'I never felt so much the loss of any earthly blessing.' By and by night fell, and the stars shone out clear and beautiful over the dark field; and I began to think of the great God who had given His son to die a death of agony for me and that He was up there—up above the scene of suffering, and above those glorious stars; and I felt I was going home to meet Him, and praise Him there; and I felt that I ought to praise God, even if wounded and on the battlefield. I could not help singing the beautiful hymn, 'When I Can Read My Title Clear!'

"And he said, 'There was a Christian brother in the brush near me. I could not see him, but I could hear him. He took up the strain; and beyond him another and another caught it up all over the battlefield. That night the echo was resounding, and we made the field of battle ring with hymns of praise to God.' "

The following interesting story also is taken from the Southern Churchman:³ "A few weeks ago a little boy came to

2. November 23, 1869.
3. October 7, 1869.

RESULTS UPON THE INDIVIDUAL

one of our ward missionaries, and holding up a dirty and worn-out bit of printed paper, said, 'Please, Sir, Father sent me to get a clean paper like that.' Taking it from his hand the missionary unfolded it, and found that it was a page containing—Just as I Am.

"The missionary looked down with interest into the face earnestly upturned to him, and asked the little boy where he got it and why he wanted a clean one. 'We found it, Sir,' said he, 'in Sister's pocket after she died, and she used to sing it all the time while she was sick, and she loved it so much that Father wanted to get a clean one, and put it in a frame to hang up. Won't you please give us a clean one?'"

The next extract reveals the power a hymn has had to strengthen people in the hour when almost superhuman power was needed.

4 "A fire broke out on one of the Mississippi River steamers, and before rescues could be made the boat sank. Soon scores of people were afloat in the stream, clinging to anything that could buoy them up. Three women were clinging to a large plank. Soon the cold water began to affect one of them with numbness, and at last she said, 'I cannot hold on any longer, I am exhausted.' 'O, you must, you must! See they are coming from the shore to rescue us. Hold fast,' said her companion. Revived for a moment or two she held on but soon she cried again, 'I cannot! I am fainting.' Almost beside themselves they urged her to hold out a little longer; help was near at hand, and then suddenly one of the two exclaimed: 'Sing, Sadie, sing something!' The other immediately began to sing that old hymn, Jesus Lover of My Soul, and as the clear voice rang out over the water, heads were raised, hands took a firmer grip, and new life entered into fainting hearts, and now here and now there a voice joined in until fifty or one hundred benumbed people were singing the grand old hymn of intercession. The rescuers soon arrived and were able to save everyone and to take them safely to the land. Many were saved from a watery grave by the singing of a simple hymn."

During the suffering and anxiety of the Civil War there were many articles in the Southern Churchman pleading

4. Rev. C. L. Davis in *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*, January 29, 1926.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

for the use of hymns as a means of power for enduring the very trying experiences of those days. On July 1, 1864, one reads the following on its pages: "In times like these, when many are sick and wounded, it will be profitable for them, and for all of us, to read over these dear old hymns, which some of us have read so often, and always with benefit. . . .

Come, Ye Sinners, Poor and Wretched.
Sent in Mercy from Above.
Just as I Am Without One Plea.
Jesus, I My Cross Have Taken."

And at a later date in the same paper reference was made to the following hymn as being especially profitable to those times:

⁵"Encouraged by Thy word
Of promise to the poor,
Behold a beggar, Lord.
No hand, no heart, O Lord, but Thine,
Can help or pity wants like mine,

All this day Thy hand has led me,
And I thank Thee for Thy care.
Thou hast clothed and warmed and fed me,
Listen to my evening prayer.

Let my sins be all forgiven,
Bless the friends I love so well;
Take me when I die to heaven;
Happy there with Thee to dwell."

A writer in the NASHVILLE ADVOCATE says: ⁶"I remember two great hymns that arose like glittering planets in my boyhood's sky and lead me on. One was Seagrave's noble hymn, 'Rise my soul, and stretch thy wings,' especially this stanza:

Rivers to the ocean run,
Nor stay in all their course;
Fire, ascending, sweeps the sun;
Both speed them to their source.
So a soul that's born of God
Pants to view His glorious face,
Upward tends to His abode,
To rest in His embrace.

5. July 22, 1864.
6. August 18, 1904.

RESULTS UPON THE INDIVIDUAL

"My acquaintance with that hymn began when, as a child, I heard it sung at the funeral of a soldier who had been both a brave officer and a brave Christian. The splendid suggestion of the words formed in my immature yet sensitive spirit an inspiration.

"The other hymn was Zinzendorf's heroic composition founded upon a paragraph in Psalm 139,

'O Thou, to whose all searching sight
The darkness shineth as light.'

"The closing stanzas of the hymn are like lifelong friends fulfilling their blessed ministry through the toil and strain, the cloud and sunshine, the efforts and reactions of many a long year. So dear to me are those words, so charged with holy memories, that when I repeat them the long scroll of the past is unrolled before me."

The next extract also shows the power of hymns to affect a human life. "Psychologically one can see that the hymns that catch the mind and ear of the child are the ones to stay for ever. My childish memory was blessed with the hymn words, *Jesus Sought Me When a Stranger*. It will never cease to affect me powerfully.... Never can I forget the overwhelming force of conviction which came to my childish heart as I heard the solemn words,

'Assured, if my trust betray,
I must forever die.'"

2. HYMNS PRODUCE DESIRABLE RESULTS UPON FAMILY LIFE

In many a home, especially rural homes, on Sunday afternoons and evenings, and also on other evenings, the family joins in singing hymns, and many profitable hours are spent thus. The following poem quite accurately describes the beneficial effects of hymn singing upon home life.

7. W. W. Royall in the NASHVILLE ADVOCATE, January 1, 1915.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

8 MY FATHER'S HYMN BOOK

Faded and torn, the covers old,
The book my father used to hold
With reverent mien, so long ago.
The children clustered, all aglow,
For now the singing hour had come,
Dear to each heart in that sweet home.

The youngest sat, a babe, apart,
Clasped warmly to the mother's heart,
Yet lifting up those clear, gray eyes
(Long filled with light in paradise),
Yet adding then, with happy face,
Her sweet voice, right in time and place.

We sang 'On Jordan's Stormy Banks,'
And where, in blooming, stately ranks,
Heaven's fairest fragrant flowers grow,
Untouched by time or frost; the glow
Upon my father's face, when we
Sang of that land, we all could see.

We sang 'My Soul, Be on Thy Guard,'
And then were gently told to ward,
With constant watch, the foes we meet;
Then, reverently, 'The Mercy Seat';
Then, 'When my righteous judge shall come
To call His ransomed children home.'

Then last we sang, 'Home, Sweet, Home,'
Oh, when shall we too hither come?
The questions answered, one by one
The singers laid their armor down,
Even to the babe, whose heavenly eyes
Have smiled so long in paradise.

And we who stay (so small a band!)
Are gathering upon the strand,
Full pilgrim worn, but still the cheer
And courage from those hymns so dear,
The memory of those singing hours,
Have toned and strengthened all our powers.

The hymn by Aird of Scotland, which follows,⁸ reminds one of the place hymns have in many families and of the

8. From *Nashville Advocate*, August 18, 1904, Vol. 65; reprint from the *Christian Herald*.

9. Only the first two verses are given.

RESULTS UPON THE FAMILY

good that often is derived from the use of them in family life:

O! Sing once more before I go
That old familiar hymn
With Sabbath tones so sweet and low,
Ere morning songs begin.
Sing of the love that never dies,
The friends who never part,
Ere earthly love in silence dies
While heaving on my heart;
O! Sing that holy hymn.

I learned it at my mother's knee
And sung it to my sire;
And I have sung it with them,
Beside our ev'ning fire;
Like odor from a folded rose
'Twill breathe of beauty gone.
Sing, ere earth's twilight shadows close,
For hearts must die alone—
Sing low that parting song.

It is to be expected that many people agree with the author who wrote: ¹⁰ "It would be a good thing if the hymn book. . . . were once more to take its old place in the religious culture of our people. . . . Our children's ideas should be formed by them. They should learn them at the mother's knees. They should sing them at the family altar. They should grow up in their warm, intense, emotional and yet practical influence. A coming generation will be wiser, holier, happier, and more useful people than their fathers and mothers if we use our hymn book for all that it is worth."

3. RESULTS OF THE CONGREGATIONAL USE OF HYMNS

Of course, the chief use of hymns is in the congregation. Singing utilizes about thirty per cent of the time of church services. It is in the church that most people become familiar with hymns, learn their appealing and strengthening words and truths and feel the touch of their inspiring and edifying music. Unfortunate indeed is the life that has not

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

thus accumulated dynamos of power to aid in pulling the long and steep hills of life's highway.¹¹ "To hear a gifted singer, whose heart God has touched and set aglow with reverence in the hour of worship, is as if some gentle and mighty hand were drawing us heavenward. 'I can bring people near God when I sing,' said Jenny Lind."

Basil Manly says,¹² "Good singing is a powerful auxiliary to preaching. Where burning words and living thoughts have come from the sacred desk and impressed themselves upon the minds, how is the effect heightened if, with melody pliantly adapting itself to all the turn and graces of sentiment, kindred thoughts float upon the charmed air, and memory takes up the echo of the sounds and of the ideas to cherish them with fond admiration."

The singing of hymns often emotionalizes an abstract discourse, thus intensifying its effects. This is the chief reason why hymns have such a large place in religious programs, for the primary function of the Christian religion is not to impart truths, but to build character, not to increase knowledge but to improve conduct, not to get people to memorize Scriptural and sermonic phrases but to live in accord with the spirit they inculcate.

It is not surprising, therefore, to hear frequently of people who have been converted as a result of the singing of hymns. One young man said that he was attracted to Christ and began to love and serve Him upon hearing a soloist sing, *I Know That My Redeemer Liveth*. One often reads of incidents like the following, the like of which almost every preacher has witnessed:¹³ "Several years ago while conducting the singing in a revival for a well-known Southern evangelist we were hurriedly called into a home to see a man who in a fit of delirium tremens had attempted suicide. We worked with him until he was sobered up enough to go home. That evening the evangelist preached upon the subject, God is Love. Neither of us knew that the man of the afternoon was present, but he sat in the very back of the church. When the evangelist finished his sermon and

11. C. L. Doris in the *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*, 1925.

12. *BAPTIST CHORALS*, Introduction, Page III.

13. C. L. Doris, *NASHVILLE ADVOCATE*, January 29, 1925.

RESULTS UPON THE CONGREGATION

sat down, extending an altar call, he turned to me and said, 'Sing something.' The tenor and I sang a duet, *Does Jesus Care?* We sang the first three stanzas, when I saw a man pushing his way into the aisle. He rushed to the altar and was happily converted. He declared afterwards that it was the song which had moved him to make the surrender of his life."

The effect of congregational singing is well described in the following poem:

14 Well, wife, I've found the model church,
And worshiped there to-day;
It made me think of good old times,
Before my hair was gray;
The meeting house was finer built
Than they were years ago,
But then I found when I went in,
It was not built for show.

I wish you'd heard the singing, wife,
It had the old-time ring;
The preacher said with trumpet voice,
"Let all the people sing";
Old "Coronation" was the tune;
The music upward roll'd,
Until I thought the angel choir
Struck all their harps of gold.

(No. 408, GOSPEL HYMNS, 1-6.)

Also the poem, THE OLD HYMNS, calls attention to the results of congregational singing. It is as follows:

15 There's lots of music in 'em—the hymns of long ago,
And when some gray-haired brother sings the ones I used to know
I sorter want to take a hand—I think of days gone by—
"On Jordan's stormy banks I stand and cast a wistful eye!"

There's lots of music in 'em—those dear, sweet hymns of old,
With visions bright of lands of light, and shining streets of gold;
And I hear 'em ringing—singing where memory dreaming stands,
"From Greenland's icy mountains to India's coral strands."

14. R. A. Lapsley, SONGS OF ZION, Page 136; permission Presbyterian Committee of Publication.

15. R. A. Lapsley, Songs of Zion, Page 142; permission Presbyterian Committee of Publication.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

They seem to sing forever of holier, sweeter days,
When the lilies of the love of God bloomed white in all the ways;
And I want to hear their music from the old-time meetin's rise
Till "I can read my title clear to mansions in the skies."

We never needed singin' books in them old days—we knew
The words, the tunes of every one—the dear old hymn book through;
We didn't have no trumpets then, no organs built for show,
We only sang to praise the Lord, "from whom all blessings flow."

And so I love the good old hymns and when my time shall come—
Before the light has left me, and my singing lips are dumb—
If I can hear 'em sing them then, I'll pass without a sigh
To "Canaan's fair and happy land where my possessions lie."

(Frank L. Stanton in *The Atlanta Constitution.*)

CHAPTER XV

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

To-day one often reads in the denominational papers of the South articles in which the authors disagree almost entirely concerning the most desirable types of hymns, the ways in which hymns should be used and the manner of conducting church music. In almost all Southern churches there are, at least, two sets of people regarding the type of hymns that should be sung, the kind of hymn book that should be purchased and the kind of church music that is preferable. On the one hand, there are those who contend for hymns with fast music, such as are generally used in revival services; on the other hand there are those who let no opportunity pass by for using hymns with a slower and more dignified type of music, such as are largely found in the various official denominational hymnals. As a result of these two parties and of the many controversies arising over such matters, churches have been split in many instances and numerous pastors have become unpopular.

However, these controversies are not new. Throughout their history the Southern churches have had such experiences. And they have been connected with practically every aspect of church music.

¹One of the most bitter and far-reaching of these occurred in the Presbyterian Church during the years of 1784 to 1790, and was over the use of "The Psalms of David Imitated" by Isaac Watts. Watts' "The Psalms of David Imitated" was a very free translation of the Psalms—indeed in many places even a loose paraphasing. The custom of singing the Psalms existed in those days, and constituted a large part of church singing. This volume was being used considerably in a large part of the world instead of song books in which the Psalms were given literally. However, nearly everywhere there was opposition to free translations and to paraphrasing.

1. For a full account of this, see Louis F. Benson, "The English Hymn; Its Development and Use," Pages 186-191.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

The South was no exception. In almost all the Presbyterian churches among the Scotch and Irish settlements there was a firm minority opposition. The mere suggestion to use Watts' volume caused a violent discussion and effort to introduce it was very disturbing to the congregations. A Synod refused to take sides and approved both types of Psalms. In 1787 representatives of both sides from the disturbed Presbytery of Abingdon appealed to its Synod, but the Synod stuck to its position and held that this was a local matter for each parish to decide for itself. But Benson states that in the next few years so many parishes were affected by these contentions, and with such serious consequences, as to constitute somewhat of a distinct period of the Presbyterian Church.

In Virginia the Presbytery of Hanover was asked to discipline Rev. Charles Cummings for aiding the use of Watts. The uneasiness of Mr. Cumming's people forced him out of his churches. Some people in various congregations were so uneasy that in 1784 they asked the Presbytery whether it was safe for them to attend the preaching of Mr. Cummings. Also in Tennessee at this time the Psalmody question caused much tumult and brought about much trouble in the Presbytery of Abingdon. In North Carolina the situation was the same. At New Providence a pulpit supply used for only one Sunday Watts' Imitation, and yet that started the suspicion that the pastor was guiding him in it and the church was so permanently rent asunder that the minority organized a separate church. At Popular Tent, when the pastor tried to introduce Watts' book some of those opposed to it left the church, whereas others remained to interrupt the service. A permanent schism resulted from these troubles in North Carolina, and those favoring the original Psalmody withdrew and set up an Associate Presbytery.

But it was in the new settlements of Kentucky that the controversy reached its height and that the greatest damage was done. Here it was led by Rev. Adam Rankin, who finding that his associates did not agree with him regarding a strict Psalmody and were not anxious to agitate such a vexed question, began a fierce and bitter campaign. Of this

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

Benson says: ²“Censured by Presbytery for traducing his brethren and barring the singers of Watts from the Communion, and suspended for contumacy, he and his supporters withdrew to form what came to be called the “Rankin Schism,” composed of twelve congregations. Benson also states that the results of this schism few, if any congregations escaped, as its spirit remained for years, as it became the matter of chief concern, and as these feuds prevented attention to other things, thereby causing Presbyterianism to lapse in those sections.

The Methodist Church at this time faced difficulties over its church music. The Methodists in the South, as well as over the America of that day, were not agreed regarding the kind of hymns they should use. Many were using the light words and fast tunes of the day. Others, especially of the clergy, preferred the more dignified tunes and hymns of Wesley. Therefore, at the Conference held in 1784 in Baltimore for all the Methodists of America, the question was asked, ³“How shall we reform our singing?” and the answer was: “Let all our preachers who have any knowledge in the notes, improve it by learning to sing true themselves and keeping close to Mr. Wesley’s tunes and hymns.”

The Episcopalians have disputed over the best manner of chanting. In the *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN*, the leading paper of the Episcopal Church in the South, of October 1, 1847, there is an article in which is the following paragraph: ⁴“Quick chanting... is chanting which gives time for fair apprehension of the sense of all words, and does not give more. And now we will only repeat, that the opinion which prevails in many quarters against quick chanting appears to us a mistake; that quick chanting, by forcing the attention of the choir, gives regularity, strength and compactness to the chant, while slow time, by giving opportunity for lounging, introduces laxity, feebleness and division into it.”

Establishing the authorship of hymns has not always been an easy task. Many of the hymns in the denominational hymnals come down from the early days of Christianity

2. *Ibid. (By permission.)*

3. *Minutes of Methodist Conferences annually held in America from 1773 to 1794, inclusive, Page 71.*

4. *Reprint from The Christian Remembrancer.*

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

and from the early days of Protestantism. In those periods records were not kept as well as they are to-day. The following article calls attention to the difficulty there has been in establishing the authorship of hymns: ⁵ "Some time since, a writer in the Calendar drew the attention of the public to the authorship of the hymns in the Prayer Book and of the names of many of their authors. We invited the attention of our correspondents to the subject, and the Church Journal has since done the same, and perhaps others also. We have also published several communications on the subject, and have more, and our above-named contemporaries have also given space to the subject, which, if correct, will prove of ultimate advantage. They have each published a list of the authors of the hymns, and we present below the list of the latter... which we prefer to that of the former.... We have also given names from our own observation and the favors of correspondents.... and we have marked some with a question mark (?), and we purpose to republish, perhaps weekly, merely those of doubtful parentage, in order that the truth may be known....

"In conclusion, we would ask the careful investigation of our correspondents to the doubtful hymns, and when certainty, or nearly that, is had, we will be glad to hear from them."

Whether church music should be on a level with the multitude, or scientific and artistic in accord with the highest type of music and on the level of the most cultured people, as well as whether the hymns should be old or new, has been a matter of great dispute in the South. An article in the *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN*, written by one who signed himself, "One in a Million," deals with the former of these difficulties. ⁶ "Singing in a congregation is not designed, as a congregation is not designed, as a concert to satisfy the cultivated, fastidious mind. It is designed to give an audible and rapturous expression to those devout feelings, excited by the presence of Him who said, "Where two or three are gathered together in My name, there I will be in the midst of them."... Therefore, it should be conducted in a manner

5. *Southern Churchman*, March 9, 1854.
6. March 13, 1857.

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

that nothing shall act as a damper or extinguisher to such devout feelings.

"The vast majority of the people do not understand music scientifically, and do not appreciate or enjoy such music as is calculated to please an acquired taste. There are many, however, who do enjoy such music. And it is true that those who do may be annoyed and have their devotional feelings interrupted and their thoughts diverted from spiritual things by such an annoyance as an exhibition of defective musical skill or taste. For all such there is ample provision in most of our congregations, the church music and the singing being conducted in all of them in the most scientific mode in their power. The musical amateurs are, therefore, well provided for with us.

"How is the case as to us of the million who do not understand music scientifically?" Then the article enters into a portrayal of the disorder and disharmony caused by the two types of music in the same congregation, after which it continues: "I have said that provision is made for the lovers of scientific singing in many churches where scientific music is practiced. Let there be such churches and let them resort to them. I would have everybody accommodated. Let such churches continue to practice artificial music if all their members are of the scientific view and qualified to appreciate and to join in such singing. . . But if some of their members are like myself and like the unsophisticated million, then I would use one of the two sacred songs in meter, either the hymn or the Psalm, ⁷or each alternately to be sung in the simple style to suit us, without bass, treble or tenor, but the air alone, with no accompaniment but the organ. And let any rector who wants real congregational singing and who wants to attract the multitude, try this style of singing."

In an introductory review of a new hymnal put out by the Evangelical Society, the editor of the same paper at a later date says of the hymnal, ⁸"Fine hymns it has but few; classic hymns not many more; faultless hymns perhaps not more than a dozen, if so many. But in this book will be

7. This evidently refers to the custom of singing Psalms.
8. September 18, 1857.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

found the old evangelical hymns which go to the heart, hymns that have been hallowed by the associations of sickness, of devotion, of the social gathering until the heart cannot do without them. We have no hesitation in saying that this hymn book comes nearer our idea of a family and personal hymnal than any with which we are acquainted. It should be introduced into our lecture room, at our fireside, into our closets. We know of no inspired reading that so warms the heart as the reading of hymns. And this is one object of this book." From the preface of the new hymnal the editor takes the following sentence: "A growing demand for more hymns for various uses among our people is proved by the fact that so many thousands of hymn books are being purchased from private and other sources."

But there were those who as ardently contended and wrote for the opposite type. Among them was a layman from Richmond who in 1867 wrote: ⁹"Every thoughtful and reflecting Christian must deprecate and deplore the spirit of radicalism which, not satisfied with its political prowess, seems to aspire after conquest in sacred and better things. Even the Holy Scriptures is invaded, and such music as the saints of all ages have been content to employ in rendering their praises, is made to yield to modern composition, designed for the opera house and the theater.

"Surely our beautiful hymn, 'Jesus, Savior of My Soul,' when sung to Hothani, inspires more devout and ardent feeling than the pretty and graceful, 'When the Swallows Homeward Fly,' and the reason is manifest. The law of association is potent and the mind involuntarily assimilates the music rather than the sacred language of the hymn to which it is now sung in many of our churches."

Of the same tenor is the contribution of a Virginia correspondent to the same paper in 1870, ¹⁰who makes the following complaint of the delegates of Virginia to the General Convention of the Episcopal Church which had just been held. He wrote: "Our delegates ought to be held in esteem. . . And I for one would regret to have them placed in a position where they would be held in ridicule.

9. *Southern Churchman*, July 4, 1867.

10. *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN*, January 23, 1870.

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

"Just as certainly as one or more of them would get upon his or their feet in General Convention to express disapprobation of the Virginia Council with the action of the House of Bishops in the matter of 'Hymns, Ancient and Modern,' some one or more on the other side would get up on his, or their feet, and make fun of the whole thing.

"I can even imagine some reader of *Punch* addressing the chair, and saying, 'Mr. President, we have all heard of the Holy Grail by Tennyson, but here we have a holy growl from Virginia.'

"Will not these New York and North Carolina and Georgia and Louisiana and Illinois and Michigan and Minnesota brethren be ready to think and probably to say that our delegates would prefer a good old shouting camp meeting ditty to 'Sun of my Soul,' or 'Jerusalem, the Golden?'"

It is quite easy to understand the reasons for people desiring the old hymns and tunes. The tunes attached to the Psalms, as the tunes used in old hymns to-day, were dear to people who had used them for years. Many holy and vital experiences were associated with them. Naturally, therefore, they hated to see them given up and fought to keep them in use. Perhaps the poem, "The Old Psalm Tunes," expresses these feelings as well as any other poem or any prose can do.

¹¹I love them well, those ancient tunes
Of days and years gone by!
They bring fond memories to the heart,
And tear drops to the eye.

The ancient words, the dashing sea,
The deserts wild and bare,
Have echoed to the Christian hymn,
Have heard the Christian's prayer.

In the long ages of the past—
What myriad tongues have sung!
How often have those holy strains
In blest rejoicing rung!

11. Taken from the *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN* of December 5, 1862.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

They seem a sacred link to bind
The present to the past,
To-day to ages left behind,
A golden link outcast.

By which in love we clasp the hands
Of those who sing above,
The holy ones, the purified,
Safe in the Savior's love.

Thus hand in hand we onward walk,
Our eyes to heaven upturned,
And sing the holy songs our tongues
From by-gone years have learned.

And as each note to heaven soars,
More near our spirits rise
To those who praise with golden harps
In temples of the skies.

A holy blessing falls on all ;
We feel that we belong
To ages gone, and yet to be,
Bound by the chain of song.

Oh never let their echoes die,
'Til breaks the holy morn,
When from the fullness of the sky
Eternity is born.

¹²But less than two years after the publication of this poem pleading for the Psalms to be sung, there appeared in the same paper an article contending that they be not sung, on the grounds that, if hymns utter the truth, they should be adapted to common praise. The author also asserts that at the most the Psalms in meter in the Prayer Book should be not more than twenty-five or forty.

Another matter pertaining to church music over which Southern churches have disputed is the use of instruments. Their use in the South is comparatively modern. In 1863 a writer in the *CHRISTIAN OBSERVER*, which is the most widely circulated paper of the Southern Presbyterian Church, asked the question, ¹³"Is it right to have musical instruments in

12. *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN*, October 21, 1864.

13. February 13, 1863.

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

the church?" The whole article manifests that this was a very debatable, and a much debated, question at the time. He, however, answered it in the affirmative, saying, "Yes, Bishop Horne has said so, quoting Scripture." There is a Methodist Church in Virginia which fifteen years ago had no instrument. When its temporary pastor suggested getting one for the revival services, he was advised not to do so, as some of the influential members would cause trouble if he did. There is an aged Missionary Baptist now in North Carolina who thinks it wrong to have musical instruments in a church service, and who regards it as his duty to lecture the members of his congregation and the members of a near-by Methodist Church on the sin they are committing in using instruments in their houses of worship. His conversation on this point is a thorn in the flesh of many of his friends. There is a minor denomination in the South that does not have, and never has had, musical instruments in its churches and that believes it has Scriptural grounds for its position. This contention over instruments in the past has been fierce in some places and has wrecked a number of churches.

Another phase of hymnology that has been the source of unpleasantness in the South, as in every section of the country, is the choir. People believe the choir to be indispensable and that it is justified both to lead the congregation in singing and to draw people, who coming to listen to it, remain to get the sermon and for the rest of the service. Therefore, they believe the most artistic music is justified. There are others who do not think that what they call operatic music is ever proper by any choir. At times this debate has been bitter. For instance, one writer appealing for plain, and what he regarded as consecrated music, asked of choirs: ¹⁴"Do you think that... you will escape His righteous wrath as long as you desecrate His house, yea, and Himself also, by music worthy of the voices of the opera? Vain hope." A preacher in a sermon on church music published in a leading denominational paper, ¹⁵among other things, deplored the monopoly of the choir and stated

14. In *SOUTHERN CHURCHMAN*, January 15, 1864.

15. *Ibid*: January 31, 1867.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

that it ought only to lead. He was also hostile to quartet singing, since he regarded it as operatic. Dr. J. M. Rowland, Editor of the RICHMOND CHRISTIAN ADVOCATE, which is the official paper of the Virginia Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, in a recent article ¹ likewise voiced the sentiment of a great host of Southern people against artistic music. In doing so, he impersonated in a rather quaint way an old farmer visiting city churches. He made the old farmer say, "I didn't like the doings at the city church. The folks was dressed fine and they had some gals ter sing what sung out a lot of stuff nobody could understand. I didn't know whether they was singing in China or Roosia. One of um squealed and trembled like you was pouring ice water down her back. This is plum heathenish ter have such stuff in church."

The only article on Hymnology in the Southern PRESBYTERIAN REVIEW during its career of thirty-four years, beginning with 1848, throws light on the nature of the controversy regarding hymnology which existed in that church during this period. This article, which appeared in the issue of July, 1862, is therefore given in full. It was written by Rev. A. F. Dickson.

"The determination of our first General Assembly to revise the hymn book has called out a vast amount of writing on the subject. A great many very good things have been said: of course, much talk on the part of a sensible people on any point necessarily includes a certain proportion of good sense. But so much of incongruity and opposition have appeared, as to show that no settled principles of reason or of taste have prevailed among us; and to show need for investigation for their discovery. Something will be accomplished in this article, if only the thought and purpose to determine these ruling principles be introduced into the mind of the church.

"Two principal questions suggest themselves, which being clearly answered, all other problems are either solved by implication, or concern the mechanism of the work. They are: the proper subjects of hymns; and the necessary requisites of good hymns...

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

“What does the world sing? Rather, of what does it sing? Singing is the purling of the stream of life, whether a rill leaps swiftly and starrily from the mountain, ‘making sweet music with the enameled stones,’ or the abounding river whispers kindly to the reeds, or thunders with many voices in the cataracts. Every thought that has a thrill of emotional life in it; every feeling that mere words will not suffice for, which spoken, leaves the heart still burdened with its sweetness or woe, demands a voice in poetry and a hearing in song...

“We revert for the moment to the book of Psalms—God’s own exemplar of Christian song. In a rapid manner... we classify them as follows:

I. Addresses of praise—about.....	18
II. Other forms of praise.....	32
III. Christian experience.....	21
IV. Christian meditation	19
V. Prophet Psalms.....	9
VI. Patriotic Psalms.....	19
VII. Prayer, proper.....	32

“This survey has doubtless sufficiently illustrated the breadth of theme that must be permitted a book of pious song...

“Upon the second chief division of our subject, there is little to be done, except to examine the tests which have been applied with intent to banish certain well-beloved hymns from our book, because of alleged faults...

“In the first place, then, we concede that mere popularity in past days is not a perfect criterion, because the public taste does change; on the whole, it is becoming refined. But prudery is not refinement.

“Secondly, we maintain that the last polish of fastidious scholarship does not furnish a criterion, because judgment cannot be committed to it without both restraining the liberty and forfeiting the sympathy of the Christian Church. .

“Taking these two principles, we advance now to the dogma, that hymns must not be erotic; that such language ought not to be used as is restricted to romantic attachments in its ordinary enjoyment.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

"Another fault which ought in almost every case to banish a hymn from use is toying with a figure of speech, just as a pleasant play of fancy...

"In a word, while literary finish is not the rule, yet violation of established taste is a fatal transgression."

Coming down to a much later date, 1920,¹⁷ it is observed that Rev. J. M. Pickett voices in the General Organ of the Southern Methodist Church a striking protest against jazzy and sentimental music for young people, as the following extracts show: "The selection of suitable music for a congregation is not without difficulty, for we have to recognize the different degrees of spiritual development and culture, as well as the different temperaments and ages represented in the congregation. It would be a great mistake to select for the very young only such hymns as are suitable for the mature age and the experienced. It would be no less a mistake to have only children's songs for the more mature of the congregation. But there are a certain dignity and grandeur that are necessary in music for even children to inculcate a love for good music and the truths of the holy religion....

"It seems to me that we have collected for our children in a popular Sunday School book a lot of ragtime ditties without either poetry or Gospel, and flung them into the face of the church. The book contains occasional good hymns and standard hymns that are interspersed through it; but I quote almost at random:

Nearer, still nearer, close to Thy heart,
Draw me my Savior, so precious Thou art;
Fold me, O fold me, close to Thy breast, etc.

"These words are about what a boy of seventeen, homesick and love-sick, might write to a giddy girl of sixteen. But to teach such a song to our children for religious instruction, is to defeat the very end we have in view.

"This chorus:

Sweet will of God, still fold me closer,
'Til I am wholly lost in Thee, etc.

is another fondling ditty unworthy of the name of a hymn or a place in a hymnal.

A DISRUPTIVE FORCE

“Again:

Christ will me his aid afford,
Never to fall, never to fall,
While I find my precious Lord
Sweeter than all, sweeter than all.

is another of the same type, suggestive of ‘Please, O please do not let me fall!’ a suggestion helped by the music.

“Another selection says:

Hark from the glory, hear the song,
Breathed by a soft harp all day long,
Out of the pearly gates bright and fair,
Borne on the sunbeams through the air.

“This is an attempt to make æsthetic poetry and hymn in combination, but a failure at both. It is a combination of words that might do to quote in a fairy story for children, but it is in a hymn book, and should have no place in a hymn book.

“So long as we try to teach the children Scriptural piety through the medium of a class of songs with music similar to the music of ‘Whistling Rufus,’ ‘Old Grey Goose,’ ‘Goo-Goo Eyes,’ ‘Georgia Camp Meeting’ and ‘Climbing Jacob’s Ladder,’ we need not be surprised if they grow up without a due appreciation of reverence, and our musicians will have to continue to fight against ragtime music, our people continue to listen to the masters of music sing and play with an air of vacuity resulting from inadequate appreciation, and parents will continue to wonder at their children’s love for dance.

“Another result of the use of this class of hymns is that some of our poorer churches, not feeling able to buy the Sunday School book and regular hymn book, will buy the cheaper only, and use it in the regular services. Consequently, no hungry soul is fed or prepared for food by the singing, and the preacher comes to regard songs as something merely to fill in with, and the true function of music is lost.”

CHAPTER XVI

A UNIFYING FORCE

In the preceding chapter material was presented that showed that Southern Hymnology has been a disruptive force. This is only one side of the picture; it is also a unifying force. Indeed, there are few forces that do so much to unite Christians, regardless of creed and locality, as the hymns they sing, for to a great degree they sing the same hymns everywhere and in doing so have the same emotions kindled. Thus James Mudge wrote: ¹“Restricted sectarianism has always found little countenance in moments of deepest devotion. When we come to praise God we perceive that we are in a wider company than when we come to formulate creeds.

“We freely sing hymns by popes, cardinals, priests and monks, by Roman Catholics, Unitarians, Baptists, Lutherans, Moravians, Quakers. Not a jar nor touch of strife mars the delightful harmony. There is a very signal agreement of Christian hearts in the midst of the disagreement of their minds. . . . This blessed unity and catholicity is exceedingly refreshing and unspeakably soothing to the soul.”

In another article the same author wrote: ²“Precious beyond words is the essential oneness of God’s people, the communion of saints. It is one of the chief foregleams of heaven. Whatever emphasizes or advances it is in every way to be encouraged. In no other way so fully as in the use of our hymns does the church as yet realize the world-wide unity through the ages. When we come to worship, dogmatic formularies drop into the background. Devotion rather than doctrine is of necessity the burden of our songs in the sanctuary. More and more does this appear in the hymnals that from time to time are issued by the different denominations. . . . The book now used in common by the two largest Methodist churches. . . . is a case in point. . . .

1. Nashville Advocate, April 16, 1903.
2. Ibid: September 27, 1912.

A UNIFYING FORCE

"Of the 306 writers of its hymns, only twenty-six are Methodist. Those belonging to the Church of England number ninety; the Congregationalists on both sides of the sea (twenty in England, seventeen in America) are thirty-seven; Presbyterians twenty-seven; Unitarians, Roman Catholics and Lutherans have twenty-one each; the Baptists nineteen; the Protestant Episcopal Church has fourteen; Swedenborgians, Plymouth Brethren and Friends, taken together, have sixteen; and there are fourteen others not definitely placed or known. The nationality... also is diverse. No less than 156 are English; eighty-three are American; twenty-five are German; ten are Scotch; French, Italian, Greek, Spanish, Danish, Swiss and Welch also come in..."

"Several other reflections are forced upon us by a study of the authors. One is the number of famous poets that figure in the list: John Milton, John Dryden, Sir Walter Scott, William Cowper, George Herbert, John Keble, Thomas Moore, Alfred Tennyson, Mrs. Browning, Adelaide Anne Proctor, Rudyard Kipling, John G. Whittier, O. W. Holmes, William C. Bryant, Sidney Lanier... Of other distinguished men who rendered assistance there are many. Among them we note: Martin Luther, Francis Xavier, Gustavus Adolphus... Robert II. (King of France), Count Zinzendorf, Richard Baxter, Joseph Addison and Cardinal Newman. There are no less than eight bishops, four English and four American."

As stated in Chapter I, Dr. Basil Manley wrote for the first commencement of the Baptist Theological Seminary, then located at Greenville, South Carolina, but now at Louisville, Kentucky, the following hymn which has been sung at every commencement of that institution since its beginning in 1860:

BAPTIST SEMINARY HYMN

Soldiers of Christ in truth arrayed,
A world in ruins needs your aid:
A world by sin destroyed and dead:
A world for which the Savior bled.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

His Gospel to the lost proclaim,
Good news for all in Jesus' name;
Let light upon the darkness break
That sinners from their death may wake.

Morning and evening sow the seed:
God's grace the effort shall succeed:
Seed times of tears have oft been found
With sheaves of joy and plenty crowned.

We meet to part, but part to meet
When earthly labors are complete,
To join in yet more blest employ,
In an eternal world of joy.

It is easy to imagine how the singing of this hymn by the great multitude of Baptist preachers who have attended that Seminary has been a bond of unity drawing them in spirit together as the years come and go.

³The MISSIONARY VOICE publishes in each issue a program for the Woman's Missionary Societies of the Southern Methodist Church, including from two to four hymns. The existing files of the Voice for the years 1911—1923 were searched and a list of hymns made that were given in the programs during that period. These programs had 164 hymns, all but seven of which are in the METHODIST HYMNAL. Only a small per cent consisted of duplicates. The following are the hymns used four or more times in that period:

Times Used	NAME OF HYMNS
6	Where Cross the Crowded Ways.
5	Be Strong, We Are Not Here to Play.
5	O Zion Haste.
5	Tell It Out Among the Heathen.
5	We've a Story to Tell to the Nations.
4	O Master, Let Me Walk With Thee.
4	Lord, Speak to Me That I May Speak.
4	There's a Song in the Air.
4	True Hearted, Whole Hearted.
4	Praise the Savior, All Ye.

3. Monthly publication of the Mission Board of the M. E. Church, South.

A UNIFYING FORCE

⁴In 1927 the woman's missionary work of this church had 6,657 adult local societies that had a total membership of 196,379 members. All of these societies have monthly meetings and probably average not less than a third of their membership present. They closely follow the programs in the Voice, including the hymns. This means that more than 50,000 ladies of the South sang or heard sung in 1927 the hymns given in these programs and that a like number are continuing to use hymns in this way. This is an incalculable force in molding missionary sentiment and in unifying in this respect the people of the South.

THE GENERAL MINUTES AND YEARBOOK OF THE METHODIST EPISCOPAL CHURCH, SOUTH, for several years has had a vote on hymns. In 1927 it reported the votes of sixty-five presiding elders and of sixty circuit preachers and in 1928 of 200 preachers and also in 1929 of 200 preachers. Each preacher was asked to give his favorite hymn. A comparison of the three lists shows little difference in the numbers thus selected, and also a comparison of the ten hymns receiving the highest number of votes each year reveals remarkable similarity, as the following lists show:

⁵LIST OF TEN HYMNS RECEIVING HIGHEST VOTE IN 1927 IN ORDER OF VOTES

Amazing Grace, How Sweet the Sound.
Jesus, Lover of My Soul.
All Hail the Power of Jesus' Name.
Nearer, My God to Thee.
My Faith Looks Up to Thee.
How Firm a Foundation.
A Charge to Keep I Have.
O Love That Will Not Let Me Go.
Come Thou Fount of Every Blessing.
Abide With Me.

4. 1928 Annual Report, Woman's Missionary Council, Page 108.

5. The General Minutes and Year Book of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, 1927, Page 387.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

⁶LIST OF TEN HYMNS RECEIVING HIGHEST VOTE IN 1928 IN ORDER OF VOTES

Rock of Ages, Cleft for Me.
Love Divine, All Love Excelling.
When I Survey the Wondrous Cross.
Abide With Me.
Majestic Sweetness Sits Enthroned.
In the Cross of Christ I Glory.
All Hail the Power of Jesus' Name!
There is a Fountain Filled With Blood.
My Faith Looks Up to Thee.
Savior, Thy Dying Love Thou Gavest Me.

⁷LIST OF TEN HYMNS RECEIVING HIGHEST VOTE IN 1929 IN ORDER OF VOTES

Rock of Ages, Cleft for Me.
When I Survey the Wondrous Cross.
Abide With Me!
In the Cross of Christ I Glory.
There is a Fountain Filled With Blood.
My Faith Looks Up to Thee.
Jesus! the Name High Over All.
A Charge to Keep I Have.
Faith of Our Fathers.
Lead, Kindly Light.

A comparison of these three preferred lists shows that of the 1929 list eight are in the 1928 list and four in the 1927 list; and an inspection of all the hymns selected for the three years reveals that all the other hymns of the preferred lists were chosen annually by preachers as their favorites. Here, then, is additional evidence of the unifying force in the South afforded by hymns.

⁸According to Dr. Lapsley, Julian's *DICTIONARY OF HYMNOLOGY* states that not less than 400,000 Christian

6. Ibid: Page 404 (1928 edition).

7. Ibid: Page 410 (1929 edition).

8. R. A. Lapsley, *SONGS OF ZION*, Page 37.

A UNIFYING FORCE

hymns have been translated into 200 or more languages and dialects. Dr. Lapsley then states that the hymn books of the evangelical churches contain only a few hundred of this great number, and in this connection adds that the PRESBYTERIAN HYMNAL, *Revised* (of the Northern Presbyterian Church), has 755 hymns; the METHODIST HYMNAL 748; the BAPTIST HYMNAL 765; and PSALMS AND HYMNS *With Supplement* (Southern Presbyterian Church) 770; or an apparent total of 3,038, including numerous duplicates. He then says that 377 hymns of PSALMS AND HYMNS are in the PRESBYTERIAN HYMNAL, 371 in the BAPTIST HYMNAL and 309 in the METHODIST HYMNAL; and that 133 of these 309 are omitted, or are not in either the Presbyterian (Northern) or the BAPTIST HYMNAL, causing only 176 to be in all four books.

A study was made of sixteen representative and widely circulated Southern hymn books to find out what thirty-two hymns were contained in all or in most of them, with the following results:

HYMN	Number of Books Containing It
1. All Hail the Power of Jesus' Name.....	16
2. What a Friend We Have in Jesus.....	16
3. Come, Thou Fount of Every Blessing.....	15
4. Jesus, Lover of My Soul.....	15
5. Just As I Am Without One Plea.....	15
6. Rock of Ages.....	15
7. There is a Fountain Filled With Blood.....	15
8. Blest Be the Tie That Binds.....	14
9. Jesus, I My Cross Have Taken.....	14
10. O, Happy Day That Fixed My Choice.....	14
11. Holy, Holy, Holy.....	14
12. Sun of My Soul, Thou Savior Dear.....	14
13. Take My Life and Let It Be.....	14
14. America.....	13
15. God Be With You Till We Meet Again.....	13
16. Guide Me, O Thou Great Jehovah.....	13
17. Joy to the World.....	13
18. More Love to Thee.....	13
19. The Son of God Goes Forth to War.....	13

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

20. Stand Up, Stand Up for Jesus.....	13
21. When I Survey the Wondrous Cross.....	13
22. Amazing Grace.....	12
23. Blessed Assurance.....	12
24. Come Thou Almighty King.....	12
25. Holy Spirit, Faithful Guide.....	12
26. In the Cross of Christ.....	12
27. Jesus Calls Us O'er the Tumult.....	12
28. Lead, Kindly Light.....	12
29. Love Divine, All Love Excelling.....	12
30. Onward Christian Soldiers.....	12
31. The Morning Light is Breaking.....	12
32. My Faith Looks Up to Thee.....	12

The books studied either have the largest circulation or are the ones most frequently used by the largest groups of people. Therefore, these hymns are having great effect in developing a united body of Christian people in the South. And these represent but a few of the numerous hymns sung over and over by the people of this section and found in most of the influential hymnals.

Thirty-two hymns were selected because two other studies of this type, though of a much larger scale, have included the same number of hymns. ⁹Dr. L. F. Benson made a like study of 107 American and English hymn books. The thirty-two hymns that ranked highest in that study contained seven of those of the above list. Nearly fifty years ago a religious newspaper of England asked its readers to submit lists of their favorite hymns and nearly 3,500 did so, mentioning one or more hymns. Of the thirty-two hymns receiving the highest number of votes six are among those just given.

The various data presented in this chapter indicate that hymns play no little part in unifying Christian people.

9. *Ibid: Pages 140 and 144.*

BOOK V

PRESENT TRENDS IN SOUTHERN
HYMNOLOGY

CHAPTER XVII

PRESENT TRENDS

THE EASTER SERVICE AT WINSTON-SALEM

The Moravian Church, as already stated, began at Salem, North Carolina, at an early period in the history of this country, and ever since Salem, or now Winston-Salem, has played a large part in its activities. Here has resided an active bishop of the church. Here the original church stands, though it has been remodeled and is up to date. By the side of it are the buildings of Salem College, founded in 1772 as Salem Academy and College for the higher education of young women.¹ "At that time there was no similar school in the South, and only two in the North." Though it is free from sectarianism, yet the earnest piety and the spiritual atmosphere of the Moravian Church and of the Moravian community at Salem have pervaded it. At the end of the lane, a few hundred yards away, is the Moravian cemetery, which is unique. Mrs Crosby Adams has a good description of it:² "The graves are simple mounds with a square stone lying flat at the head. They are in groups of sixty-six in each plat, these being surrounded by well-kept mounds. In these plats are sections apportioned to the various choirs, or classes, the men, women and children in their several groups... instead of family plats. Here lie together rich and poor, no rank nor station being noted, death being indeed the leveler. The entire absence of monuments of miscellaneous sizes is a welcome prospect to the eye as one takes in wooded vistas in every direction."

These factors, as well as the early custom of the Moravians of living in a settlement largely, if not entirely, controlled by themselves, have made it comparatively easy for customs and traditions to be perpetuated. As a result, well-established and useful modes of living have not been so frequently cast

1. Salem College Catalogue, 1927, Page 103.

2. Pamphlet, EASTER AT WINSTON-SALEM, Page 17.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

aside for the glittering and ephemeral currents of life. One outstanding element preserved at Winston-Salem is church music. All along, the Moravians have emphasized church music of a dignified type. Also they have paid much attention to chorales for religious festivals, which play a prominent part in their religious life.

Upon this background there has recently developed at Winston-Salem a religious observance that is increasingly attracting the attention of the American people and that is awakening the Southern people to the possibilities of dignified church music and to the various ways in which they can profitably use the old hymns. Reference is made to the Moravian Easter Service. Mrs. Crosby Adams has a splendid account of this observance. In an editorial, entitled *EASTER AT WINSTON-SALEM, NORTH CAROLINA*, the Asheville Times ³had the following to say about Mrs. Adams' pamphlet on the subject: "No where in North Carolina is Easter observed with more impressive beauty than at Salem. The Moravian services are famed throughout the nation for the deep and simple spirituality which pervades them.

"Many attempts have been made to capture the beauty of these services and to imprison them in words. Some of these attempts have been truly effective and have taken rank as literature of more than ephemeral nature. Last year the Times called attention to one of them when it reviewed editorially the book, *THE EASTER PEOPLE*, written by Winifred Kirkland of this city.

"This year the Times takes advantage again of the spirit of this day to make passing reference to another description of the Moravian services, written by another woman with local ties. This is the brochure, *EASTER AT WINSTON-SALEM, NORTH CAROLINA*. Its author is Mrs. Crosby Adams of Montreat.

"This sketch appeared originally in the *MUSIC NEWS* (Chicago) but it attracted so much attention that it has been printed in permanent form."

Also of this sketch Dr. Howard E. Rondthaler, President of Salem College, a Moravian preacher, the son of Bishop Rondthaler of the Moravian Church and a lifelong resident

PRESENT TRENDS

of Winston-Salem, says, ⁴"Perhaps no one has interpreted with more sympathy the spirit of the Moravian Easter Services as held in Salem congregation than Mrs. Crosby Adams." Of them Mrs. Adams wrote in part: ⁵"This day, so anticipated, is ushered in by the playing of a band of silver and wood instruments to the number of over one hundred. Many of the players have performed this labor of love for years in order to perpetuate the traditions. Others, young college students, plan to be there to lend their aid, while young boys are also in the group. This band is divided into smaller sections which are appointed to different parts of the city, where they play these same chorales familiar to old and young alike. The strains of music float to one's ears between two and four o'clock in the morning, and quite fittingly the first choral given is *Sleepers, Awake*.

"We assembled in the church, which adjoins the college, and heard the directions given to the different marshals of the day, then wended our way to the street to find a gathering multitude of people. The first rays of light were just coming over the eastern horizon and by its dim reflection we could follow the printed service. Bishop Edward Rondthaler stood on the church steps and began this impressive service in a clear, ringing voice. Each recurring season the people wait for this significant movement, as he says, 'The Lord is risen!' The multitude make answer, 'The Lord is risen indeed!' Then followed Scripture passages and chorales, after which we started up the beautiful avenue which leads to the Moravian graveyard. A group of players headed the procession and played two lines of a hymn tune, another group at a distance answering with the following two lines until the hymn was completed.

"When the middle gate was reached all entered the graveyard. The ranks of four abreast were close together, and it took a long time before the throng of ten thousand people were within the enclosure and quietly standing to hear the bishop continue the service. This was held around the plat set apart for the earliest members of the church. The concluding words of this early morning service must have

4. Introduction to *EASTER AT WINSTON-SALEM, NORTH CAROLINA*, by Mrs. C. Adams.

5. *EASTER AT WINSTON-SALEM, NORTH CAROLINA*, Pages 9 to 12.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

touched every heart. No pen can well describe this impressive scene of the thronging multitude, who had gathered to commemorate this supreme fact of human history.... The sun was now high enough in the heavens to give promise of a fair Easter Day."

This was written in 1916. Since that time the crowds coming to this service have increased until in 1928 30,000 people were present. Of course, the improvement of roads, especially in North Carolina, in the last few years and the increase in the number of automobiles have helped to cause the increase in the crowds. But still one wonders what has caused the people to desire to go there. Summer before last this question was asked a number of the Moravian leaders at Winston-Salem and always they gave the reply that it was primarily their sacred music, the singing of the old hymns in the way that they use them on that day. When it is remembered that each year musicians stationed in different parts of the city have played the old hymns antiphonally while crowds ranging from ten to thirty thousand people have slowly marched from the church to the cemetery, it is realized that quite a few hymns have been used. This occasion, with the thousands present, mainly from the South, must be a great demonstration of the value and power of the old, dignified, simple hymns and must cause many spectators to think of the possibilities that are wrapped up in them. No doubt, with the increase in crowds, this observance will wield even greater influence in popularizing this type of hymn and in causing Southern people to turn away from the jazz hymn.

COURSES IN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARIES

Union Theological Seminary in Richmond, Virginia, which belongs to the Southern Presbyterian Church, gives in alternate years one general course on hymnology.

The Austin (Texas) Presbyterian Theological Seminary has one course on hymnology which enrolls each student. The course is general and explains the nature and aims of church music and gives practical advice on the worship and the use of hymns.

PRESENT TRENDS

Likewise, the Baptist Seminary at Louisville has one course. It meets one hour a week. The catalogue states that it "aims primarily to develop in the pastor a finer appreciation of the value of music in the church and to equip him for the musical leadership of his church. It presents music as a necessary aid in evangelism and in the development of Christian character. Another motive permeating the course is the desire to free church music from the baneful influence of modern secular music. . . The course is designed to help the pastor secure the maximum results from his church music, regardless of the type of his church, its location or the quality of its talent. It is devoted to a study of musical notation, sight-singing and conducting of congregational singing, the pastor and his choir, the history of hymns and hymn singing, the psychology and purpose of music in the church and a study of the great hymns." The course is required of every student who receives a degree.

The Baptist Seminary at Fort Worth, Texas, has under the direction of I. E. Reynolds a school of sacred music, the ideal of which is "Theoretical, technical and practical training for the development of efficient musicians for every type of service in the field of sacred music from the smallest mission to the most cultured and refined church." It offers two and three-year courses leading to a Diploma of Sacred Music and a three-year course for which the degrees of Master or Bachelor of Sacred Music are awarded. Necessarily courses in every phase of church music are offered. The school is housed in a hall with accommodations for two hundred and fifty students. Dr. Albert Venting is professor of hymnology. The faculty has nine members. This seems to be the most complete school of its kind in the South.

Next to it in this respect is the Department of Music of the Baptist Bible Institute in New Orleans. This Department is headed by Professor E. O. Sellers, who has three assistants. For three years' work the Institute grants the degree of Bachelor of Music to students who have satisfactory scholastic credits and the diploma in Gospel Music to others. A certificate is awarded for two years' work.

6. 1926.
7. 1928 Catalogue, Page 38.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Naturally, courses covering the various phases of music and of sacred music are given. Professor Sellers' course in Hymnology is described as ⁸"a study of the history and development of hymns, both ancient and modern; their spirit and structure; their value and effectiveness and their importance; Textbook: HISTORY AND USE OF HYMNS by Breed; also required parallel reading and research work; two hours per week for the first and second quarters of the first year." Professor Sellers also has a course on practical church music, which ⁹"is a course in the discussion of the problems of applied music in churches, missions, evangelistic services and so forth; Textbook: How to IMPROVE CHURCH MUSIC; two hours per week for third and fourth quarters of the first year."

A section of the Department of Music is entitled CHORUS AND CHOIR. The two divisions of chorus are: (1) Men's Chorus, and (2) General Chorus; and are taught by Professor Sellers. The textbooks for the latter are not listed; those for the former are: NEW GOSPEL QUARTETS FOR MEN'S VOICES by Lorenz, Wilson and Von Berge; and QUARTETS AND CHORUSES FOR MEN by the Rodeheaver Music Company. The courses in Choir are Institute Choir and Women's Choir and are taught by Professor M. G. Beckwith. The former of these courses in Choir has considerable field work in churches, Sunday Schools and missions. The textbook of the latter of the two courses is WOMEN'S GOSPEL QUARTETS by Lorenz and Wilson.

The School of Theology of Emory University has a Department of Rhetoric and Singing, each section being taught by a different professor. The professor of Rhetoric trains the students in reading hymns; the professor of Singing offers three courses: (1) The Rudiments of Music, (2) Sight Singing, and (3) Hymns and Hymnology. The description of the last course is: ¹⁰"A study of the history, content and application of a number of standard hymns; the hymns will be memorized, words and music, and the students will practice leading the congregations in the

8. Ibid: Page 39.

9. Ibid.

10. Catalogue, Page 46.

P R E S E N T T R E N D S

singing of these hymns; occasional discussions on the nature and place of music in the church." The courses on both speaking and singing are required of all students throughout their residence and run two hours per week.

The School of Theology of the Southern Methodist University offers two courses in its Department of Church Music. One treats of voice correction and the other of hymnology. The outline of the latter is: 11 "Use of music in public worship; practical application of the hymn book in ministerial work; elements of voice training; memorization of both words and music of many standard hymns. The Methodist Hymnal forms the basis for the course. Various works on hymnology are used as guides in the study of the subject."

Duke University last semester gave a brief course on hymnology which emphasized the practical phases of the subject.

The catalogues of the two Episcopal Seminaries of the South do not list courses on hymnology.

This survey of the training given in the theological seminaries to future religious leaders reveals that great emphasis is being placed upon standard hymns and that the training is, in the main, such as to decrease the use of gospel and jazz hymns. However, the Baptist Seminary at Fort Worth and the Institute at New Orleans, while also emphasizing the standard hymns, appear to place the chief emphasis upon the selection of types of hymns and music according to the musical tastes and training of the people. If such is the case, their graduates are likely to go out to let the musical tastes of their constituency determine the types of hymns they use rather than to pay chief attention to elevating those tastes.

COURSES IN METHODIST LEADERSHIP TRAINING SCHOOLS

The Southern Methodist Church, through the Teacher Training Department of its General Sunday School Board, has done a notable work in music and hymnody. To October,

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

1929, the Board had awarded 339 credits earned by satisfactory completion of its course on Music and Hymnody in Religious Education, which has been given in a number of standard training schools and in its leadership schools at Lake Junaluska, North Carolina, and at Mount Sequoyah, Arkansas. A credit is awarded for the successful completion of twelve lessons having a class period of about forty-five minutes and a fair amount of lesson preparation. The following is an outline of the course prepared by the Training Committee of the Board:

"The aim of this course is to lead the students to an appreciation of worth-while music and hymns and of its place and function in religious education. Only enough of the history of music and hymns is given as is necessary for the purpose of illustration. The teaching of this course should result in a keen desire on the part of the students to bring about the use of better music and hymns in the local church and also point the way to do so.

"The course begins with a survey of the present situation in church music, both in the local Sunday School and in the church at large. About two lessons are devoted to this survey which is followed by a discussion of the real function of music—its effects, power, and charm—and more particularly, the place and function of music and hymns in religious education and in worship.

"The course considers additional topics, such as the following: The selection of hymns, with a careful study of the poetry, words, imagery, content and theology, noting the changing tendencies; principles guiding the selection of tunes; the various kinds of hymns, such as, social, individualistic, praise, prayer; the interpretation and teaching of hymns with emphasis on the principle of grading; instrumental music, indicating the values and use of piano, pipe organ, etc., in religious education, and what instruments ought not to be used and why; a study of available songs and hymns such as are contained in the Methodist Hymnal, the Cokesbury Hymnal, other books and sources.

"The course closes with a discussion of the leadership of music and at least one period is given to the making of programs for worship services.

P R E S E N T T R E N D S

“Bibliography: *Breed: The History and Use of Hymns and Hymn Tunes (Required Reference Book).

*Benson: Studies of Familiar Hymns.

*Poteat: Practical Hymnology.

*Smith, H. Augustine: Hymnal for American Youth.

Lorenz: Church Music—Part 2

Lorenz: Music in Work and Worship—Part 3.

The Methodist Hymnal.

Smith, H. Augustine: Hymns for the Living Age.

Certain chapters on music in the following texts:

Betts and Hawthorne: Method in Teaching Religion.

Bonser: Elementary School Curriculum.

Vogt: Art and Religion.”

NOTE: *Required to be read by those preparing to teach.

Of course, this type of study of hymns engaged in on such a vast scale is prophetic of a new day of church music, especially in the Sunday Schools.

THESES AND BOOKS

In 1922 J. Foster Barnes submitted to the Graduate Faculty of Emory University an M. A. thesis entitled THE PLACE OF MUSIC IN RELIGIOUS EDUCATION. Mr. Barnes is a native of Virginia, and since his graduation has been director of the music of Central Methodist Church, Asheville, and director of student activities at Duke University. The last position he has held for three years. His thesis has seventy-two pages, including Bibliography, and has the following three parts: I. Music in the Church, II. The Sunday School; III. Activities Outside of the Church and Sunday School. Part I is the usual treatment of the subjects of music and religion by a progressive in the field of church music. It covers half of the pages of the thesis. Part II has four chapters. The first is introductory and contains the following striking statements in the interest of better, especially graded, music in the Sunday School: ¹²“Only last Christmas I was talking with quite a noted musician, and he said, ‘Last Sunday I went to Sunday School, but I shall never go again. The music was awful.’”

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

¹³"I am glad to know that our public schools are beginning to realize the importance of music and that they are doing a great deal to cultivate a taste for better music. The Sunday School must do the same; for a child will not be content when he learns a great masterpiece in the public schools and then goes to Sunday School and is required to sing, *I AM LIVING IN THE MOUNTAINS.*"

¹⁴"I am happy to know, too, that our Sunday Schools are taking on new life, especially with regard to graded lessons in the different departments. They must likewise have graded songs. Too often we find each department singing *SHALL WE GATHER AT THE RIVER?* or *BRIGHTEN THE CORNER WHERE YOU ARE*. Children advance through each department, and when they get to the highest grade they are singing the same songs. Thus, there is reason for some of our Sunday Schools not being able to hold the older boys and girls. There must be a graded system of songs; for some songs are suited to one department and some to another. A little child loves to sing, *THE KING OF LOVE MY SHEPHERD IS*, whereas a junior boy prefers *ONWARD CHRISTIAN SOLDIERS*. Young people in college in consecrating their lives to His service are fond of *HAVE THINE OWN WAY*.

"Few of our churches have good congregational singing. Where, then, is the place to begin? In the Sunday School." The second chapter of Part II is entitled *GENERAL SUGGESTIONS FOR SUNDAY SCHOOL MUSIC*, and briefly discusses ten items that are helpful and practical and that, in the main, all modern religious educators would sanction. The next chapter is *HOW TO TEACH MUSIC IN THE SUNDAY SCHOOL*, and has a number of familiar observations. The final chapter is devoted to *DEPARTMENTAL SONGS*. Here Mr. Barnes gives a list of songs for each department of the Sunday School. To get these lists, he states that he has consulted a number of specialists. He also modestly adds: ¹⁵"These songs are by no means all that are to be had for the different departments, but they are intended to give one an idea, at least, of what type of songs may be used in each grade."

^{13.} Ibid.

^{14.} Ibid: Page 78.

^{15.} Ibid: Page 49.

P R E S E N T T R E N D S

These lists are taken from departmental song books and from selections given him by various individuals in the field of Religious Education. They cover about six pages of the treatise.

Part III has numerous suggestions on music for prayer meetings, young people's societies, banquets, pageants, shop meetings and other occasions.

This study, even though an unprinted thesis, will have value in developing sentiment for such music as the author espouses. No doubt, it will be used as reference material for classes in Religious Education and in Church Music at Emory University. Also in making this study Mr. Barnes further equipped himself to be a leader in his field. This equipment, with his decided musical talents, is standing him good stead at Duke University as director of student activities and, for the last semester, as instructor in Church Music in the School of Religion.

Mr. J. T. Hooker, instructor in English at the University of South Carolina, has written a Doctor's dissertation for the Department of Education of Boston University on the subject, THE PSYCHOLOGICAL FUNCTION OF WORSHIP IN THE GENETIC DEVELOPMENT OF THE CHILD. This thesis has a study of the college student, the information for which was obtained through a questionnaire that has six parts, the last dealing with hymns. This part of the questionnaire follows:

"Below is a list of hymns. Read them and then indicate by checking whether (1) you have never heard it, (2) you like it, (3) you don't like it.

A.	Never Heard It	You Like It	You Don't Like It
In the Garden.....
For the Beauty of the Earth.....
Brighten the Corner.....
Onward Christian Soldiers.....
Holy, Holy, Holy, Lord God.....
True Hearted, Whole Hearted.....
I'm Dwelling in Beulah Land.....
Come, Thou Almighty King.....

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Never You You Don't
Heard It Like It Like It

Lead On, O King Eternal.....
I Would be True, for There Are
 Those Who Trust Me.....
You May Have the Joy-Bells
 Ringing in Your Heart.....
The Fight is On.....
When the Roll is Called Up
 Yonder, I'll be There.....

B. Check any of the following values or disvalues that you attach to the hymns.

1. Do hymns give you a better and clearer idea of God?
..... Always Sometime Never.
2. Do you feel that you are communing with God when you are singing hymns? Always Sometimes
..... Never.
3. Are irreverent thoughts sometimes created by the words of some hymns? Yes No.
4. Do you think that the hymns provide a better means of expressing your needs and feelings to God? Always
..... Sometimes Never.
5. Many hymns contain silly, sentimental ideas of God and religion. Yes No.
6. Do hymns inspire you to a nobler and higher life?
..... Yes No.
7. Do you experience any deep emotions when you sing hymns? Yes No.
8. The music is too often jazzy. Yes No.

C. Read the following hymns and then answer the accompanying questions.

We thank Thee, Lord, for this fair earth.¹⁶

Do not wait until some deed of greatness you may do.”¹⁷

At the end of each hymn there are about a half dozen questions intended to provoke the one who should answer

¹⁶. The rest of the hymn is omitted, but not by Mr. Hooker's questionnaire.

¹⁷. The rest of the hymn is omitted, but not by Mr. Hooker's questionnaire.

P R E S E N T T R E N D S

them to a thorough study of the hymns. In October, 1928, 468 students had answered this questionnaire. Such a study of hymns by so many college students will have considerable effect in begetting a critical attitude, which is, in turn, the starting point for something better, or for the elimination of objectionable hymns and of objectionable features of otherwise good hymns. Doubtless, many who received the questionnaire were Southern students. Also since Mr. Hooker teaches hymnology in standard training schools of the Southern Methodist Church, he is probably using much of this material in such classes, thus reaching and stimulating religious leaders to give serious thought to hymns, which in turn will result in the use of better hymns.

The veteran of Southern hymnologists is Dr. W. F. Tillett, who for more than forty years has been professor of Systematic Theology in the School of Religion of Vanderbilt University. For about thirty years of this time he was also dean of that school. Practically throughout that long period Dr. Tillett has been producing valuable books, among them being PERSONAL SALVATION, STUDIES IN HYMNS and THE ANNOTATED METHODIST HYMNAL. Dr. C. S. Nutter of the Methodist Episcopal Church is co-author of the last production, and it is in getting out this book and in his service on the Commission that brought out the present Methodist hymnal that Dr. Tillett has made his great contributions to Southern Hymnology. THE ANNOTATED METHODIST HYMNAL gives a wealth of information concerning the authors of hymns and the circumstances under which they were written; and its service in developing a greater appreciation of hymns and in intensifying their messages is incalculable. It has enjoyed a wide circulation among Southern preachers, especially Southern Methodist preachers, who frequently in announcing hymns relate incidents taken from it that are connected with the history of hymns, thus increasing the value of hymns for their congregations.

For a number of years Dr. Tillett gave a course on hymnology at Vanderbilt University, which was popular and was taken by a large number of theological students, thereby equipping themselves to become leaders in improving the church music of the South.

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Dr. R. A. Lapsley, a Presbyterian minister of Virginia, and at present a member of the editorial staff of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, has delivered a number of addresses, written articles for his church periodicals and produced a book all of which have been of considerable value to Southern Hymnology. The title of the book is *SONGS OF ZION*, which is a small volume giving many interesting and helpful facts.

Mrs. Crosby Adams ¹⁸last year brought out *STUDIES IN HYMNOLOGY: A Textbook Designed for Study Groups Where Attention is Given to the Subject of Church Music; Also for Colleges, Schools, the Music Teacher and All Inquiring Students*. It was published by the Onward Press, Richmond, Virginia. It has sixty pages and is of the same general nature in its attitude toward the nature of church music as the author's productions sketched elsewhere. It has the following six chapters: (1) The Bible Foundations of Church Music, (2) Early Church Music Up to the Reformation, (3) The Far-Reaching Influence of the Reformation on Sacred Music, (4) Metrical Psalmody, (5) Old-Time Hymn-Singing in America, (6) The Hymn and the Hymn-Tune.

These productions are necessarily developing a higher type of Southern Hymnology.

18. All of Mrs. Adams' books have reached a circulation of over 100,000 copies.

CHAPTER XVIII

PRESENT TRENDS (CONTINUED)—IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

In order to ascertain the effect of the vocal music of the public schools of the South upon Southern hymnology, a questionnaire was addressed to the State Departments of Education of the twelve states of Virginia, North Carolina, South Carolina, Georgia, Alabama, Mississippi, Tennessee, Kentucky, Louisiana, Texas and Arkansas, all of which, except two, answered. The three items of the questionnaire were:

I. What per cent. of the public school vocal music do you think the singing of hymns forms in your state?

II. What books are used for this music, or what song books are used in your schools, so far as you know?

III. What are the laws or regulation of your Board covering public school vocal music extending back to 1925?

Item I brought the following information. Georgia and Texas stated that they had no way of knowing "to what extent religious music was used in their schools. Arkansas disposed of all the questions with the answer, "No provision for teaching music in the public school system of this state is made in the course of study by law." Kentucky replied, "Where music work in our schools is under supervision, there is very little hymn singing except for devotional exercises. In a large number of our schools where there is no systematic training, hymns are about all the songs the children know. This is largely true in the mountainous section of our state." Virginia's answer was that the singing of hymns was largely confined to chapel service. The opinion of the Florida Board was that from seventy-five to ninety per cent of the schools use hymns, while that of the Alabama Board was that at least fifty per cent of the vocal music of the rural schools consists of hymns, though the per cent is lower in the city schools. Tennessee and South

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Carolina estimated that fifty per cent of their vocal music is religious, and North Carolina from thirty-five to forty per cent.

The crucial element of religious music in public schools is not so much the amount of time devoted to it as the kind of hymns used. Therefore, the questionnaire also asked the State Boards of Public Instruction for the names of the books used for the vocal music in their schools, in order that these books might be secured and studied. A list of them follows:

SONG BOOKS USED IN SOUTHERN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

BOOK	PUBLISHER	LOCATION OF PUBLISHER
Junior Songs		
School Hymnal		
The Hollis Dann Books		
The Robert Foresman Books		
Harmonic Series		
Progressive Series		
Modern Music Series		
Primary Melodies		
Progressive Melodies		
Twice 55 Community Songs		
101 Best Songs		
Golden Book of Favorite Songs		
Favorite Songs		

A study of these books reveals that they are of two general types: (1) single volumes containing the best of the old, well-known folk songs, the classical patriotic songs and the classical patriotic hymns, a few nature songs and a high percentage of the great hymns; (2) volumes in graded series based upon the best educational psychology and practices, and, therefore, containing a large proportion of songs and hymns especially suitable for children of the various school grades and covering a wide range of subjects that deal with children's experiences.

The list of hymns found in the GOLDEN BOOK OF FAVORITE SONGS, which is a one-volume song book, is typical of the hymns given in such books. It will be noted that all are of a dignified type. They are: Holy, Holy, Holy; Come Thou Almighty King; Onward Christian Soldiers; Now the Day is Over; Work, for the Night is Coming; Jesus, Tender

IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Shepherd, Lead Me; My Faith Looks Up to Thee; Abide With Me; Safely Through Another Week; Blest Be the Tie That Binds; Jesus, Lover of My Soul; Nearer, My God, to Thee; God Be With You Till We Meet Again; I Think When I Read That Sweet Story; Jesus Loves Me; Lead, Kindly Light; Holy Ghost With Light Divine; Now Thank We All Our God; Praise God From Whom All Blessings Flow; Softly Now the Light of Day; Silent Night; It Came Upon the Midnight Clear; Hark! The Herald Angels Sing; Glad Christmas Bells; From Every Spire on Christmas Eve; Joy to the World; I Heard the Bells on Christmas Day; O Come, All Ye Faithful; How Firm a Foundation; Luther's Cradle Hymn, or Away in a Manger; O Little Town of Bethlehem; While Shepherds Watched Their Flocks; We Three Kings of Orient Are.

The following divisions of the texts in the Modern Series are representative of the topics under which the hymns of the second type of books are grouped: Songs of Seasons, Songs of Nature, Occasional Songs (Christmas, Decoration Day, and such occasions), Lullabies, Ballads, Patriotic and Heroic, Devotional, Miscellaneous.

The names and official positions of the editors and compilers of these books assure that they conform to the best educational and music practices. They are: Hollis Dann, Professor of Music and Head of the Department of Music of Cornell University; Osborne McConathy, formerly Director of the Department of Music of Northwestern University; Edward Bailey Birge, Professor of Public School Music, Indiana University; W. Otho Messner, formerly Director of the Department of Music of the State Normal School, Milwaukee; Eleanor Smith, Teacher of Music in the Chicago Kindergarten College and in Frobel's Kindergarten, formerly in charge of the vocal music of the Cook County Normal School.

All the books of all the series, and not merely those mentioned in the above chart, include in their devotional songs a number of nature hymns for children, children's prayers to be sung, and several of the classical hymns. Thus it would seem that no jazz hymns and little jazz music of any kind are found in the song books used in the public

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

schools of the South. Also this study reveals that the Southern leaders of public education and the Southern leaders of religious education are as one in their efforts to train children in religious song and that they are seeking to educate children to appreciate and to use the best sacred music. The unity of these sets of leaders is greatly needed, as well as the union in this particular of the rank and file of the local church leadership with those in the vanguard of public education. The following extract from the pamphlet, *MUSIC IN SUNDAY SCHOOL*, shows this to be the case:

¹“For a good many years there has been a growing feeling among supervisors of music that most of the singing in Sunday Schools is detrimental to the work they are doing in public school music. Observation has shown that Sunday School music, for the most part, lacks beauty and interest; and that the loud manner of singing these songs is injurious to the good tone production so earnestly sought for by skilful, conscientious supervisors of public school music.

“It is easy to understand why Sunday School singing has this objectionable trait of loudness with its consequent tendency to strain the voices of the children. Superintendents and teachers in the Sunday School have long relied upon singing as one of the most important means of stimulating interest, and of impressing the moral teaching upon the child. The more energy he could be induced to put into his singing the more likelihood that he would react to the religious lesson of the song.

“Therefore, ‘Let us all sing heartily hymn number so and so,’ is the Sunday School superintendent’s customary exhortation the country over. Each little voice is thereupon let out to its utmost strength; each boy or girl tries to out-sing his or her neighbor. And the admonitions of the public school music teacher to ‘Sing softly, children,’ heard on five days of the week, are utterly forgotten or disregarded.

“A generation ago music in the public school was on the same plane as music in the Sunday School. Voice culture, tone production, care of the adolescent voice were not considered; they were unknown subjects in school music;

1. Published by American Book Company.

IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

singing was, well, just the singing of songs put before the children. Each child was supposed to read accurately, keep on the key and expel the breath that God had given him. There was consequently no science in the method or art in the result. If the teacher in the public school happened to be musically inclined and understood how to direct singing so as to get an artistic and pleasing effect, the children were correspondingly benefited. But such instances were all too infrequent.

"Within the past fifteen years instruction in public school music has greatly improved. Method is now the foundation of all the work; children are taught how to sing, not simply directed to sing a song. The quality of the songs to be sung—quality of both words and music—is given expert, musically attention. In every phase of music study the public school has progressed, but the Sunday School has stood still.

"Obviously it is not the business of the Sunday School to reach music. But it should take advantage of the instruction provided in secular schools and it should furnish song material of the same musical standard as that in the public schools.

"At a meeting of the National Music Supervisors' Conference in Detroit in 1911 this question of Sunday School music was discussed. It was the unanimous opinion that supervisors, as leaders of music for the people, had a real responsibility in this matter. It was agreed that they should take some definite action not only because the character of Sunday School singing affected their teaching but also because it affected the musical and religious interest of the community."

A notable public school experiment in training children in sacred music is that of the Durham Choir School. In 1924 Professor W. P. Twaddell, director of the public school vocal music of the city of Durham, North Carolina, undertook to develop to a high degree in the realm of sacred music the talents of his pupils and at the same time to develop in this respect the possibilities of the Sunday Schools of Durham. He had three objectives: One was the training of music teachers for the Sunday Schools, especially of the

SOUTHERN HYMNOLOGY

Beginners', Primary, and Junior Departments. In this connection teachers of music of the Elementary Department of the public schools were to give demonstrations for each of the above three departments of the Sunday School. The second was the demonstration of high type materials for Sunday School singing. THE HYMNAL FOR THE AMERICAN YOUTH was largely used. Meetings of officers and teachers of the Sunday Schools were held and the matter was presented to them, resulting in a number of leading churches adopting this hymnal. The third objective was a model choir for demonstration purposes. Every Sunday School was asked to select a representative for this choir. About fifteen did so. The other members of the choir came from the public school vocal music classes. Two regular rehearsals a week were held in the afternoon at the high school. The second year there were two groups, each of which met twice a week. The third year because of lack of time only one group was organized. The fourth year visible results were quite encouraging; about 400 children had been trained. The commencement of the choir school was an interesting feature. THE DURHAM MORNING HERALD said the following about the 1928 commencement:

"Sixty people, with but few exceptions, children, will participate in the third annual commencement program of the Durham Choir School. . . .

"For three years the choir school, directed by Professor W. P. Twaddell, and assisted by a number of interested people, has ended its school year with a commencement program. Formed for the purpose of training the young voices for active places in the church choirs of the city when they shall have attained suitable age, excellent training has been given several hundred children. Some of them have already begun to sing in church choirs and in due time other students are destined to take their place in this work."

The musical part of the commencement program for that year was:

The Prelude—Sonata in C Minor—*Mendelssohn*.

The Processional—Onward Christian Soldiers—*Brander*.

Hymn—Rejoice Ye Pure in Heart.

IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

The Choral Response—Lift Thine Eyes—*Mendelssohn*.

Hymn—Fairest Lord Jesus.

The Offertory—Gloria—*Mozart*.

Hymn—Dear Lord and Father of All Mankind.

Many demonstrations have been given in the churches and Sunday Schools of Durham and in many near-by towns. The choir has sung by invitation at Greensboro, which is sixty miles away. They have also sung for many local conventions and clubs. In addition, they have appeared before the State Conference of Federated Music Clubs at Sanford, North Carolina, and were invited by the State Federated Music Clubs and the Southeastern States Federated Music Clubs to appear before the National Biennial Conference of Federated Music Clubs at Boston in June 1928.

Professor Twaddell has worked out an eight-years' course and has a practical system of credits. His plan begins with the fourth grade and ends with the fourth year high school.

Surely, this choir school has exerted considerable influence upon the people of Durham and of North Carolina generally, and no one can predict what results may grow out of it.

The discussions in this and in the former chapter have presented forces that are working in the direction of the more dignified type of hymnology in the South. Were these all the forces of Southern hymnology, the result could be easily predicted. But they are not all the elements, as has been seen again and again in these pages, when the various facts and factors of the Gospel hymn movement in the South were considered. These have to be reckoned with, and they are working in the opposite direction. But, since great revivals and singing schools appear to be on the decline and since forces of religious education and public education seem to be strengthening (including their emphasis upon graded vocal music), it is likely that gradually and steadily the era of jazz music and jazz hymns will disappear.

(187)

THEOLOGY LIBRARY
CLAREMONT, CALIF.

A 24982